NEPAL EARLY GRADE READING MATERIALS ASSESSMENT

A Report

Submitted to

United States Agency for International Development (USAID) Nepal

Maharajgunj, Kathmandu, Nepal

Submitted by

Research Management Cell (RMC)

Kathmandu Shiksha Campus (KSC)

Ramshah Path, Kathmandu, Nepal

April 30, 2014

Study Team

Core Team

SN	Name of the Consultant	Position/Area of Expertise
1	Prof. Dr Prem Narayan Aryal	*Team Leader and Early Childhood Development Expert*
2	Prof. Dr Yogendra Prasad Yadava	*Team Member and Linguist*
3	Prof. Dr Ram Krishna Maharjan	*Team Member and Educationist*
4	Prof. Dr Hemang Raj Adhikari	*Team Member and Nepali Language Subject Expert*
5	Dr Sushan Acharya	*Team Member and Gender, Child and Social Inclusion Expert*
6	Mr Karnakhar Khatiwada	*Team Member and Linguist*
7	Mr Bhagwan Aryal	*Team Member and Educationist*
8	Mr Shatrughan Prasad Gupta	*Project Manager and Educationist*

Advisory

1. Prof. Dr Basu Dev Kafle

Subject Experts (Evaluators)

SN	Name of the Nepali Subject Experts	Language	Name of the Mother Tongue Subject Experts	Language
1	Prof. Dr Hemang Raj Adhikari	Nepali	Mr Surya Prasad Yadav	Maithili
2	Prof. Dr Madhav Bhattarai	Nepali	Mr Jeevan Kumar Maharjan	Nepal Bhasa
3	Prof Dr Kedar Sharma	Nepali	Mr Padam Rai	Bantawa
4	Prof. Maheshwor Neupane	Nepali	Mr Purna Bahadur Gharti Magar	Athara Magarat
5	Prof. Dr Sanat Kumar Wasti	Nepali	Mr Jai Prakash Lal Srivastav	Awadhi
6	Dr Madhav Prasad Poudel	Nepali	Mr Khenpo Gyurme Tsultrim	Mugali
7	Mr Ganesh Prasad Bhattarai	Nepali	Ms Bagdevi Rai	Chamling
8	Mr Hari Prasad Niraula	Nepali	Mr Krishna Raj Sarbahari	Tharu
9	Ms Rajni Dhimal	Nepali	Mr Rajesh Prasad Sah	Bajjika
10	Mr Dhurva Bhattarai	Nepali	Dr Lal-Shyākarelu Rapacha	Sunuwar
11	Mr Dilli Ram Rimal	Nepali	Ms Hiramoti Rana Magar	Magar Dhoot

12	Prof. Lakshmi Parajuli	Nepali	Ms Anita Gurung	Gurung
13	Prof. Dr Badri Bishal Bhattarai	Nepali	Mr Som Bahadur Dhimal	Dhimal
14	Mr Chudamani Pandey	Nepali	Mr Pamar P. Rajbanshi	Rajbanshi
15	Mr Shiva Prasad Timalsena	Nepali	Ms Sabitri Chaudhari	Tharu Madhyachhetra
16	Ms Bishnu Rimal	Nepali	Mr Indra Kumar Tamang	Tamang Devnagari
17	Mr Dinesh Ghimire	Nepali	Mr Buddha Yonjan Lama	Tamang Sambhota
18	Mr Buddha Raj Khaniya	Nepali	Mr Ramjee Kongren	Yakkha
19	Mr Siddhi Bahadur Maharjan	Nepali (MT-Nepal Bhasa)	Mr Amar Tumyahang	Limbu
20	Mr Shiva Kumar Yadav	Nepali (MT- Maithili)	Mr Gopal Ashk	Bhojpuri

Data Entry and SPSS

1. Mr Anup Adhikari

Executive Summary

Abbreviations/Acronyms

CDC:	Curriculum Development Centre
DoE:	Department of Education
EGR:	Early Grade Reading
EGRA:	Early Grade Reading Assessment
EGRMs:	Early Grade Reading Materials
EGRP:	Early Grade Reading Program
GoN:	Government of Nepal
INGO:	International non-governmental Organization
KSC:	Kathmandu Shiksha Campus
MoE:	Ministry of Education
MT:	Mother Tongue
NCED:	National Centre for Educational Development
NEGRMA:	Nepal Early Grade Reading Materials Assessment
NGO:	Non-governmental Organization
RBF:	Rato Bangala Foundation
RMC:	Research Management Cell
RTI:	Research Triangle Institute
SPSS:	Statistical Package for Social Science
SSRP:	School Sector Reform Program/Plan
ToR:	Terms of Reference
TU:	Tribhuvan University
USAID:	United States Agency for International Development
WE:	World Education

Table of Contents

7

List of Tables

1 Introduction

1.1 Background of the Study

Early Grade Reading Assessment (EGRA) assesses basic reading skills or literacy skills related to phonemic awareness, letter knowledge, word reading, non-word reading, oral reading fluency, and reading comprehension of the students. Early intervention to ensure the acquisition of basic literacy skills in the first two years of schooling is important to know how well and at what rate students acquire basic literacy skills.

Government of Nepal has been providing free and compulsory primary education in Nepal. As per the commitment of the government, Curriculum Development Centre (CDC) has been preparing and distributing the early grade reading materials. The private publishers are also developing the textbooks for primary level (1-3) in a large scale. In general, the community schools have been using the books published by CDC whereas the institutional schools have been using either their own books or the books of their choices from different private publishers. After the restoration of Democracy in Nepal in (2047 BS), there have been a growing demand to provide the primary education in their mother languages. As a result, CDC has developed and distributed mother tongue textbooks in 20 different languages. In Nepal, there are so many agencies /INGOS that are also developing the early grade reading materials. The private publishers, schools, I/NGOs have also developed different instructional materials (pictures cards, flash cards, supplementary materials) and much more in these fields. CDC has been producing textbooks in different mother tongues to ensure reading ability of early grade readers. CDC has further developed supplementary readers in order to enhance the reading ability of early grade learners.

Recently, national level assessment was conducted for grades three and five. These assessments provided clue to the types of information received by the students and instructions delivered by the teachers in their classrooms. The assessment measured what and how well students did in their respective subjects. The purpose of early grade reading materials is to enhance reading ability of the children. Reading is a complex mental/cognitive act. According to Snow, Burns and Griffin (1998), reading involves multiple cognitive, emotional, and social abilities, each of which impacts the beginning reader's success.

RTI International (2009) indicates that learning to read both early and at a sufficient rate is essential for learning to read well which becomes more difficult for the students when they grow older. Children who do not learn to read in the first few grades are more likely to repeat grades and eventually drop out. And the gap between early readers and non-readers increases over time.

School Sector Reform Program/Plan (SSRP, 2009-2015) has set the purpose of basic education as to ensure children's entry into school at the age of six and provide them with reading basics including teachers, textbooks and classrooms to continue their stay in schools by valuing their personal worth and meaningful participation. SSRP further intends to improve the quality of learning with the support of physical and instructional facilities, availability of competent and qualified teachers, relevant curricula, textbooks and assessment system and result based management system. The success of SSRP depends on the quality of early grade reading materials and their equitable supply to the children from both rural and urban area. A study by Curriculum Development Centre (CDC) revealed that some subjects like Creative and Expressive Arts did not have textbooks that resulted into

weak classroom instruction and exercise to help students develop creative and expressive power (CDC, 2002).

Growing concern about early grade reading in Nepal has raised issues likethe language of instruction for basic education, the current curriculum for basic education in Nepal, like in many countries, laying more on language instruction rather than reading as specific skill area, Nepal's extensive network of teacher training institutions, government's growing commitment to conduct an early grade reading assessment and to integrate early grade reading (EGR) into new National Assessment of Student Achievement (NASA) despite the near absence of systematic approach to measuring learning outcomes, the changing political and administrative decentralization after the dissolution of the Monarchy in Nepal and it is unlikely that the MoE can afford to take any of the existing early grade reading programs currently offered by a number of I/NGOs to scale.

Besides CDC and different publishers have been producing early grade reading materials. CDC provides approval for the materials published by the private publishers to be used in the schools, especially in institutional schools.

According to the Terms of Reference (ToR), USAID intends to support four analyses as requested by the MoE: 1) review of early grade reading materials; 2) Classroom observation; 3) Efficiency of Education Management System; and 4) Early Grade Reading Assessment. In such a context, there is a need to assess the quality of early grade readers through different parameters in order to identify their appropriateness. The RMC of KSC undertook the assessment to review Early Grade Reading Materials (EGRM) out of these four analytical works mentioned above.

1.2 Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to assess early grade (grades one through three) textbooks, supplementary readers and other teaching-learning materials in Nepal to help inform the Government of Nepal (GoN), education development partners and USAID/Nepal Mission in order to design and implement National Early Grade Reading Program (EGRP).

1.3 Objectives of the Study

The general objective of this study was to review early grade reading materials developed and used in Nepal by various agencies and organizations. However, the specific objectives of the assessment were as follows:

a) To identify the appropriateness of the contents of reading materials in early grades in terms of culture, inclusion, gender balance, human rights and child rights, and curricular linkage
b) To find out the level of appropriateness of these materials in terms of language, content and reading levels of the students
c) To assess the physical aspects of the reading materials in terms of production quality and cost.

1.4 Scope of the Study

The Scope of the study as stated in the ToR was as following:

a) Review of early grade reading materials in close consultation with the CDC. It included review of the following materials:
- All grade 1-3 Nepali subject textbooks developed by the CDC.
- All supplementary reading materials for grades 1-3 developed by the CDC.
- All available mother tongue subject books for grades 1-3 developed by the CDC.
- A total of 75 percent available supplementary readers appropriate for grades 1-3 published by the private publishers with approval from the CDC.
- A total of 75 percent available supplementary readers appropriate for grades 1-3 published by the donors and I/NGOs.
- All available teaching learning materials such as flash cards, picture cards etc. by the CDC, private publishers, donors and I/NGOs.

b) Review of the materials in terms of the following dimensions:
- Content Appropriateness
- Level Appropriateness
- Physical Aspects of the Materials

c) Preparation of evaluation frameworks in close collaboration with the CDC, and in consultations with GoN, donors, civil society and private sector.

1.5 Limitations of the Study

The study had the following limitations:

a) The study was delimited to the review of only Nepali and Mother Tongue subject books which were approved by the CDC.

b) The grammar books in Nepali subject were rejected for full review after initial tracing and survey because of their inappropriateness for early graders.

c) The early grade readers were supposed to be the students of grades one through three.

d) The supplementary books made available from CDC, private publishers (authorized by the CDC), Save the Children, WE/RBF and Room to Read only were surveyed and reviewed.

e) All the supplementary books (e.g. grammer books) surveyed were not reviewed to the fullest extent because of their inappropriateness for early graders.

2   Literature Review

Early grade reading habit of children lays the foundation of their later development. To highlight this Gove and Cvelich (2010) state that children who fail to learn to read in the first few grades of school are handicapped in later grades as they must absorb increasing amounts of instructional content in print form.

Early grade reading materials have different dimensions; the major dimensons are briefly discussed as following:

2.1   Content Appropriateness in EGRM

Cultural Appropriateness

Nepal is a multi-cultural, multi-ethnic and multi-lingual country; its school curriculum has therefore to address the wide socio-cultural diversity and develop textbooks or supplementary readers that are culturally responsive. A culturally responsive material capitalizes on students' cultural background and employs materials from the student's culture and history to illustrate principles and concepts.

Social Inclusion, Gender Balance, Human Rights and Child Rights in the Contents

UNESCO (2005) defines inclusion as "a process of addressing and responding to the diversity of needs of all learners through increasing participation in learning, cultures and communities, and reducing exclusion within and from education. It involves changes and modifications in content, approaches, structures and strategies, with a common vision which covers all children of the appropriate age range and a conviction that it is the responsibility of the regular system to educate all children" (as cited in Opertti, n.d., p. 3).

School and school processes are influential social and cultural institutions in constructing social and gender identities. For example, gender and social background based behavior and attitudes towards students, generally a common phenomenon in schools in most countries shape girls' and boys' identities and personality development as well as their viewpoints about each other. This can be observed in teacher student relationship and also student and student relationship. If such phenomena were continued they begin to be reflected in the form of violence.

Gender is defined as the socio-cultural and political implications attached to biological differences between men and women or boys and girls. A focus on gender not only conveys information about women and men's different experiences, it also sheds light on deep-rooted assumptions and stereotypes about men and women, the values and qualities associated with each, and the ways in which power relationships can change.

Commonly, female and socially disadvantaged students are negatively affected by exclusionary, and gender based behaviors and attitudes. Such behavior and attitudes are often a reflection of traditional social norms on one hand and traditional femininity and masculinity on the other that schools consciously and unconsciously promote, and as a result, reinforce stereotypical images, roles and responsibilities. For example, "anti-social

and violent behaviors, which include bullying, are linked to the construction of gender and power relations between boys and boys, boys and girls and girls and girls" (Gender Equity Curriculum Policy Directorate, 2001, p. 1).

Education systems therefore intervene at different levels in order to address such violent, exclusionary and gender based anti-social phenomena that are more likely to victimize girls and socially disadvantaged children. One of such intervention levels is curriculum because it has been believed that "equity is and must be a major curriculum consideration" (Ibid., p. 1). Moreover, curriculum as a process as well as content has the power to inculcate socially desirable behavior and attitude in students. However, UNESCO has found the curriculum as a major obstacle in the path to inclusive education as it is often "unable to meet the needs of a wide range of different learners" (http://www.unescobkk.org/education/inclusive-education/what-is-inclusive-education/barriers-to-inclusive-education/).

Respecting the above belief and understanding, Nepal has been moving ahead with different approaches, including curriculum and textbook reform, to ensure equitable access to quality education in schools. The curriculum has been considered one of the powerful instruments to assure inclusion in school education because "it represents a crucial tool for fostering a broadened concept of inclusive education and to implement educational policy from a long-term perspective" (Opertti, n.d., p. 5).

Inclusive education is relatively a new phenomenon in Nepal and not all children have been able to attain equitable access to quality education; it is therefore, time and again, curricular materials particularly textbooks are subjected to scrutiny for making them more gender responsive and inclusive.

School personnel are also found inadequately trained, little knowledgeable and less skillful to adapt the curricula and classroom practices to students' individual needs.

It is in the context that early grade reading materials were assessed from different dimensions for the purpose of designing the early grade reading program. The dimensions included social inclusion including linguistic diversity and disability, gender, and human and child rights. The current review also assessed the early grade reading and instructional materials from these dimensions.

Curricular Linkage of the Contents

The curriculum may be defined as the educational foundations and contents, their sequencing in relation to the amount of time available for the learning and learning experiences from the point of view of methods to be used addressing the need of the learners (Bhalla, 2007).

As the textbooks as the reading materials are expected to be linked with the curriculum, they should be prepared in order to fulfill the objectives of the curriculum. The contents of the textbooks and supplementary materials should be organized developmentally to show relationships between succeeding lessons in the order of moving from simple to complex or known to unknown. The curriculum is generally organized into two dimensions - horizontal and vertical. Horizontal organization relates to scope and breadth of the materials to be delivered to certain learners of specific age and grade. Similarly, vertical organization relates to sequence and continuity of learning materials.

Different curriculum experts have mentioned principles of sequencing the learning materials to make learning more meaningful, understandable, and comprehensive. Some of such

principles as mentioned by Bhalla (2007) are 'simple to complex', determining prerequisites, whole to part learning and chronological learning. Regarding sequence of learning materials, Ornstein and Hunkins (2004) observed, "curricularists must decide how content and experiences will occur and reoccur so that students have opportunities to connect and enrich their understanding of the curriculum presented or experienced (p. 142)".

Ornstein and Hunkins (2004) further state, "by scope, we mean not only the depth and range of content to be provided to students but also all the varieties and types of educational experiences that are created to engage them in their learning" (p. 241). Scope of the curriculum also refers to cognitive, affective and spiritual domains of learning. Curricular scope should be reflected in the textbooks and supplementary books designed for the particular age level of students. Similarly, the contents of the reading materials should establish linkage between grades based on students' age and learning levels. Some materials are repeatedly taught in higher grades in order to consolidate their learning.

The other dimensions of curriculum and curricular materials are continuity, integration, articulation and balance (Ornstein & Hunkins, 2004, p. 243-245). Continuity deals with the reappearance of the materials in the curriculum about which educators and writers of the materials feel students should have increased depth and breadth of knowledge over the length of the curriculum. Similarly, integration refers to the linking of all types of knowledge and experiences contained within the curriculum plan and reading materials. It establishes horizontal relationships among various content topics and themes that promote students' learning. Articulation, the other dimension of curriculum, refers to the interrelatedness of various aspects of the curriculum. It may be either vertical or horizontal in nature.

The key reason for addressing vertical articulation is to assure students' learning based on the prerequisites of learning. Horizontal articulation establishes relationship among subjects of the same grade and different contents of the same grade so that interrelationships can be established among the subjects and contents of the same level. In this context, consideration should be given to balance the weight to be given to each aspect of curriculum design so that students have opportunities to master knowledge and internalize and utilize it in their personal as well as social life.

Learning opportunities, learning activities, learning experiences and teaching learning strategies should be mentioned in any of the curricular forms. Textbooks should have the provisions to facilitate students learning. Learning opportunities and learning activities emphasize what is offered to learners, while learning experiences suggest what results from those activities.

Different types of exercises in the textbooks may help develop different abilities in the learner. Textbooks should have the provision for varieties of exercises for the children. These exercises should be organized in simple to difficult order to motivate the children to do exercises. Also, these exercises should help the teacher to diagnose children's difficulties so as to provide remedial teaching.

The study of children's nature is essential in order to prepare and plan learning strategies for them. A teacher who understands the subject matter for early graders should be capable of understanding their intuitive and imaginative powers. Jones in a paper on 'Man: A course of study-A critique' mentioned special provision of materials to fulfill the curricular objectives: "With children in elementary school, there is often a need to devise emotionally vivid, special games, story-making episodes, or construction projects to re-establish in the

child's mind his right not only to have his own private ideas but to express them in the public setting of a classroom" (1975, p. 456).

A curriculum as well as the reading material for the children should take child-centered pedagogy into consideration. Child psychologists like Rousseau, Froebel and Montessori gave emphasis on children and their learning environment against the idea that we should plan our educational practices by consideration of knowledge or of society (Kelly, 2009). We should plan learning strategies for children based on objectives of those practices and produce reading materials accordingly.

2.2   Level Appropriateness

Another important dimension of early grade reading materials is related with appropriateness of their level to the ability of the learner. This appropriateness is assessed through different indicative measures.

Phonemic Awareness in Reading Material

Gove and Cvelich (2010) define phonemic awareness as focusing on, manipulating, breaking apart, and putting together sounds orally. It is the ability to identify sounds in words, to separate words into sounds, and to manipulate those sounds. The act of reading is thinking stimulated by printed symbols. How those symbols are recognized and how children are taught to recognize those symbols is the domain of reading sub skills.

According to Farr and Carey (1986), definitions of word recognition run along a continuum. At one end, word recognition is simply defined as the ability to provide a spoken representation for a printed word. Beck and McKeown (as cited in Farr & Carey, 1986) define decoding as "...the translation of print to speech, either overt or covert". Interestingly, this definition tends to resolve the phonics versus sight word debate within its explicit limitations. Beck and McKeown write that this translation "...encompasses both 'sounding out' using phonic principles and instant recognition of word names". At the other end of the continuum is the belief that vocal pronunciation of a word is not necessary in word recognition, which entails only the recognition of the meaning of printed symbols (McConkie, et al., 1979) (as cited in Farr & Carey, 1986).

Regarding phonemic awareness in reading, other researchers, have argued that word recognition must include both the pronunciation of a printed word and the recognition of a meaning for that word. Caldwell, Nix, and Peckham (1981) (as cited in Farr & Carey, 1986) state that the reading process itself is not primarily a behavior which focuses on words or letters "...but a higher order unit determined by examining phoneme/grapheme correspondences". The higher order unit they discuss is meaning; thus they view word recognition as being inexorably woven into the fabric of a total reading act. They, as do many others, view the ability to recognize words whether to pronounce those words or to recognize meanings for them as inseparable from the total thinking process we call reading (Farr & Carey, 1986).

Fluency in Reading Material

According to Gove and Cvelich (2010), fluency is the overall reading competence reflecting the ability to read accurately and quickly with proper expression. If the learners are reading just one word at a time, it probably means that they also have problems in understanding the text (Department of Education, 2007).

Vocabulary

Vocabulary development is a semantic system in which there are both individual word meanings and relations that hold among these meanings. Gove and Cvelich (2010) also define it as knowing words (both oral and written) and their meaning. Kuczaj (as cited in Farr & Carey, 1986) suggests that vocabulary development is based on the interactive development of conceptual meaning, reflected meaning, and connotative meaning.

Farr and Carey (1986) describe the learning of word meanings as the first step in developing reading comprehension. Brown (1982) (as cited in Farr & Carey, 1986) divides comprehension into four categories, the first of which is the development of vocabulary meanings. Dechant (1981) (as cited in Farr & Carey, 1986) believes that one of the causes of reading disability is a pupil's difficulty in associating meaning with particular printed words, contending that the development of reading vocabulary is the initial step in developing reading comprehension.

The effect of vocabulary on reading comprehension has been examined in several studies (Freebody & Ander- son, 1983; Mason, Kniseley, & Kendall, 1979; Yap, 1979) (as cited in Farr & Carey, 1986). Freebody and Anderson (1983) (as cited in Farr & Carey, 1986) studied the effects or increasing the difficulty of vocabulary on the reading comprehension of sixth grade students. They manipulated the difficulty of reading vocabulary by substituting an unfamiliar synonym for specific words in a passage. Comprehension was measured through free recall, summarization, and sentence verification. The researchers concluded that increasing the difficulty of the vocabulary did in fact decrease reading comprehension scares.

Comprehension in Reading Material

The purpose of reading is comprehension. Understanding the concepts read or heard is comprehension (Gove & Cvelich, 2010). Reading comprehension is a constructive process and that meaning is as dependent on the reader as it is on the text. Comprehension should bedeveloped from the very start among learners.

3 Methodology

The study adopted the following methodology to reach the stated objectives:

3.1 Study Approach

The study approach adopted was participatory in nature. As the purpose of the study was to review and analyze the early grade reading materials developed and used in grades one through three, the task was done in cooperation and collaboration with the CDC including the development of the review frameworks. Moreover, identification, location and reviews of these early grade reading materials were carried in consultation with the relevant government agencies, development partners, national and international non-governmental organizations, private publishers and related subject experts.

The Research Management Cell (RMC), Kathmandu Shiksha Campus (KSC) team members have a wealth of experience in working on such type of collaborative programs. Experiences gained from earlier projects on curriculum designing, training manual and self-learning materials preparation were instrumental to direct the assessment to be more objective, participatory and effective. Therefore, the approach was adopted by the team contributed significantly to make the assessment more relevant and quality oriented.

3.2 Study Design

The study adopted mixed methods research design. It was a descriptive study with interpretivist approach. The study was of quantitative type from the perspective of the 'type of information sought'; and it also applied qualitative techniques to dig in information from the Nepali and Mother tongue subject books, supplementary readers and teaching learning materials.

3.3 Data Source

The data were obtained from primary sources. It was the direct and first hand review of the textbooks and other materials by the subject experts along with the other research team members.

3.4 Sampling of the Materials

Sampling of the textbooks, supplementary readers and the teaching learning materials was done in compliance with the scope of the study. All the Nepali and Mother tongue subject books were reviewed. About 75 percent of CDC approved Nepali subject books of private publishers were reviewed. All the supplementary readers and teaching learning materials made available to the study team by Room to Read, Save the Children, World Education (WE) and Rato Bangala Foundation (RBF) were reviewed.

3.5 Data Collection Tools

The major tools prepared and used for data collection were as follows:

a) **Nepali and Mother Tongue Subject Books Review Framework:** This tool was a comprehensive tool used for the assessment of Nepali and 20 Mother Tongue Textbooks published by the CDC and the Nepali language supplementary books of the private publishers with approval from the CDC. The tool included two parts: Part A-Metadata and Part B-Dimensions of Early Grade Reading Materials Assessment. Part B included a total of 81 statements under various titles and subtitles. A 5 point rating scale was used for each of these 81 statements. However, some open items were there for qualitative judgment from the evaluators.

b) **Supplementary Readers Review Framework:** This framework was made to evaluate the supplementary reading materials for Nepali and mother tongue languages developed by the CDC and private publishers. It also had two parts: Part A-Metadata and Part B-Dimensions. Part B included a total of 36 statements under various titles and subtitles. A 5 point rating scale was used with some open ended options for the evaluators.

c) **Teaching Learning Materials and Library Reading Materials Review Guidelines:** The guidelines were to be filled by the team members for the qualitative evaluation of the teaching learning materials and library books of various organizations such as Room to Read, Save the Children, WE/RBF and CDC. This tool too had left space for thier insights and impressions on the 3 dimensions of the review.

All the tools were prepared in English first. Later, they were translated into Nepali and back translated to English to maintain the consistencey of the intent.

3.6   Finalization of the Tools

The tools were prepared, pretested, revised and finalized in consultation with and feedback from the CDC and USAID. The tools were pre-tested with 3 language experts viz. Nepali, Nepal Bhasa and Maithili. They were asked to fill in the forms and frameworks. Their evaluatory of their notes were used to modify the tools. Moreover, recommendations received from Room to Read, Save the children, WE, RBF, CDC and Ministry of Education were also incorporated into the tools.

3.7   Data Collection Procedure

Series of consultation meetings, visits, presentations and discussions were made with the CDC, USAID, MoE, Room to Read, RBF, Save the Children and WE. In addition, the SSRP DPs, NCED, DoE, TU and private organizations were consulted during the framework preparation, drawing insights into the EGRM assessment and proceedings of the study.

Tracing of EGR materials was done through visits to CDC and all concerned organizations and private publishers. Some schools' libraries were to be visited due to the unavailability of the needed textbooks in the market. These materials were first looked at by the consultants to make a preliminary review of the EGR materials in order to fully understand the situation.

For the collection of primary data, the subject experts (evaluators) for various languages were selected. A total of 20 subject experts for Nepali subject and 20 mother tongue subject experts in 20 languages were selected for the review and assessment purpose. Attention was paid in selecting only those experts who were neither the textbook writers nor were they

involved in any form in the preparation of the targeted textbooks. After the selection, the subject experts were provided orientation by the study team on suing the evaluation framework and methods of reviewing the textbook.

The subject experts and team members together reviewed the textbooks, supplementary books and teaching-learning materials. They filled the framework forms after careful reading and observation of the materials. This process took a range of 5 to 25 days for the individual evaluators.

3.8   Data Analysis Techniques

The quantitative and qualitative datasets were mixed while analyzing them. Due to the overlapping nature of the data, one type of data provided a supportive role for the other dataset; together, they formed a more complete picture of the problem for interpretation than they did when standing alone. Consequently, quantitative analysis was followed by the qualitative ones. Some basic statistical tools were adopted to treat the data to support the analysis. The collected data were organized into 3 sections and analysed to arrive at key findings.

The data were interpreted in an analytic and descriptive way along the conceptual themes given in the scope of work. These themes were expected to be the key drivers for the development of the analysis framework. The SPSS package of 20th version was used for the entry and analysis of data.

4 Findings and Discussion Related to the Nepali and Mother Tongue Textbooks

This section is the analysis of the review of Nepali and Mother Tongue subject books prepared and used by CDC and private publishers. A total of 21 language subject textbooks and supplementary books were reviewed. Table 1 shows the distribution of language subject books surveyed.

Table 1: Language wise distribution of textbooks by language

Language	Number of books reviewed
Nepali	63
Athara Magarat	3
Awadhi	3
Bajjika	1
Bantawa	3
Bhojpuri	3
Chamling	3
Dhimal	3
Gurung	3
Limbu	3
Magar Dhoot	3
Maithili	3
Mugali	3
Nepal Bhasa	3
Rajbanshi	3
Sunuwar	3
Tamang Devnagari	3
Tamang Sambhota	3
Tharu	3
Tharu Madhyachhetra	1
Yakkha	3
Total	119

Table 1 vividly depicts that a total of 119 early grades (1-3) reading textbook materials were reviewed.

Out of them, 60 books were written in Nepali subject as a compulsory course published by different private publishers of Nepal. Whereas 3 Nepali subject books (grade 1-3) published by CDC were also reviewed in this study.

The mother tongue textbooks which include Nepali, Mugali, Tharu, Tharu Madhyachetra, Nepal, Tamang devenagari, Tamang Sambhota, Athar Magarat, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bantawa, Bajjika, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Dhimal, Gurung, Sunuwar, Maithili, Rajbanshi, and Yakkha were also reviewed in this study.

Except two mother tongue textbooks (Tharu Madhyachetra and Bajjika), each remaining mother tongue textbook had a set of three books for the study purpose.

However, only one book of Tharu Madhyachetra and Bajjika language was included in the review study as it was available and prepared by CDC.

Table 2: Average words in a unit of textbooks by language

language	Average words		
	Maximum	Minimum	Total N
Nepali	199.27	2.29	63
Athar Magarat	107.76	58.26	3
Awadhi	240.71	8.84	3
Bajjika	13.84	13.84	1
Bantawa	107.12	2.52	3
Bhojpuri	87.17	6.03	3
Chamling	81.95	5.68	3
Dhimal	100.25	5.79	3
Gurung	4.06	.22	3
Limbu	83.71	8.24	3
Magar Dhoot	76.69	3.88	3
Maithili	107.35	18.96	3
Mugali	102.09	24.52	3
Nepal	64.62	5.94	3
Rajbanshi	110.94	11.19	3
Sunuwar	156.94	7.00	3
Tamang Devnagari	102.31	13.52	3
Tamang Sambhota	52.19	8.86	3
Tharu	104.00	7.38	3
Tharu madhyachhetra	16.08	16.08	1
Yakkha	98.44	5.96	3
		Total:	119

Table 2 shows that a total of 119 textbooks (grades 1-3) were reviewed for calculating an average word in a unit with a view to measuring the utility and practicability of the existing textbooks prepared by CDC publishing house and the private publishers of Nepal. CDC had developed and published all mother tongue text books (56) and (3) Nepali subject text books grades (1-3) whereas the others (60) books three from each 20 publication houses had been selected for review.

The maximum average number of words in each unit of all these 63 Nepali textbooks was (199.27) whereas the minimum number of words found in these books was only (2.29) per unit.

In a unit the average number of words in Awadhi textbooks was 240.71 while the minimum number of words was found to have only (8.84). Likewise, Gurung mother tongue text book had a maximum (4.06) and the minimum (0.22) words in a unit which was the least maximum and minimum in all reviewed textbooks.

Likewise, the average maximum number of words in a unit of Sunuwar had 156.94, Rajbanshi (110.94), Tharu (104), Tamang Devnagari (102.31), Dhimal (100.25), Mugali (102.09), Athara Magarat (107.76), Bantawa (107.12) and Maithali (107.35) whereas the minimum number of words in a unit of these mother tongue textbooks varied greatly. The average minimum number of words in a unit of Sunuwar had 7, Rajbanshi (11.19), Tharu (7.38), Tamang Devnagari (13.52), Dhimal (5.79), Mugali (24.52), Athara Magarat (58.26), Bantawa (2.52) and Maithali (18.96).

The maximum number of average words in Yakha, Bhojpuri, Nepal (Newari), Limbu,Tamang Sambhota, Tharu Madhayachetra, Bajjika, Gurung, Chamling, Magar Dhoot were less than 100 in a unit and the minimum number of words in a unit in these books ranged from (0.22 to 16.08).

The study also found the language editing errors in the textbooks.

Table 3: Average number of language editing errors in a unit of textbooks by language

language	Editing error		
	Maximum	Minimum	Total
Nepali	15.69	.00	63
Mugali	.30	.15	3
Tharu	.76	.00	3
Tharu madhyachhetra	.71	.71	1
Nepal Bhasa	.00	.00	3
Tamang Devnagari	1.88	.38	3
Tamang Sambhota	2.35	.52	3
Athar Magar	3.70	.19	3
Magar Dhoot	27.65	8.04	3
Limbu	.35	.08	3
Awadhi	4.21	1.40	3
Bantawa	9.94	1.03	3
Bajjika	.28	.28	1
Bhojpuri	.00	.00	3
Chamling	.20	.00	3
Dhimal	5.05	.12	3
Gurung	1.29	.47	3
Sunuwar	20.40	6.69	3
Maithili	.29	.05	3
Rajbanshi	1.41	.35	3
Yakkha	7.56	.46	3

The table 3 presents the maximum number of editing mistakes in an average in all 63 Nepali textbooks published by CDC and the private publishers of Nepal was 15.69.

The maximum editing mistakes found in Magar Dhoot was 27.65 while the Maithali mother tongue textbook consisted a minimum number of editing mistakes (0.05). Similarly, the maximum number of editing mistakes in Sunuwar textbook had (20.04), Bantawa (9.94) and Yakhha (7.56) in a unit while these books had a minimum number of editing mistakes ranging from (0.46 to 6.69). Other mother tongue textbooks like Tharu, Tharu madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Devnagari, Tamang Sambhota, Limbu, Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Gurung and Maithili had less than 5 editing mistakes in an average. However, Nepal bhasa, and Bhojpuri were found to have no editing mistakes at all in an average.

Table 4: Average number of pictures in a unit of textbooks by language

language	Picture		
	Maximum	Minimum	Total
Nepali	14.94	1.17	63
Athar Magar	4.25	1.24	3
Awadhi	12.00	1.44	3
Bajjika	13.92	13.92	1
Bantawa	6.42	2.59	3
Bhojpuri	7.85	.96	3
Chamling	4.92	1.57	3
Dhimal	6.88	2.50	3
Gurung	6.44	1.18	3
Limbu	9.56	3.12	3
Magar Dhoot	5.33	1.15	3
Maithili	12.82	5.29	3
Mugali	8.48	1.11	3
Nepal Bhasa	6.62	2.46	3
Rajbanshi	7.07	2.69	3
Sunuwar	5.71	4.38	3
Tamang Devnagari	4.90	1.75	3
Tamang Sambhota	4.05	1.38	3
Tharu	9.24	2.11	3
Tharu Madhyachhetra	3.50	3.50	1
Yakkha	5.35	1.35	3

The table clearly presents that Nepali textbooks developed by CDC and the private publishers of Nepal were found to have in an average a maximum of (14.94) pictures in a unit where as the books contained a minimum number of (1.17) picture in a unit. These set of books seemed to have a higher number of pictures in comparison to the mother tongue text books.

Similarly, Maithali mother tongue textbook had (12.82), Awadhi (12), Limbu (9.56), Tharu (9.24), Mugali (8.48), Bhojpuri (7.85), Rajbanshi (7.07), Dhimal (6.88), Gurung (6.44), Bantawa (6.42), Sunuwar (5.71), Yakkha (5.35), Tamang devnagari (4.90), Athara Magarat (4.25) and Tamang Sambhota (4.05), whereas, the minimum number of pictures used in these books ranged from 0.96 to 5.29.

However, average maximum and minimum number of pictures used in Bajjika and Tharu Madhyachetra textbooks was the same. Bajjika mother tongue textbook had (13.92), and Tharu madhyachhetra (3.50) pictures in a unit.

Table 5: Maximum and minimum number of words in a sentence by language

language	Maximum and Minimum Words in average in a sentence		
	Maximum	Minimum	Total N
Nepali	17.85	.00	63
Athar Magar	16.33	6.75	3
Awadhi	19.57	.24	3
Bajjika	6.20	6.20	1
Bantawa	9.88	1.87	3
Bhojpuri	18.29	4.00	3
Chamling	7.68	2.84	3
Dhimal	11.00	4.41	3
Gurung	12.18	2.13	3
Limbu	8.06	1.64	3
Magar Dhoot	11.77	2.83	3
Maithili	12.80	1.43	3
Mugali	18.44	10.09	3
Nepal Bhasa	11.33	2.68	3
Rajbanshi	18.81	9.15	3
Sunuwar	12.50	3.00	3
Tamang Devnagari	10.63	1.33	3
Tamang Sambhota	7.50	2.33	3
Tharu	8.39	2.95	3
Tharu madhyachhetra	1.75	1.75	1
Yakkha	7.35	5.69	3

The table 5 depicts that the Nepali textbooks (63) published by CDC and the private publishers consisted of an average number of maximum words (18) in a sentence.

The table reveals differently in case of mother tongue textbooks. The textbooks of Awadhi had a maximum number of words (20) in a sentence, which was a higher average number of words used in all textbooks reviewed.

Similarly, Mugali and Bhojpuri had an equal number of maximum words (18) while Athara Magarat and Magar Dhoot had (16) and (12) number of maximum words used in a sentence. The sentence construction in Nepal Bhasa and Tamang Devnagari textbooks were found to have an equal number of maximum words (11). Likewise, Bantawa maximally used (10) words in a sentence while Tharu and Limbu each used the same number of words (8). However, Tamang Sambhota used only (7) words in a sentence.

Similarly, the table reveals the different picture in the construction of a sentence using the minimum number of words. The Mugali had used (10) words in a sentence, which was the highest minimum words in the textbooks surveyed while Rajbanshi was found to have (9.15) minimum words. Likewise, the Bajjika textbook was found to have an equal number of maximum as well as the minimum words (6.20) used in a sentence. Similarly, the Athara Magarat and Yakkha textbooks had 6.75 and 5. 69 number of words while other mother tongue textbooks like Tharu,Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Devnagari,Tamang Sambhota, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bantawa, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Dhimal, Gurung, Sunuwar and Maithili had less than 5 number of words in an average.

4.1   Content Appropriateness in Textbooks

4.1.1   Cultural Appropriateness

Table 6 contains seven indicators for reviewing text materials of grade 1, 2 and 3 for cultural appropriateness. The text materials have been reviewed on the basis of five scales. On the basis of given indicator and scales results are as follows:

Table 6: Percentage distribution of indicators of cultural appropriateness in textbooks

Cultural appropriateness indicators	not included this area at all (0)	Only lightly touched (1)	Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (2)	appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps (3)	thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order (4)
1. Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises	9.2%	14.3%	31.1%	30.3%	15.1%
2. Text and examples are found culturally acceptable	0.0%	5.0%	26.9%	32.8%	35.3%
3. Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable	0.8%	7.6%	26.1%	32.8%	32.8%
4. Exercises are found culturally acceptable	0.8%	5.9%	29.4%	34.5%	29.4%
5. Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases	2.5%	9.2%	19.3%	41.2%	27.7%
6. Succeeds in avoiding cultural/religious stereotypes and biases	4.2%	14.3%	23.5%	37.8%	20.2%
7. Succeeds in avoiding caste/ethnic stereotypes and biases	3.4%	12.6%	27.7%	31.9%	24.4%

Regarding the indicator *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises*, 31.1% of the reviewers found materials included with cultural contents but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. Regarding indicator *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable*, 32.8% and 35.3% of the reviewers found materials falling on scale no. 3 and 4 respectively.

Regarding the indicator *Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable*, 32.8% of the reviewers found materials falling on scale no. 3 and 4.

Regarding the indicator *Exercises are found culturally acceptable*, 34.5% of the reviewers found materials falling on scale no. 3 while 29.4% reviewers falling on scale no.2 and 4.

Regarding the indicator *Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases*, 41.2% of the reviewers found materials falling on scale no. 3.

Moreover, regarding the indicator *Succeeds in avoiding cultural/religious stereotypes and biases*, 37.8% of the reviewers found materials falling on scale no. 3.

Regarding the indicator *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ethnic stereotypes and biases*, 31.9% of the reviewers found materials falling on scale no. 3.

In totality, regarding the percentage distribution of cultural appropriateness in the materials, almost all the materials are found to be better than average.

Furthermore, table 7 presents cultural appropriateness of books by language. Indicators are arranged on horizontal axis while languages are arranged on vertical axis. There are 7 indicator and 21 languages.

Table 7: Cultural appropriateness by language

Language	Indicators						
	Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises	Text and examples are found culturally acceptable	Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable	Exercises are found culturally acceptable	Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases	Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases	Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases
Nepali	2	3	3	3	3	2	2
Athara Magarat	4	4	3	4	4	3	3
Awadhi	2	4	4	4	4	3	4
Bantawa	2	3	2	2	1	1	2
Bajjika	3	4	4	4	4	3	2
Bhojpuri	2	4	4	4	3	4	4
Chamling	3	4	4	4	3	3	3
Dhimal	3	3	3	4	3	3	3
Gurung	1	2	2	2	2	2	2
Sunuwar	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Limbu	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Magar Dhoot	3	4	4	3	2	3	4
Maithili	2	2	2	2	1	1	1
Mugali	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Nepal Bhasa	4	4	4	4	4	4	3
Rajbanshi	0	2	2	2	2	0	1
Tamang Devnagari	2	4	4	4	4	3	3
Tamang Sambhota	3	4	2	2	3	3	3
Tharu	2	3	3	3	2	3	3
Tharu Madhyachhetra	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Yakkha	2	2	2	2	4	2	2

In case of Nepali, indicators *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable, Exercises are found culturally acceptable,* and *Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases* were found falling under scale 3 while *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises, Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* and *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* were found falling under scale 2. Regarding former four indicators, Nepali books seem appropriate in cultural contents across most of the texts but remained with a few gaps while for latter three were not found balanced in all of the texts, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.

In case of Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Limbu, Sunuwar and Nepal Bhasa (except for indicator '*Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases'*) all indicators were

found falling on scale 4. For these languages it seems that cultural contents are thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order. Moreover, indicators *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable, Exercises are found culturally acceptable, Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases and Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* in Tharu were found falling under scale 3 and only two indicators, viz.*Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises* and *Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases* were found falling under scale 2.

Regarding former five indicators, Tharu books were found appropriate in cultural contents across most of the texts but remained with a few gaps while for later two were not found balanced in all of the texts, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.

In case of Tamang devnagari, indicators *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable, Exercises are found culturally acceptable* and *Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases* were found falling under scale 4 while *Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* and *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* were found falling under scale 3 and *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises* were found falling under scale 2.

Regarding Tamang Sambhota, the indicators *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises, Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases, Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* and *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* were found falling on scale 3 while *Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable* and *Exercises are found culturally acceptable* were found falling on scale 2. Similarly the indicator *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable* was found falling on scale 4. With this analysis Tamang devnagari books were found better than Tamang Sambhota.

In Athara Magarat, the indicators *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises, Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Exercises are found culturally acceptable* and *Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases indicators* were found falling on scale 4, while the indicators *Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable, Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* and *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* were found falling on scale 3. For this language it was found that cultural contents were thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order for former four indicators. On the other hand, later three were found appropriate in cultural contents across most of the texts but remained with a few gaps. Thus, it can be concluded that Athar Magarat books were found to be in the best position.

In case of Magar Dhoot, indicators *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable and Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases fall on scale 4, while Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises, Exercises are found culturally acceptable* and *Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* were found falling on scale 3 and the *indicator Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases* was found falling under scale 2. In conclusion, it can be said that Magar Dhoot books were in better position.

In case of Awadhi, indicators like *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable, Exercises are found culturally acceptable, Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases* and *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* were found falling under scale 4, while the indicator *Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* was found falling under scale 3 and the

indicator *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises* was found falling under scale 2. According to the rating from the experts Awadhi books were found in the best position.

In case of Bantawa, the indicators like *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises, Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable, Exercises are found culturally acceptable,* and *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* were found falling on scale 2 and the indicator *Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases* and *Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* were found falling on scale 1. The indicator *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable* were found falling under scale 3. Based on scales, Bantawa books were found in weak position.

In Bajjika, the indicators as *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Exercises are found culturally acceptable* and *Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases* were found falling on scale 4, while the indicators such as *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises* and *Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* were found falling on scale 3. Remaining indicator *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* was found falling under scale 2. As far as cultural contents are concerned they were thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order as compared to former four indicators, on the other hand, the indicators *Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* and *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* were found appropriate in cultural contents across most of the texts but remained with a few gaps. Thus, it is concluded that Bajjika books were found in the best position.

In Bhojpuri, the indicators such as *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable and Exercises are found culturally acceptable, Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* and *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* were found falling on scale 4, while the indicator *Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases* was found falling on scale 3. In the same way the indicator *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises* was found falling under scale 2. In case of Bhojpuri books, cultural contents were thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order. However, there were few gaps in cultural appropriateness in the content. Thus, it can be concluded that Bajjika books were also found in the best position.

In Chamling, the indicators such as *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable and Exercises are found culturally acceptable indicators fall on scale 4, while Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises, Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases, Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* and *Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* were found falling on scale 3. As far as cultural contents are concerned, they were thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order. Thus, it is concluded that Chamling books are in the better position.

In Dhimal, all indicators except *Exercises are found culturally acceptable* were found falling on scale 3. Similarly, the indicator *Exercises are found culturally acceptable* was found falling under scale 4. According to the ratings of the experts and study team's views books on Dhimal were found in good position.

In case of Gurung, except the indicator *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises* were found falling on scale 2. Similarly, the indicator *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises* was found falling on scale 1. Based on ratings of the experts and study team's views, books on Gurung were found in weak position.

In case of Maithili, indicators such as *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises, Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable* and *Exercises are found culturally acceptable* were found falling on scale 2; while the indicators such as *Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases, Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* and *Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* were found falling on scale 1. The analyses of Maithili books also indicated that their status was weak in cultural appropriateness.

In case of Rajbanshi, the indicators like *Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable, Exercises are found culturally acceptable* and *Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases* were found falling on scale 2; while the indicator *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* was found falling on scale 1. Remaining two indicators viz. *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises* and *Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* were found falling on zero. Based on the analysis, it was found that the books on Rajbanshi were found weaker as compared with others in case of cultural appropriateness.

In case of Yakkha,the indicators *Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises, Text and examples are found culturally acceptable, Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable, Exercises are found culturally acceptable, Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases* and *Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases* were found falling on scale 2. In the same way, the indicator *Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases* was found falling on scale 4. In conclusion the books on Yakkha were also not found in good position in the lens of cultural appropriateness.

The overall impression given by the evaluators of each textbooks of mother language identified that the mother language textbooks need to be improved in several aspects as follows:

Athara Magarat	Class 1: Contents should be based on local culture so that students will understand.
Bantawa	Class 1: Any cultural illustration that Bantawa Rai children are familiar is not included.
	Class 2: Number of cultural lessons is more than necessary, e.g. out of 20 lessons 6 are culture related only.
Bajjika	Class 1: Still need to incorporate lessons that represent other ethnics and religions of Tarai such as Muslim, Shikh, Christian, etc.
Chamling	Class 1: Using words reflecting local culture and colored pictures will be more effective.
	Class 2 and 3: Pictures should reveal cultural identity
Dhimal	Class 1: The cultural heritages of the other ethnic groups, if included, would be better.
	Class 2: Lessons about cultural co-existence could be included.
	Class 3: Cultural aspect is reflected. Other aspects are expected.
Gurung	Class 1: Pictures of Temples, Gumbas, Stupas, Masjids and churches should be included.
Limbu	Class 1: Contents on number system should be presented with the objects available in Limbu society.
	Class 3: Multi-cultural reality of Nepal should be clearly reflected.
Magar Dhoot	Class 1: There is no uniformity in the use of words. Uniformity should be maintained at least in the early grades
	Class 2: Uniformity in the language should be maintained. Five different language experts should be appointed for editing the textbook.
	Class 3: Uniformity in the language should be maintained.The same word is written in five different ways in the textbook.
Mugali	Class 1, 2 and 3: Need to adjust text and illustrations as par context and time form cultural lens. 2. Explanation and illustration in simple language needed.
Rajbanshi	Class 1: Traditional dresses should be reflected in the pictures/figures.
	Class 2: Cultural/traditional contents would be appropriate if used with necessary adaptation. Subject matter should be in line to the interests of the children.

	Class 3: Traditional concepts sometimes enhance superstitious belief. So, should be presented scientifically.
Tamang Devnagari	Class 1: Cultural contents related to the different ethnic groups residing in Tamsaling like Sherpa, Thami, Nepal Bhasa, Majhi should be included.
	Class 2 and 3: Pictures should be clear, concrete and multi-colored. More lessons on different contents are necessary
Tamang Sambhota	Class 1 and 2: Culturally important objects should be introduced through pictures. Name of festivals like Lhosar, Ko-mhendo, darjyoo etc. should be presented in the textbook.
	Class 3: Cultural aspects of Tamang like Gonenghya, Namdung nghya, Tarche, Brelsang etc. should be included.
Tharu	Class 2: Inadequate lessons on cultural contents are present. Illustrations reflecting identity should be added.
	Class 3: This book is developed for west of dang district. But lessons 13 to 18 use Tharu language spoken in Saptari district. This has created linguistic problem to teachers thus they do not teach from lesson 13 onward.
Yakkha	Class 1 and 3: Children learn quicker and easily if Yakkha culture is incorporated in the textbook.
	Class 2: Better to incorporate cultural aspects that help eradicate superstition prevalent in the society

The exemplary insights from selected mother language textbooks identified that there is need to improve every textbook from each language in the terms of cultural appropriateness.

In addition, Table 8 presents mean score on indicators of cultural appropriateness by grades. Indicators are arranged on horizontal axis while grades are arranged on vertical axis. There are 7 indicators and three grades namely grade 1, 2 and 3.

Table 8: Cultural appropriateness by grades

Language	Grade	Indicators						
		Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises	Text and examples are found culturally acceptable	Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable	Exercises are found culturally acceptable	Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases	Succeeds in avoiding cultural/religious stereotypes and biases	Succeeds in avoiding caste/ethnic stereotypes and biases
Nepali	1	2	3	2	2	3	2	2
	2	2	3	3	3	3	2	2
	3	2	3	3	3	3	2	2
Mother Tongue	1	2	4	3	3	3	3	3
	2	2	3	3	3	3	3	3
	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3

In case of all three grades, except for the first indicator, all indicators fall on third scale. The first indicator falls on the second scale. Thus, regarding all of the three, appropriate cultural contents appeared across most of the texts but remained with a few gaps.

Table 9 presents difference between CDC and private publishers' cultural appropriateness of Nepali subject books. Indicators are arranged on horizontal axis while publishers are arranged on vertical axis.

Table 9 shows difference between CDC and private publishers in cultural appropriateness of Nepali subject books. Talking about intregation of cultural contents in the texts, figures and exercises CDC shares common desk with other three publishers Bhundi Puran, Satyal and Times being considerably able to do so. Other nine publishers Asia, Cambridge, JBD,

Megha, Pustak prakshan, Sangam, Sunrise, Unique Education and Vidyarthi seem imbalanced even if there is inclusion. Atharai, Allied, Airawati, Simrik and United have only slightly included Whereas Pragya has totally negated it.

Table 9: Cultural appropriateness of Nepali subject books by publisers

Publisher	Indicators						
	Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises	Text and examples are found culturally acceptable	Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable	Exercises are found culturally acceptable	Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases	Succeeds in avoiding cultural/religious stereotypes and biases	Succeeds in avoiding caste/ethnic stereotypes and biases
Atharai	1	2	3	3	3	3	3
Allied	1	2	1	2	1	1	1
Asia	2	3	3	3	2	2	2
Airawati	1	3	3	3	2	2	2
Bhundi Puran	3	3	2	2	3	3	3
Cambridge	2	3	3	2	3	1	1
CDC	3	3	3	2	3	2	3
Ekta	3	3	3	3	3	3	2
JBD	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Megha	2	2	2	2	3	1	2
Pragya	0	3	3	3	3	3	4
Pustak Prakashan	2	2	1	1	2	2	3
Sangam	2	3	3	3	3	3	3
Satyal	3	3	3	3	3	3	2
Simrik	1	2	2	2	3	2	2
Sunrise	2	2	3	2	2	2	2
Times	3	4	3	3	3	3	4
Unique	2	3	3	3	3	3	3
United	1	2	2	2	3	2	3
Vidyarthi	2	4	4	4	2	1	2

In case of cultural acceptance of texts and examples, Vidyarthi and Times fall on the top of CDC Since they are completely able to do so. CDC sharing common ground with Asia, Airawati, Bhundi Puran, Cambridge, Pragya, Sangam, Satyal and Unique is considerably able to show cultural acceptance in text and examples. On the other hand Atharai, Allied, JDB, Megha, Pragya, Simrik, Sunrise and United are found imbalanced for the same.

Regarding cultural acceptance of pictures and figures Viadyarthi occupies the top most position being completely able to do so. CDC is only considerably able to do so.Atharai, Asia, Airawati, Cambridge, Ekta, Pragya, Sangam, Satyal, Sunrise, Times and Unique also fall on the same scale as CDC. Bhundi puran, JBD, Megha, Simrik and United seem imbalanced Whereas, Allied and Pragya have only slightly touched it.

In trying to find whether exercises are culturally acceptable or not, Vidyarthi is very much successful in this. Leaving CDC behind other eight publications Atharai, Asia, Airawati, Ekta, Pragya, Sangam, Satyal, Times and Unique are considerably successful to show

cultural acceptance. Including CDC other publications namely Allied, Bhundi puran, Cambridge, JBD, Simrik, Sunrise and United seem imbalance in this regard wrere as Pragya has only slightly touched it.

Not a single publication is completely successful in avoiding linguistic biasesness. Including CDC, Atharai, Bhundi, Cambridge, Ekta, Megha, Pragya, Sangam, Satyal, Simrik, Times, Unique and United in spite of their attempt they are only considerably successful. Asia, Airawati, JBD, Pustak prakashan, Sunrise and Vidyarthi seem imbalanced in this regard. Allied has only slightly touched it.

In trying to find whether reading books published by different publications are successful in avoiding cultural/religious stereotypes and biases or not seven of the publications Atharai, bhundi puran, Ekta, Pragya, Sangam, Satyal, Times and Unique are found considerably successful in doing so. Including CDC, Asia, Airawati, JBD, Pragya, Simrik, Sunrise and united inspite of their attempt have failed to balance it. Allied, Megha, Cambridge and Vidyarthi have only slightly touched this field.

In trying to find whether reading books published by different publications are successful in avoiding caste/ethnic stereotypes and biases or not, Times and Pragya are found highly successful. To continue, Atharai, Bhundi, CDC, Pragya, Sangam, Unique, and United are found considerably successful. On the other hand, inspite of their attempt, Asia, Airawati, Ekta, JBD, Megha, Satyal, Simrik, Sunrise and Vidyarthi are unable to balance it. Allied and Cambridge have only slightly touched this field.

The above analysis suggests that the average scale count ranges from nine to 23. CDC falls on average scale count of 19 leaving 11 publications behind it, sharing same average scale with 4 and leaving 4 on top of it.

The overall insights of the evaluators in cultural appropriateness of the publisher wise Nepali subject textbooks were found as follows:

Atharai	Class 1: Cultural contents are not informed directly but used cultural aspects where relevant.
	Class 2: Texbook is not inclusive of more than one culture.
	Class 3: No content is related to culture. Should include relevant lessons, exercises and creative writings on cultural aspects.
Asia	Class 1: Diversity in religion, culture, traditions, festivals etc should be included.
	Class 2: Diversity in culture and ethnicity should be included.
	Class 3: Language disparity should be reduced to make easier for non-nepali speakers too.
Airawati	Class 1: Contents lacked in addressing cultural diversity.
	Class 2: Contents lacked in addressing cultural diversity.
Cambridge	Class 1, 2 and 3: Lessons on cultural diversities should be added.
Ekta	Class 1: Needs additional materials to address different cultures and religions.
JBD	Class 1: Lessons are not presented in terms of cultural appropriateness. Materials can be added to address stereotype while revising the book.
	Class 2: Domination of Hindu culture is seen, however this van be improved adding exercises, pictures and subject matter.
	Class 3: Lessons are appropriate to enhance cultural enhancement. However, subject matter and exercises can be improved.
Megha	Class 1: Cultural aspects need to be added more.
	Class 2: Some materials on religious tolerance and introduction to feasts and festivals should be added.
Pragya	Class 1 and 2: Local contexts are missing. Local contexts should be included.
Pustak Prakashan	Class 1: Cultural contents are lacking.
	Class 2 and 3: Needs to add some lessons on festivals and other cultural themes
Sangam	Class 1: Materials related to diverse culture should be accommodated in the textbook.
Satyal	Class 1 and 3: Needs additional materials to address cultural appropriateness.
Simrik	Class 1 and 2: Some lessons are found discriminating specific ethnicity.
Sunrise	Class 1 and 2: Festivals of different cultural groups should be included.
Times	Class 1: Local contexts are missing, so it should be included.
Unique	Class 1: There is given more emphasis to Hindu culture. Other religious cultures should be

		added for cultural appropriateness.
		Class 2: Culture from other religious groups should be given place in the textbook.
		Class 3: Other religious cultures should be added for cultural appropriateness.
	United	Class 1: Exerscises related to promoting cultural torelance are needed.
		Class 2 and 3: Cultural diversity should be included.
	Vidyarthi	Class 1: Diversre cultural refernces and contexts are not addressed.
		Class 2: Cultural diversity is not addressed in the lessons.
		Class 3: Some links are needed for developing habits of toleration among students. Cultural and religious diversity should be taken into consideration.

The narrations as enlisted above shows that majority of Nepali textbooks of every publication needs some improvement in the field of cultural appropriateness. Mostly the books need to address the cultural diversity in Nepalese context and incorporate local contexts. As in Simrik publication's books, we found some contents even discriminating specific ethnic group, it should be improved.

Moreover, we made evaluation of the CDC Nepali textbooks from 3 evaluators, one from the evaluator having Nepali as mother language and the next from the two evaluators of Maithili and Nepal Bhasa language.

Table 10: Cultural appropriateness of CDC Nepali Textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Indicators						
	Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises	Text and examples are found culturally acceptable	Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable	Exercises are found culturally acceptable	Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases	Succeeds in avoiding cultural/ religious stereotypes and biases	Succeeds in avoiding caste/ ethnic stereotypes and biases
Nepali Speaker	2	3	3	3	3	2	2
Non Nepali Speaker	3	3	3	2	3	2	3

According to Nepali speaker, 2nd - 5th indicator have scale 3; while the rest have scale 2. Speaking about non-Nepali speakers, except for 4th and 6th all have scale 3. The above two have scale 2. Both of the speakers shared common opinion on 2nd, 3rd and 5th indicator having scale 3 and 6th indicator having scale 2. Both of the speakers' opinions are divided on indicator 1st and 7th, where non-Nepali speakers found Nepali subject books are in better position than Nepali speakers. On the other hand, in case of the 4th indicator, Nepali speakers found these books well than non-Nepali speakers. Interestingly, non-Nepali speakers found Nepali subject books a little bit better than the Nepali speakers.

However, the Mathili speaker evaluator suggested the CDC Nepali books in case of cultural appropriateness as: "*....lessons can be made inclusive in pictures, language and exercises. Textbooks have not included the dresses of Terai, which must be improved*".

4.1.2 Social Inclusion

Socially inclusive curricula, textbooks and other teaching learning materials are some crucial factors that help ensure equity and social justice in education. With this viewpoint, 119 materials including textbooks, supplementary reading materials and instructional materials, currently in use in grades 1 to 3, were assessed from social inclusion perspectives.

Both the Nepali and mother tongue based materials implemented in the community as well as institutional schools were assessed from gender, language, human rights and child rights dimensions to assess the status of social inclusion in those materials. Mother tongue experts

of the selected languages and Nepali language experts assessed and rated different aspects of the textbooks and other materials from social inclusion perspective in five point rating scale. Before assigning the review task a tool orientation workshop was held for the experts. The following paragraphs present the result of the assessment of the textbooks in terms of above mentioned indicators of social inclusion.

Table 11: Percentage distribution of indicators of social inclusion in textbooks

Social inclusion indicators	not included this area at all (0)	Only lightly touched (1)	Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (2)	appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps (3)	thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order (4)
1. Lessons indicate localization of students' geographic and regional contexts	5.0%	16.0%	33.6%	28.6%	16.8%
2. Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of disadvantaged groups	21.8%	26.1%	32.8%	13.4%	5.9%
3. Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of people with disability	63.0%	15.1%	15.1%	5.0%	1.7%
4. Lessons and exercises develop skills, behaviors, attitudes and understandings that enable students to construct equal and respectful relationship across different social backgrounds	10.9%	26.1%	30.3%	19.3%	13.4%
5. Material is appropriate to the learners with complete exposure to the language	0.8%	10.1%	16.8%	39.5%	32.8%
6. Material is appropriate to the learners with limited exposure to the language	2.5%	16.8%	45.4%	22.7%	12.6%
7. Material is appropriate to the learners with no/very limited exposure to the language	13.4%	31.9%	30.3%	10.1%	14.3%

Table 11 is the cumulative rating of all the Nepali language and mother tongue textbooks of grade 1 to 3 reviewed by the experts for the purpose of this study. According to their ratings textbooks in general have attempted to be socially inclusive.

Most of them found texts, lessons, exercises and activities socially inclusive throughout the books but not in each and every lessons. In this sense, the lessons or texts are not balanced in terms of their coverage of contents on social inclusion. However, in terms of the inclusion of people with disability many (63%) of the experts found the textbooks not inclusive.Insignificant number (1.7%) of experts rated the textbooks highly in terms of their coverage of contents on people with disability.

Experts also pointed out the gaps in terms of the materials' appropriateness to the children with less exposure to the language used in the materials. For example, almost 32% of the experts found the textbooks appropriate to the learners with no to very limited exposure to the language used in them.

It was further identified the social inclusion by language as follows:

Table 12: Social inclusion by language

Language	Lessons indicate localization of students' geographic and regional contexts	Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of disadvantaged groups	Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of people with disability	Lessons and exercises develop skills, behaviors, attitudes and understanding that enable students to construct equal and respectful relationship across different social backgrounds	Material is appropriate to the learners with complete exposure to the language	Material is appropriate to the learners with limited exposure to the language	Material is appropriate to the learners with no/very limited exposure to the language
Nepali	2	1	1	2	3	2	1
Athara Magarat	4	3	1	3	4	3	1
Awadhi	3	4	1	4	1	2	4
Bajjika	3	2	0	2	4	3	3
Bantawa	2	2	1	2	1	2	2
Bhojpuri	4	2	0	3	4	4	4
Chamling	4	2	1	3	3	3	3
Dhimal	3	2	0	2	3	3	2
Gurung	2	0	0	1	3	2	2
Limbu	3	2	1	3	4	4	3
Magar Dhoot	4	1	0	3	3	2	2
Maithili	1	0	0	0	3	2	1
Mugali	3	0	0	2	4	4	4
Nepal Bhasa	4	2	2	4	4	2	2
Rajbanshi	3	0	0	0	2	2	1
Sunuwar	4	4	3	4	4	3	3
Tamang Devnagari	1	2	0	2	4	4	4
Tamang Sambhota	2	1	0	2	3	2	1
Tharu	3	1	0	2	2	2	3
Tharu madhyachhetra	3	4	0	4	4	4	4
Yakkha	2	1	0	1	1	1	1

In terms of language, cumulative ratings (Table 12) of the experts revealed that except Tamang Devnagari and Maithili textbooks of other languages have been successful in localizing student's geographic and regional contexts in the materials.Madhyachhetra Tharu language, Athara Magarat, Magar Dhoot, Bhojpuri, Chamling and Sunuwar language textbooks are best in this respect.

However, in terms of helping students build a respectful and harmonious relationship with students from other social backgrounds, experts rated Maithili, Rajbanshi, Yakkha and Gurung language textbooks as least satisfactory while Sunuwar, Awadhi and Madhyachhetra Tharu as the best. In terms of language level, Nepali, Tamang Sambhota, Athar Magar, Maithili, Rajbanshi and Yakkha textbooks are rated very low in their appropriateness to the learners with no to very limited exposure to the respected languages.

The followings are the mother language wise insights on social inclusion:

Language	Insights
Athara Magarat	*Class 1:* Standard dialect of the language should be used to prepare the textbooks
	Class 3: Standard dialect of the language should be used to prepare the textbooks
Awadhi	Class 1: Awadhi is spoken not only by Hindu, but also by Muslim, Shikh, etc. Therefore, inclusion of different religion related content or lessons is desirable.
	Class 2: Need to make lessons more inclusive.
Bajjika	Class 1: Illustrations representing ecological and regional differences are incorporated.People with disability need to be portrayed.
Bhojpuri	Class 1: Contents should include social unity.
Dhimal	Class 1 and 2: Mostly male characters are used; there should be balance in gender.
	Class 3: Female oriented activities would be appreciable if included
Gurung	Class 1: Should include matters reflecting Tarai, Hills and Mountains.
	Class 2: Some sentences are not appropriate (see page 17).
	Class 3: Portraying girls only in sweeping (brushing) gives message that girls only should take this role.
Sunuwar	Class 2: It is necessary to make the material simpler to some extent
Limbu	Class 1 and 2: No content is available on people with disabilities
Magar Dhoot	Class 1: Even the same word is written differently, it is problematic.
	Class 2: Characters from other groups in addition to Magar should also be used.
	Class 3: There is no clarity in language. People with disabilities and disadvantages are not included.
Rajbanshi	Class 1: For this the materials should be equipped with human characters.
	Class 2: New themes and characters required to be created; most of the lessons are not like this.
	Class 3: Materials about nationality are given instead of social inclusion.
Tamang Devnagari	Class 2: Content about Chepang, Majhi, Sherpa and other backward ethnic groups should be included. Lessons about people with disability should be included.
	Class 3: Contents about other ethnic groups and people of disability should be included
Tamang Sambhota	Class 1: The reason behind disability should be given. Also the special object related to a particular cultural group should be given.
	Class 2: Lessons and pictures about physically disabled and socially disadvantaged people should be included.
	Class 3: Contents about other ethnic groups and people with disability should be included.
Tharu	Class 2: Lessons that promote mutual respect should be added
	Class 3: Not inclusive of people with disability
Yakkha	Class 1: Subject matters which are more practical and based on everyday language of Yakkha community should be incorporated
	Class 2: Better to identify the differences in spoken and written language of Yakkha community
	Class 3: Better to teach to write as spoken than arguing over rules and methods

The mother language textbooks need to be changed in many aspects of social inclusion as they are not inclusive of people with disability.

Further more, contents on social inclusion was identified by language wise grades too. Table 13 shows the situation as follows:

Table 13: Social inclusion by language-wise grades

Language	Grade	Lessons indicate localization of students' geographic and regional contexts	Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of disadvantaged groups	Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of people with disability	Lessons and exercises develop skills, behaviors, attitudes and understandings that enable students to construct equal and respectful relationship across different social backgrounds	Material is appropriate to the learners with complete exposure to the language	Material is appropriate to the learners with limited exposure to the language	The material is appropriate to the learners with no/very limited exposure to the language
Nepali	1	2	1	1	2	3	2	1
	2	2	2	1	2	3	2	1
	3	2	2	1	2	3	2	1
Mother Tongue	1	3	2	0	2	3	3	3
	2	3	2	0	2	3	3	3
	3	3	2	1	2	3	3	2

The five point rating (Table 13) of social inclusion status of the textbooks by language and by grade shows that Mother tongue textbooks are better in terms of localizing students' geographic and regional contexts across all three grades. Likewise, all the textbooks irrespective of their medium of language and grade are appropriate to the learners with complete exposure to the respective languages but with few gaps. However, Nepali textbooks of all three grades are at the lower level in terms of their appropriateness to the learners with no to very limited exposure of Nepali language. In terms of helping students develop skills for harmonious and respectful relationship with each other, all textbooks are found to be at equal footing i.e. they attempted but did not balance in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. In the same way, all textbooks irrespective of language and grade are at the bottom in terms of inclusiveness of people with disability. It is either lightly touched or not mentioned at all.

Table 14: Social inclusion in Nepali textbooks by publishers

PUBLISHER	Lessons indicate localization of students' geographic and regional contexts	Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of disadvantaged groups	Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of people with disability	Lessons and exercises develop skills, behaviors, attitudes and understanding that enable students to construct equal and respectful relationship across different social backgrounds	Material is appropriate to the learners with complete exposure to the language	Material is appropriate to the learners with limited exposure to the language	Material is appropriate to the learners with no/very limited exposure to the language
Atharai	1	0	1	1	3	2	1
Allied	3	1	1	1	3	2	1
Asia	1	1	0	2	3	2	1
Airawati	1	1	1	2	2	1	1
Bhundi Puran	2	2	1	2	4	2	0
Cambridge	1	0	0	1	3	2	1
CDC	**2**	**2**	**1**	**2**	**4**	**3**	**2**
Ekta	3	2	2	3	3	2	2
JBD	2	2	1	1	1	0	0
Megha	2	1	1	3	2	2	2
Pragya	1	1	1	1	2	1	
Pustak Prakashan	2	2	1	2	2	2	2
Sangam	2	2	2	3	4	3	2
Satyal	3	2	2	3	3	2	2
Simrik	2	0	0	1	3	2	1
Sunrise	1	2	1	1	2	2	2
Times	3	2	0	1	3	1	1
Unique	2	2	0	1	4	1	0
United	3	2	0	2	3	2	1
Vidyarthi	2	2	0	2	3	2	1

When analyzed in terms of publishers (Table 14), Nepali textbooks of CDC, Ekta, Sangam and Satyal are better in terms of social inclusiveness than any other publishers. However, all the publishers except Ekta, Sangam and Satyal are at the lowest end in terms of inclusion of people with disability. Nepali textbooks of these two publishers have included this indicator but not balanced in all the texts, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. CDC published textbooks only lightly touch upon this indicator.

The overall insights and suggestions of the evaluators in terms of social inclusion of the publisher wise Nepali subject textbooks were found as follows:

Atharai	Class 1: Contents and aspects related to caste-ethnicity are included but still required to incorporate in lessons, illustrations, exercises and other activities.
	Class 2: Lessons are not inclusive of regional and ecological diversity. Illustrations include hills but descriptions do not include subject matter related to hills. It should include regional and ecological diversities, disadvantaged communities and groups, disability and matters that enable students to respect each other's diversity.
	Class 3: It is related to geographical subject matter but no inclusion of eco-geological diversity. Lessons promoting ethnic harmony and equity should be included.
Allied	Class 1: Lessons, exercises and figures should be gender friendly and balanced.
	Class 2: Unity in diversity should be maintained for social inclusion
Airawati	Class 1: Avoid the contents that discriminate people with disabilities.
	Class 2: Avoid the contents that discriminate people with disabilities.
	Class 3: Subject matter should be edited in terms of disability-friendly.
Cambridge	Class 1: Lessons on geographical context, regional context, disability, disadvantaged group should be added.
	Class 2: Lessons on geographical context, regional context, disability, disadvantaged group should be added.
	Class 3: Lessons on geographical context, regional context, disability, disadvantaged group should be added.
JBD	Class 1: Additional materials should be included to address people with disability and text should be simplified to address the students with Nepali as the second language.
	Class 2: Book is found to be poor in terms of social inclusion and language level.
	Class 3: Additional materials should be included to address disadvantaged and disabled groups. Similarly additional materials should be made simplified to address the students having Nepali as the second language.
Megha	Class 1: Add exercises on 'group work' in social aspects to promote social activities among students.
Sangam	Class 1: Attention should be paid to language simplicity so as to make it simpler for students from various social contexts, class and groups.
	Class 2: Attention should be paid to make language simpler for students from various social contexts, class and groups.
Satyal	Class 1: Additional materials should be included to address disadvantaged and disabled groups. Similarly, additional materials should be made simple to address the students having Nepali as the second language.
Simrik	Class 1: Lessons need to be added to address social diversity.
	Class 2: Need to include geographical diversity.
Sunrise	Class 3: People with disability should be included in the texts.
Unique	Class 2: Caste, job, region and culture wise respect promoting contents should be included.
	Class 3: Inlcusion of diabled people is necessary in the text and examples.
United	Class 1: Contents encouraging students to respect all social groups, religion and class should be included.
	Class 2: A suitable chapter for differently abled, disadvantaged group and non-nepali speaker students should be added.
Vidyarthi	Class 1: Geographical and regional variations should be addressed in the lessons.
	Class 3: Regional and geographical context should be produced in a balanced way. Context of disability should be taken into consideration. Second language readers should be taken in mind for inclusion.

The insights of the evaluators after thorough reading and understanding of the textbooks identified the need of improvement in many areas of social inclusion, especially in addressing geographical and regional variations.

Moreover, it was also identified the situation of social inclusion of Nepali subject books from the perspective of Nepali and non-Nepali speaker evaluators as follows:

Table 15: Social inclusion in CDC Nepali textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Lessons indicate localization of students' geographic and regional contexts	Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of disadvantaged groups	Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of people with disability	Lessons and exercises develop skills, behaviors, attitudes and understandings that enable students to construct equal and respectful relationship across different social backgrounds	Material is appropriate to the learners with complete exposure to the language	Material is appropriate to the learners with limited exposure to the language	The material is appropriate to the learners with no/very limited exposure to the language
Nepali Speaker	2	1	1	2	3	2	1
Non Nepali Speaker	2	1	0	2	4	3	1

Nepali textbooks of grades 1 to 3 were assessed by experts with Nepali as MT and without it (Table 15). Their assessments did not differ much from each other. For example both categories of experts found the textbooks least inclusive of disability and least suitable in terms of their appropriateness to the learners with no to very limited exposure to Nepali language.

It was also identified in a narrative by Maithili speaker evaluator who stated that "*any of the CDC Nepali books have not included any information about disability in subject matter, picture and exercises*".

Similarly, in terms of helping students develop skills for harmonious and respectful relationship with each other, both types of experts found that all textbooks attempted to but could not balance the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations from this perspective.

4.1.3   Gender Balance

Gender balance is a term which explains the degree to which men and women hold the full range of positions in a society or organization. In terms of early grade reading material, it indicates whether the textbook, supplementary reader or any reading material is promoting equal rights, responsibilities and opportunities for women and men; giving equal consideration to their interests, needs and priorities.

It does not imply non-differentiation between the sexes, but rather the elimination of adverse discrimination based on sex. Gender responsive textbooks are prepared being aware of gender-role socialisation and the biased messages they are unintentionally imparting to students every day. They are made inclusive, precise, positive, and representative and integrated, reflecting the experiences, needs and interests of both males and females. Table 16 shows that the study analysed the situation of gender balance in the textbooks and supplementary books in terms of 7 indicators.

Table 16: Percentage distribution of indicators of gender balance in the textbooks

Gender balance indicators	Not included this area at all (0)	Only lightly touched (1)	Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (2)	Appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps (3)	Thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order (4)
1. Contents and examples treat both male and female equitably	1.7%	7.6%	34.5%	40.3%	16.0%
2. Activities and exercises treat both male and female equitably	1.7%	4.2%	33.6%	41.2%	19.3%
3. Lessons maintain balance between male and female	0.8%	5.9%	31.9%	40.3%	21.0%
4. Contents are not gender blind	1.7%	7.6%	23.5%	37.8%	29.4%
5. Contents are not gender neutral	12.6%	6.7%	39.5%	23.5%	17.6%
6. Lessons and exercises are gender responsive	4.2%	8.4%	47.9%	24.4%	15.1%
7. Exercises are designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities	30.3%	15.1%	30.3%	14.3%	10.1%

The experts assessed the textbooks from gender lens. Table 16 shows that irrespective of language many experts found the textbooks average in terms of gender balance. For example, 40.3% found the contents and examples treating both female and male equitably in most of the text but with a few gaps. Similarly, 47.9% found the textbooks gender responsive but it was not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.

However 30.3 % did not find the 'exercises designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities' at all, while the same percentage found the 'exercises designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities but not balanced throughout the texts, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.

Moreover, mother tongue and Nepali textbooks were also analyzed using gender lens. The outcomes of this analysis (Table 17) showed that the Madhyachhetra Tharu, Limbu and Sunuwar language textbooks were the best in terms of gender responsiveness.

Table 17: Gender balance by language

Language	Contents and examples treat both male and female equitably	Activities and exercises treat both male and female equitably	Lessons maintain balance between male and female	Contents are not gender blind	Contents are not gender neutral	Lessons and exercises are gender responsive	Exercises are designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities
Nepali	3	3	3	3	2	2	2
Athara Magarat	3	4	4	4	4	3	0
Awadhi	3	3	3	2	2	2	0
Bajjika	4	4	4	3	0	3	3
Bantawa	3	3	3	3	2	2	2
Bhojpuri	1	1	2	4	4	2	2
Chamling	4	4	4	4	3	3	0
Dhimal	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Gurung	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Sunuwar	4	4	4	4	3	4	2
Limbu	4	4	4	2	2	4	3
Magar Dhoot	4	3	4	4	3	3	1
Maithili	2	2	2	2	1	1	1
Mugali	2	2	1	4	2	2	3
Nepal	4	4	4	3	4	3	2
Rajbanshi	1	1	1	1	1	0	0
Tamang Devnagari	2	3	3	4	4	2	1
Tamang Sambhota	3	3	3	2	2	3	4
Tharu	2	2	3	3	3	3	2
Tharu madhyachhetra	3	3	4	4	4	4	4
Yakkha	2	2	2	3	3	2	1

As per table 17, the worst ones in this respect were Rajbanshi followed by Maithili. Bhojpuri and Rajbanshi were also at the bottom in terms of treating female and male equitably in contents and examples.

Best ones in this respect were Bajjika, Chamling, Sunuwar, Limbu, Magar Dhoot and Nepal Bhasa textbooks. Bajjika, Sunuwar, Limbu, Tharu Madhyachhetra and Tamang Sambhota were better than others in designing exercises towards deconstructing the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities.

When the evaluators went thoroughly the mother language textbooks, the following impressions were made:

Bajjika	Class 1: Since gender discrimination is prevalent in Bazzika community lessons and texts that highlight women's competence and also enhance their images should be incorporated.
Chamling	Class 2: Because Chamling has no grammatical gender, lexical items for gender distinction should be used more and more.
	Class 3: Because Chamling has no grammatical gender, lexical items for gender distinction should be used more and more.
Dhimal	Class 1: Mostly male characters are used; there should be balance in gender.
	Class 2: Mostly male characters are used; there should be balance in gender.
	Class 3: Female oriented activities would be appreciable if included
Limbu	Class 1: Materials/pictures reflecting gender equality should be added
	Class 2: Mostly female characters are used; there should be balance in gender
	Class 3: Mostly female characters are used; there should be balance in gender

Magar Dhoot	Class 1: There should be gender balance in each lesson, example and activities
	Class 2: Magar has no grammatical gender
Rajbanshi	Class 1: Contents are mostly related to animals. So gender balance could not be evaluated in such cases
	Class 3: Additional subject matter is needed
Tamang Devnagari	Class 2: Lessons reflecting gender equity and balance should be added.
	Class 3: There is no balance in the sense that woman are given less priority. It should not be so
Tamang Sambhota	Class 1: Differences between male and female should be given in the lessons through texts and pictures.
	Class 2: As class 1
	Class 3: There is no balance in the sense that women are given less priority. It should not be so.
Tharu	Class 2: Dominated by male figures
	Class 3: Dominated by male figures. No mention of third sex.
Yakkha	Class 1: Better to incorporate lessons that help eradicate antisocial gender related custom and traditions
	Class 3: Better to ensure equal participation and responsibilities in all the lessons where gender perspective is relevant.

On paying attention to the aforementioned insights in each mother language textbooks, it was found that there should be paid more attention in maintaining gender balance. Moreover, the role of third sex should also be included.

The rating of the situation of gender balance in the language-wise grades was found as follows:

Table 18: Gender balance in textbooks by grades

Language	Grade	Contents and examples treat both male and female equitably	Activities and exercises treat both male and female equitably	Lessons maintain balance between male and female	Contents are not gender blind	Contents are not gender neutral	Lessons and exercises are gender responsive	Exercises are designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities
Nepali	1	3	3	2	3	2	2	2
	2	3	3	3	3	2	2	2
	3	2	3	3	3	2	2	1
Mother Tongue	1	3	3	3	3	2	3	1
	2	3	3	3	3	3	2	2
	3	3	3	3	3	3	2	2

Situation of gender balance in the textbooks of all three grades and languages (Table 18) showed that all of them except grade 3 Nepali language textbook treated female and male equitably in the contents and exercises but with few gaps. Grade three Nepali language textbook treated female and male equitably but not balanced in all of the texts, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. Exercises of the mother tongue grade 1 and Nepali grade 3 textbooks were worse than others in terms of their design to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities. They only touched lightly upon it. Exercises of the other grades and language textbooks were designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities but not balanced in all the exercises.

On this regard, it was also sought information on the publisher wise situation of gender balance in Nepali subject textbooks, which was found as follows:

Table 19: Gender balance in Nepali textbooks by publishers

Publisher	Contents and examples treat both male and female equitably	Activities and exercises treat both male and female equitably	Lessons maintain balance between male and female	Contents are not gender blind	Contents are not gender neutral	Lessons and exercises are gender responsive	Exercises are designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities
Atharai	3	3	2	3	1	3	2
Allied	3	2	3	3	2	2	1
Asia	2	3	3	3	2	2	0
Airawati	2	2	2	2	2	2	3
Bhundi puran	3	3	3	3	0	3	0
Cambridge	2	2	3	3	3	2	1
CDC	**2**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**2**
Ekta	3	3	2	2	2	2	2
JBD	2	3	3	2	2	2	2
Megha	2	2	2	3	2	2	2
Pragya	2	3	2	2	2	2	1
Pustak Prakashan	3	2	2	2	2	2	2
Sangam	3	3	3	3	2	3	1
Satyal	3	3	2	2	2	2	2
Simrik	3	3	3	3	3	2	0
Sunrise	3	3	3	2	3	2	3
Times	3	3	3	3	2	2	1
Unique	3	4	3	4	0	4	0
United	3	3	3	2	0	3	3
Vidyarthi	2	2	2	3	2	2	0

The textbooks were assessed from gender lens also by publisher. The outcomes revealed that in general Unique is better in gender balancing in the textbooks. Textbooks published by this publisher were thoroughly gender responsive, treated female and male equitably in activities and exercises and avoided gender blindness. But the exercises were not at all designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities in the textbooks.

Asia, Bhundi puran and Simrik publication houses are also at the bottom in this respect, i.e. the exercises in their textbooks were not at all designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities. Airawati, Sunrise and United publication houses were the best, i.e. this indicator was thoroughly included in the exercises of their textbooks. In CDC published textbooks, the exercises were designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities but not balanced throughout the exercises.

Further more, the insights and suggestions of the evaluators on various aspects of gender balance are as follows:

Atharai	Class 1 and 2: Representation of female characters as per male should be made somehow equal in lessons.
	Class 1, 2 and 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Allied	Class 1, 2 and 3: Needs to make the book female and third gender friendly.
	Class 2: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Asia	Class 1, 2 and 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Airawati	Class 1: Women participation, leadership and opportunites should be emphasized.
	Class 2 and 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Bhundi Puran	Class 1 and 2: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Cambridge	Class 1 and 3: Gender balance in terms of characters will not address it in reality; therefore, texts should also be included accordingly.
Ekta	Class 1, 2 and 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
JBD	Class 1, 2 and 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
	Class 3: Appropriate subject matter and exercises should be added to make lessons gender friendly.
Megha	Class 1, 2 and 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Pragya	Class 1: Female friendly context should be incorporated in the texts.
	Class 2 and 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Pustak Prakashan	Class 1: Use feminine gender in finite verbs.
	Class 2: Feminine gender should be given more emphasis in lessons.
	Class 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Sangam	Class 1, 2 and 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Satyal	Class 1, 2 and 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Simrik	Class 1, 2 and 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Sunrise	Class 1 and 2: Gender balance should be maintained.
	Class 3: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Times	Class 1: Context of females should be included in the exercises.
	Class 2: Examples and contents on third gender should be included in the text.
Unique	Class 1 and 2: Needs to balance gender roles in the texts.
	Class 3: Role of women is shown in more amount, needs to balance it.
United	Class 1: Lessons of inspiring Nepali females should be added for promoting female's position in society.
	Class 2: Lessons should respond equally to the people of different gender.
Vidyarthi	Class 1: Female is presented in traditional role only and the male is not presented in such roles (household). The contents should break the traditional gender roles by presenting contemporary examples.
	Class 2 and 3: Gender diversity is not addressed well. Women are shown mostly in domestic work. Needs to balance gender roles in the contents.

The insights of the evaluators and study team showed that a few textbooks need to improve their contents by placing both male and female equally in their roles as well as including examples of third gender too. However, in most of the private publishers' Nepali textbooks, there is better inclusion of male and female characters.

In reviewing the CDC's Nepali subject textbooks by the lens of Nepali and non-Nepali speaker evaluators, the situation reflects no significant difference.

Table 20: Gender balance in CDC Nepali textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Contents and examples treat both male and female equitably	Activities and exercises treat both male and female equitably	Lessons maintain balance between male and female	Contents are not gender blind	Contents are not gender neutral	Lessons and exercises are gender responsive	Exercises are designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities
Nepali Speaker	3	3	3	3	2	2	2
Non Nepali Speaker	3	3	4	3	3	3	2

Textbooks published only by CDC were also assessed from gender lens. The outcomes of this assessment were analyzed by experts with Nepali mother tongue and non Nepali mother tongues (Table 20). The findings derived from both types of experts are almost similar. However, CDC published Nepali textbooks in the eyes of the experts with non Nepali mother tongue were better in 3 categories- maintaining balance between female and male in the lessons; gender responsiveness of lessons and exercises; and in avoiding gender neutrality. Nevertheless, both types of experts found the exercises designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities but not balanced in all cases.

4.1.4   Human Rights and Child Rights

Children whose human rights are respected in early grade reading materials will grow up to be responsible citizens and respect the rights of others. In this section, the extent the textbooks and supplementary materials addressed this issue is presented.

Table 21: Percentage distribution of indicators of human rights and child rights in textbooks

Human and child rights indicators	not included this area at all (0)	Only lightly touched (1)	Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (2)	appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps (3)	thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order (4)
1. Lessons and exercises instruct children to respect others' rights	5.0%	21.0%	23.5%	31.1%	19.3%
2. Lessons and exercises enable children to enjoy right of participation	3.4%	10.1%	22.7%	35.3%	28.6%
3. Lessons and exercises enable children to promote their creativity	0.0%	7.6%	24.4%	42.0%	26.1%
4. Lessons and exercises adequately address child protection from health and safety perspectives	7.6%	16.8%	36.1%	24.4%	15.1%
5. Lessons and exercises promote children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, artistic expressions)	0.0%	17.6%	33.6%	34.5%	14.3%

Regarding human and child right indicators of the textbooks, only 19.3% experts found them instructing children to respect others' rights, whereas, 23.5% found it included but not

balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (Table 21). Only 3.4% found the lessons and exercises not enabling children to enjoy right of participation. Significant percentage (42.0%) of the experts found the lessons and exercises enabling children's creativity. Similarly, 36.1% found the lessons and exercises addressing child's health and safety issues but not balanced throughout the books. Regarding the lessons and exercises promoting children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, and artistic expressions), 34.6% found it appeared across most of the text but with a few gaps, whereas 33.6% found it included but not balanced across lessons and exercises.

Table 22: Human rights and child rights by language

Language	Lessons and exercises instruct children to respect others' rights	Lessons and exercises enable children to enjoy right of participation	Lessons and exercises enable children to promote their creativity	Lessons and exercises adequately address child protection from health and safety perspectives	Lessons and exercises promote children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, artistic expressions)
Nepali	2	3	3	2	2
Athar Magar	3	4	4	3	3
Awadhi	4	4	4	4	4
Bajjika	3	4	4	2	4
Bantawa	2	2	2	2	2
Bhojpuri	4	4	4	3	3
Chamling	4	4	3	2	4
Dhimal	3	3	3	2	3
Gurung	2	2	2	2	2
Limbu	4	4	4	3	4
Magar Dhoot	3	3	4	3	3
Maithili	1	1	3	1	2
Mugali	2	1	4	3	1
Nepal	3	4	4	4	4
Rajbanshi	0	1	1	1	2
Sunuwar	4	4	3	3	3
Tamang Devnagari	1	3	3	1	2
Tamang Sambhota	2	3	2	1	1
Tharu	3	2	2	2	1
Tharu Madhyachhetra	4	3	4	3	4
Yakkha	1	1	2	0	1

Human rights and child rights indicators of the textbooks were also assessed by language of the books. In this assessment, Awadhi language textbooks looked best as they obtained highest rating in all 5 indicators (Table 22). Nepal Bhasa and Limbu textbooks were also better as they obtained highest rating in 4 indicators. In general, Yakkha, Rajbanshi and Maithili textbooks were at the lower level in terms of the inclusiveness of human rights and child rights indicators identified for the purpose of this assessment.

In Nepali language textbooks, 2 indicators- Lessons and exercises enable children to enjoy right of participation; lessons and exercises enable children to promote their creativity and they appeared across most of the lessons and exercises but remained with a few gaps. The other 3 indicators- lessons and exercises instruct children to respect others' rights; lessons and exercises adequately address child protection from health and safety perspectives; lessons and exercises promote children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, artistic expressions) incorporated but not balanced in all the lessons and exercises.

Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Sunuwar, Limbu, and Tharu Madhyachhetra language textbooks were best in instructing children to respect other's rights. In Athara Magarat, Bajjika, Dhimal, Magar Dhoot, Nepal Bhasa and Tharu language textbooks, this indicator

appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. However, Awadhi, Bajjika, Chamling, Limbu, Nepal Bhasa and Tharu Madhyachhetra were best in having lessons and exercises promote children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, artistic expressions).

It was found that the mother language textbooks were lacking some issues in the area of human and child rights.

Bajjika	Class 1: Lessons related to children hygiene and sanitation nutrition, etc. should be effectively incorporated.
Bhojpuri	Class 1: Need to include Child right and duty related information.
Tamang Devnagari	Class 2: Lessons about the children's right to play, right to education etc. should be included.
	Class 3: Lessons about the children's right to play, right to education etc. should be included.
Tamang Sambhota	Class 1: Lessons encouraging the students to play, sing and dance are lacking in the textbook.
	Class 2: Contents about games should be given. Experimental exercises are must.
	Class 3: Exercises encouraging group discussion is a must. Contents on health, games and picture exercises are expected
Tharu	Class 2: Health and safety, and group work presentation related lessons and exercises need to be incorporated.
	Class 3: Health and safety, and group work presentation related lessons and exercises need to be incorporated.
Yakkha	Class 1: Better to include learning materials that stimulate children
	Class 2: Better to include learning materials that stimulate children
	Class 3: Better to include learning materials that stimulate children

A few mother language Textbooks like in Yakkha, Tharu, Tamang, Bhojpuri and Bajjika, contents on children's rights need to be addressed properly.

Moreover, when the human and child rights issues were reviewed in the textbooks by language wise grades, the following ratings were made:

Table 23: Human rights and child rights by grades

Language	Grade	Lessons and exercises instruct children to respect others' rights	Lessons and exercises enable children to enjoy right of participation	Lessons and exercises enable children to promote their creativity	Lessons and exercises adequately address child protection from health and safety perspectives	Lessons and exercises promote children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, artistic expressions)
Nepali	1	2	3	3	2	2
	2	3	3	3	2	2
	3	2	3	3	2	2
Mother Tongue	1	3	3	3	2	2
	2	3	3	3	3	3
	3	2	3	3	2	3

Grade and language wise analysis of the textbooks from human and child rights perspectives did not find significant variation (Table 23). In general, grade and language wise assessment showed that the mother tongue textbook of grade 2 is the best among all. This is followed by Nepali grade 2 and mother tongue grade 1 and 3 textbooks. In all 5 indicators, textbooks of all grades and all languages have either incorporated the indicators across most of the text but remained with a few gaps; or incorporated but not balanced in all lessons and exercises.

Human and child rights indicators of the Nepali subject textbooks were also analyzed publisher wise (Table 24) as follows:

Table 24: Human rights and child rights in Nepali textbooks

Publisher	Lessons and exercises instruct children to respect others' rights	Lessons and exercises enable children to enjoy right of participation	Lessons and exercises enable children to promote their creativity	Lessons and exercises adequately address child protection from health and safety perspectives	Lessons and exercises promote children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, artistic expressions)
Atharai	2	3	3	2	2
Allied	1	3	3	1	2
Asia	1	2	3	2	3
Airawati	3	3	2	2	2
Bhundi Puran	3	3	3	4	3
Cambridge	1	2	2	2	2
CDC	**2**	**3**	**3**	**2**	**3**
Ekta	3	3	3	2	2
JBD	2	2	2	2	2
Megha	2	2	2	1	1
Pragya	3	4	4	2	3
Pustak Prakashan	2	2	3	2	2
Sangam	3	2	2	2	2
Satyal	3	3	3	2	2
Simrik	1	2	2	2	1
Sunrise	3	3	3	3	3
Times	3	3	4	3	4
Unique	3	2	3	2	3
United	1	3	3	2	2
Vidyarthi	2	4	3	4	3

As per table 24, Airawati, Bhundi puran, Pragya, Sangam, Satyal, Ekta, Sunrise, Times and Unique were better than the others in instructing children to respect others' rights. Bhundi puran, Sunrise and Times were better in other indicators as well but lessons and exercises of the textbooks published by the Times thoroughly promoted children's innate behaviors. Lessons and exercises of the textbooks published by Bhundi puran and Vidyarthi were rated the best in adequately addressing child protection from health and safety perspectives. JBD and Megha were at the lower end in all 5 indicators. In CDC published textbooks, 3 indicators (enabling children to enjoy right of participation, promoting children's innate behaviors and enabling children to promote their creativity) appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. But the other 2 indicators, i.e. instructing children to respect others' rights, and addressing child protection from health and safety perspectives, were included but not balanced throughout the lessons and exercises in CDC published textbooks.

The insights of the evaluators and their suggestions to make the textbooks appropriate in terms of human and child rights issues are as follows:

Atharai	Class 1: Since lessons are shortened few in number; human rights aspects are not relevant. Child rights components are sporadically included but need to be linked with context.
	Class 3: Should include interesting and informative practical and simple lessons, exercises, illustrations related to human and child rights.
Allied	Class 1: Health, security, respect and behavioral aspects of children should be included in the text.
	Class 2: Lessons and exercises should be focused on child health, security and their rights as well as duties.
Airawati	Class 3: Difficulty level of the subject matter should be made easier.
Bhundi Puran	Class 2: Should include interesting and informative practical and simple lessons, exercises, illustrations related to human and child rights.
Cambridge	Class 1: Group work with participatory approach should be included in exercises so that students can experience their rights (games, cleanliness program).
	Class 3: Human rights and child rights contents should be included.
Ekta	Class 3: Should include interesting and informative practical and simple lessons, exercises, illustrations related to human and child rights.

JBD	Class 1, 2 and 3: Contents should be added on child rights, women's right, free learning and enhancement of disadvantaged group.
	Class 2: Contents should be added to develop comprehension of rights and duties of disabled and non-disabled children.
	Class 3: Contents should be added to address child rights and human rights.
Megha	Class 3: Should include interesting and informative practical and simple lessons, exercises, illustrations related to human and child rights.
Pragya	Class 3: Should include interesting and informative practical and simple lessons, exercises, illustrations related to human and child rights.
Pustak Prakashan	Class 1: Child friendly lessons are absent and focus more on writing tasks. Need to make the lessons more children friendly.
Sangam	Class 2: Exercises and activities developing student's analytical capacity should be included in the lesson.
Satyal	Class 1: Contents should be added to address child rights. Lessons should be made child friendly.
Simrik	Class 1: Level of the lessons and exercises is above the standard. To respect their right to study, it needs improvement in reducing difficulty level.
Sunrise	Class 2: Difficulty level of the subject matter should be made easier.
Times	Class 1 and 3: Should include interesting and informative practical and simple lessons, exercises, illustrations related to human and child rights.
Unique	Class 1, 2 and 3: Human and child rights need to be addressed properly.
United	Class 1: The lessons should focus on the helpless, orphans and mentally retarded children so that the students will be able to describe and respect the rights of differently abled children too.
Vidyarthi	Class 1, 2 and 3: Human and child rights need to be addressed properly.

The impression from the review of each textbook shows that there is sufficient room to improve the situation of human and child right issues in the lessons. Most books are lacking the contents on human and child rights, and those which are included with, are not even well organized to the context for easier reading for the students at their level.

Human rights and child rights indicators of the Nepali subject textbooks were analyzed from the perspective of the experts with Nepali MT and other MTs (Table 25).

Table 25: Human rights and child rights in CDC Nepali textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Lessons and exercises instruct children to respect others' rights	Lessons and exercises enable children to enjoy right of participation	Lessons and exercises enable children to promote their creativity	Lessons and exercises adequately address child protection from health and safety perspectives	Lessons and exercises promote children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, artistic expressions)
Nepali Speaker	2	3	3	2	2
Non Nepali Speaker	3	3	3	2	3

According to table 25, significant variation was not found in the assessment of all 5 indicators of human and child rights dimension. In enabling children to enjoy right of participation and to promote their creativity both types of experts found that they appeared across most lessons and exercises but with a few gaps. Similarly, both types of experts found that the lessons and exercises adequately addressed child protection from health and safety perspectives but not balanced throughout the lessons and exercises. Regarding instructing children to respect other's rights and promoting their innate behavior, Nepali MT experts found them incorporated but not balanced throughout the texts. The other MT experts found them across most lessons and exercises but with a few gaps.

It was found that lesson two in class two Nepali textbook of CDC has a picture of a lion hunting a deer, which should not be shown to the early graders. The lessons should be made child-friendly.

4.1.5 Curricular Linkage

Reading materials are expected to establish linkage with the prescribed curriculum of designated grade. Textbooks and supplementary books are the instruments for implementing the curriculum. The intent of the curriculum should be translated into supplementary materials in order to establish linkage with children's personal and social needs.

Table 26 below presents the picture of the textbooks based on the responses of the resource persons in line with the given rating scale.

Table 26: Percentage distribution of indicators of curricular linkage in textbooks

Curricular Linkage Indicators	not included this area at all (0)	Only lightly touched (1)	Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (2)	appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps (3)	thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order (4)
1. Lessons and exercises are in line with grade-wise curriculum objectives	0.0%	7.6%	28.6%	39.5%	24.4%
2. Contents are organized in proper sequence (horizontal linkage of contents among the lessons)	0.8%	9.2%	31.9%	40.3%	17.6%
3. Contents are organized in terms of vertical linkage (grade 1 to 3)	0.0%	12.6%	47.1%	26.9%	13.4%
4. Contents are adequate as per the age level of the children according to the curriculum (scope of the contents)	0.8%	19.3%	31.1%	28.6%	20.2%
5. Contents are organized in proper order of ease and difficulty (simple to complex)	1.7%	10.1%	42.9%	26.1%	19.3%
6. Contents presented in the textbooks could be taught using locally available materials	0.8%	11.8%	30.3%	27.7%	29.4%
7. Material provides varieties of exercises and activities focusing on all the components of reading	2.5%	7.6%	37.0%	34.5%	18.5%
8. Exercises are properly ordered in terms of ease and difficulty (related to language skills)	1.7%	8.4%	42.9%	28.6%	18.5%
9. Exercises are balanced with objectives of reading skills in the curriculum	0.8%	5.0%	38.7%	35.3%	20.2%

Table 26 depicts the fact that nearly 40 percent of the textbooks were found to have lessons and exercises in line with grade wise objectives in most of the cases followed by 28.6 percent with little no balance in all the chapters and exercises. However, considerable number (24.4%) of the respondents expressed that they were well addressed by all the Nepali language textbooks.

Regarding organization of the contents, 47.1 percent of the textbooks did not have followed the vertical organization in a proper way. This was followed by 40.3 percent textbooks which had horizontal organization in most of the cases in the textbooks.

Table 26 further shows that 19.1 percent of the textbooks were found to have adequacy of the contents in rare cases. However, 20.2 percent of them have adequate contents as per the grade level of the children. It is indicative of the fact that majority of the textbooks should be revised to make them suitable to the grade level.

There is also a problem in the sequence of the contents as nearly 43 percent of the textbooks were reported not to have addressed the principle of organization from simple to complex in the balanced way in all the texts and exercises. Only 19.3 percent of the textbooks did not have the problem in sequencing from simple to complex to make them easily understandable to the children.

It was observed that 29.4 percent of the textbooks can be taught using local materials followed by 30.3 of them with little provision. A total of 27.7 percent textbooks had the provision in all the chapters but not in a balanced way. Only 18.5 percent of the textbooks have provided varieties of exercises and activities focusing on all the components of reading. However, 37 percent of them do not have varieties of exercises in a balanced way in all the chapters. Similarly, 34.5 percent of them have provided varieties of activities but with a few gaps and not in a balanced way.

In 18.5 percent of the textbooks, exercises related to language skills are properly ordered in terms of ease and difficulty level to the children of grade one to three. However, nearly 43 percent of the textbooks have not properly ordered the contents in a balanced way in all the chapters, exercises and illustrations. However, 28.6 of them have ordered the contents in all the chapters, exercises and illustrations but with a few gap to organize them from ease to difficult level.

Regarding the balancing of exercises of the textbooks with objectives of reading skills mentioned in the curriculum, only 20.2 percent of the early grade Nepali language textbooks had maintained it in a proper and logical way. A total of 38.7 percent of the textbooks did not address this issue in all the chapters in a balanced way. This issue was addressed in all the chapters of 35.3 percent textbooks but with a gap for logical order.

Textbooks developed for different mother languages were also assessed through different dimensions including curricular linkages. Practice of providing mother tongue or multilingual educations does not have a long history in Nepal.

Curriculum Development Centre (CDC) and different mother tongue related institutions have made efforts to address the need of mother tongue education. These languages were assessed through nine different points of assessment. Experts from different languages assessed their mother language textbooks designed and developed for early grades (Grade one to three) based on the given guidelines.

Their responses are presented in mean scores in Table 27. The first indicator of comparison was whether the lessons and exercises of early grade textbooks are in line with the grade wise curriculum objectives. As seen in Table 27, among the 18 studied textbooks of mother languages, 8 languages (Mugali, Nepal, Limbu, Bhojpuri, Awadhi, Bajjika, Dhimal and Yakkha) were found to have their textbooks adequately in line with the grade wise objectives of the curriculum.

Table 27: Curricular linkage by language

Language	Lessons and exercises are in line with grade-wise curriculum objectives	Contents are organized in proper sequence (horizontal linkage of contents among the lessons)	Contents are organized in terms of vertical linkage (grade 1 to 3)	Contents are adequate as per the age level of the children according to the curriculum (scope of the contents)	Contents are organized in proper order of ease and difficulty (simple to complex)	Contents presented in the textbook could be taught using locally available materials	Material provides varieties of exercises and activities focusing on all the components of reading	Exercises are properly ordered in terms of ease and difficulty (related to language skills)	Exercises are balanced to the objectives of reading skills in the curriculum
Nepali	3	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	3
Athara Magarat	3	3	3	3	2	4	3	2	3
Awadhi	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Bajjika	4	4	2	4	4	4	3	4	4
Bantawa	3	1	1	1	2	2	1	1	1
Bhojpuri	4	4	2	4	4	3	4	4	3
Chamling	3	3	3	3	3	4	4	3	3
Dhimal	4	3	2	3	3	3	3	3	3
Gurung	2	2	2	2	2	3	2	2	2
Limbu	4	4	3	4	4	4	4	4	4
Magar Dhoot	3	3	3	3	3	4	4	2	3
Maithili	2	2	1	2	2	2	2	2	2
Mugali	4	4	4	4	3	4	4	4	4
Nepal Bhasa	4	3	4	3	3	4	4	3	3
Rajbanshi	1	1	1	2	1	2	2	1	1
Sunuwar	3	3	3	3	2	4	3	3	3
Tamang Devnagari	3	3	3	4	4	4	3	4	3
Tamang Sambhota	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	3
Tharu	3	3	2	3	2	3	3	3	2
Tharu madhyachhetra	3	4	3	4	4	4	4	3	4
Yakkha	4	3	2	3	2	2	2	2	2

According to table 27, textbook of Rajbanshi language was reported not to have addressed adequately the indicator of curricular goals in the textbook. Tamang Sambhota, Gurung and Maithili languages also had very little contents in line with the curricular goals prescribed for the same grades. It indicates that contents and exercises given in these books did not fulfill curricular objectives.

The other indicator of the curriculum was horizontal and vertical organization of the contents of the textbooks. Regarding horizontal linkage of the contents, 6 languages (Mugali, Tharu madhyachhetra, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika and Bhojpuri) had addressed it in their textbooks but two languages: Bantawa and Rajbanshi had little provision of horizontal linkage of the contents.

Similarly, Nepali, Tamang Sambhota, Gurung and Maithili language textbooks had maintained this issue in some of their lessons but was not adequate. Mugali, Nepal bhasa

and Awadhi language textbooks had maintained vertical linkage from grades one to three. In these textbooks attempts were made to present the content in spiral sequence to help the children learn and relearn the contents for their consolidation. Textbooks of the three languages: Bantawa, Maithili and Bhojpuri, had little vertical relationships of the contents among the three grades: grades one to three.

Textbooks of Mugali, Tharu madyachhetra, Tamang Devnagari, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika and Bhojpuri languages had adequate contents as per the age level of the children. However, textbooks of Bantawa language had little contents as per the age level of the children. Textbooks of Nepali, Tamang Sambhota, Gurung, Maithili and Rajbanshi have paid little attention to address the issue of coverage of the contents for early grade children.

In the textbooks of six languages (Tharu madhyachhetra, Tamang Devnagari, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika, Bhojpuri), contents were organized in proper order of ease to difficulty (simple to complex) for early grade children. The textbooks of Rajbanshi language had little provision to provide contents in proper order of ease to difficulty. Textbooks of nine languages (Nepali, Tharu, Tamang Sambhota, Athara Magarat, Bantawa, Gurung, Sunuwar and Yakkha) did not have adequately organized contents in line with the principle of moving from simple to complex.

The other indicator of assessment was whether the contents presented in the textbook could be taught using locally available materials. In this regard, textbooks of 11 languages (Mugali, Tharu madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Devnagari, Athara Magarat, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika, Chamling and Sunuwar) were found to have the possibility of teaching them using locally available materials to the early grade children. However, the textbooks of six languages (Nepali, Tamang Sambhota, Bantawa, Maithili, Rajbhanshi and Yakkha) had inadequate provision of using local materials to deliver the lessons to the early graders.

Textbooks of eight mother languages (Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bhojpuri, and Chamling) provided varieties of exercises and activities focusing on all the components of reading. Only one of the sample mother languages (Bantawa) had very little provision of variety of exercises and activities focusing on all the components of reading (listening, speaking, reading and writing). Nepali, Tamang Sambhota, Gurung, Maithili, Rajbanshi and Yakkha language textbooksalso had inadequate provision of varieties of exercises and activities for teaching all the components of reading.

Mugali, Tamang Devnagari, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika and Bhojpuri language textbooks were found to have exercises properly ordered in terms of ease and difficulty (related to language skills). However, Bantawa and Rajbanshi language textbooks had very few provisions of exercises properly ordered in terms of ease and difficulty of language skills. Similarly, Nepali, Tamang Sambhota, Athara Magarat, Magar Dhoot, Gurung, Maithili and Yakkha language textbooks had inadequate provisions regarding the order of the exercises to move from simple to complex in language learning.

Textbooks of the five languages (Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Limbu, Awadhi and Bajjika) had balanced their exercises to the objectives of reading skills as prescribed in the curriculum. Bantawa and Rajbanshi language textbooks, however, had little provision of exercises in line with the objectives of reading skills in the curriculum. Similarly, textbooks of Tharu, Gurung, Maithili and Yakkha languages had inadequate provision of exercises to balance them to the objectives of reading skills.

Table 27 also shows comparison of the textbooks of different languages across different aspects of the frameworks. The table makes it clear, as per the response of the language

expert, that textbooks of the Awadhi language have maintained all the indicators of assessment regarding curricular linkage. This suggests that Awadhi language textbook is acceptable and appropriate for early grade children. The other acceptable textbooks from this perspective are Mugali and Limbu followed by Bajjika and Bhojpuri. Bantawa and Rajbanshi, were, however, found to be the least preferred textbooks from curricular linkage point of view. The textbooks of Tamang Sambhota, Gurung and Maithili languages also did not meet indicator for early grade readers.

Overall, the mother language textbooks indicated the the followings insights:

Bantawa	Class 1: Not completely linked to CDC curriculum.
	Class 2: Not organized in simple to complex sequence.
Bajjika	Class 2: Exercises do not correspond with lessons to some extent.
Sunuwar	Class 1, 2 and 3: Further improvement in curricular linkage is expected.
Tamang Sambhota	Class 1: Alphabets should be introduced in the beginning of the textbooks. Only then picture-story, song etc should be presented.
	Class 2: Meaning of difficult words in the sentences should be given. Number of words in a sentence should be less. Priority should be given to the spoken form of language. Spelling mistakes should be corrected.
	Class 3: Lessons are to be ordered from simple to complex. Some lessons are longer than the students' level.
Tharu	Class 2: Error such as answer to gaunkhane katha is given in page 32 but there is no gaunkhane katha in page 22. No correspondence between table of content and page numbers.
	Class 3: Lessons are same e.g. objectives of lesson 6 and 15; and lesson 12 and 18 are same because of the language of the Tharu of west of Dang and Saptari being the same in the textbook.
Yakkha	Class 1: More exercises according to children's age and interests. More consonants and vowels have been identified. Better to revise and incorporate them.
	Class 2: Give emphasis to exercises to improve language skills.
	Class 3: Better to give emphasis to everyday language in exercises.

The overall sights of the MT textbooks shows that there is need to properly address the curriculum of CDC, and if possible to the Nepali subject textbook too.

Textbooks of Mother tongues and Nepali languages are compared with respect to curricular linkage. Comparison was also made grade wise between Nepali and Mother tongue textbooks. The responses in this regard are presented in table 28.

Table 28: Curricular linkage by grades

Language	Grade	Lessons and exercises are in line with grade-wise curriculum objectives	Contents are organized in proper sequence (horizontal linkage of contents among the lessons)	Contents are organized in terms of vertical linkage (grade 1 to 3)	Contents are adequate as per the age level of the children according to the curriculum (scope of the contents)	Contents are organized in proper order of ease and difficulty (simple to complex)	Contents presented in the textbook could be taught using locally available materials	Material provides varieties of exercises and activities focusing on all the components of reading	Exercises are properly ordered in terms of ease and difficulty (related to language skills)	Exercises are balanced to the objectives of reading skills in the curriculum
Nepali	1	2	2	2	2	2	3	2	2	2
	2	3	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	3
	3	3	3	2	2	2	2	2	2	3
Mother Tongue	1	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
	2	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3

Table 28 shows that grade one mother tongue textbooks have maintained curricular linkage in majority of the lessons only. However, Nepali language textbooks have maintained this linkage in some of the lessons. Similar result is seen regarding grade two and grade three books. This indicates that mother tongue books are better than Nepali language books when grade wise.

Overall comparison was also made between textbooks of Nepali language published by CDC and private publishers with respect to curricular linkage. Nepali textbooks for early grade readers are published both by CDC and private publishers. As this study included 20 publishers including CDC, curricular linkage was assessed through nine indicators. Table 29 presents this comparison of the textbooks published by CDC and private publishers:

Table 29: Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of curricular linkage in Nepali textbooks

Publisher	Lessons and exercises are in line with grade-wise curriculum objectives	Contents are organized in proper sequence (horizontal linkage of contents among the lessons)	Contents are organized in terms of vertical linkage (grade 1 to 3)	Contents are adequate as per the age level of the children according to the curriculum (scope of the contents)	Contents are organized in proper order of ease and difficulty (simple to complex)	Contents presented in the textbook could be taught using locally available materials	Material provides varieties of exercises and activities focusing on all the components of reading	Exercises are properly ordered in terms of ease and difficulty (related to language skills)	Exercises are balanced to the objectives of reading skills in the curriculum
Atharai	3	3	3	2	2	1	1	2	2
Allied	2	2	2	1	2	2	2	2	2
Asia	3	3	3	1	2	3	2	2	3
Airawati	2	2	2	1	2	2	2	2	2
Bhundi puran	2	2	2	1	2	3	3	2	2
Cambridge	2	2	2	2	3	2	3	2	2
CDC	**4**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**4**
Ekta	3	3	2	2	3	2	2	3	3
JBD	1	2	2	1	2	1	2	2	3
Megha	2	3	3	2	3	2	2	2	2
Pragya	3	3	2	2	2	2	0	2	2
Pustak Prakashan	3	2	2	3	3	3	3	3	3
Sangam	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	1	2
Satyal	3	3	2	2	3	2	2	3	3
Simrik	1	1	1	1	1	2	2	2	2
Sunrise	3	2	2	1	1	2	2	2	3
Times	3	3	2	2	2	2	3	2	3
Unique	2	2	3	3	3	3	1	3	2
United	2	3	2	3	2	2	3	3	2
Vidyarthi	3	2	2	3	2	4	2	2	3

Table 29 provides vivid picture of the textbooks published by different publishers in line with the objectives of promoting early grade reading habits. The first indicator to assess curricular linkage was alignment of lessons and exercises with grade-wise curriculum objectives. As shown in the table, early grade textbooks published by JBD and Simrik had a very poor provision to meet this indicator of curricular linkage. Early grade textbooks published by Allied, Airawati, Bhundi puran, Cambridge, Megha, Sangam, Unique and United had maintained this indicator in some of the lessons. Eight other publishers except CDC had met this indicator in maximum level however, they are not addressed logically. Early grade textbooks published by CDC met this indicator fully and logically.

Regarding organization of the contents in proper sequence (horizontal linkage of contents among the lessons), Simrik publication had given least preference to organize the contents in proper sequence of horizontal linkage. Similarly, the publishers like Allied, Airawati, Bhundi puran, Cambridge, JBD, Pustak Prakashan, Sangam, Sunrise, Unique, Vidyarthi were seen maintaining this indicator in some of the lessons but many chapters and lessons did little maintain this horizontal linkage. The publishers like Atharai, Asia, CDC, Megha, Pragya, Satyal, Ekta, Times and United had almost met this indicator. However, some gaps were also there in some aspects in order to organize the contents in horizontal sequence.

The third indicator was whether the contents are organized in terms of vertical linkage (grade 1 to 3). Early grade textbooks published by Simrik had minimal vertical linkage among the textbooks of grades one to three. Early grades books published by Allied, Airawati, Bhundi puran, Cambridge, CDC, JBD, Pragya, Pustak Prakashan, Sangam, Satyal, Ekta, Sunrise, Times, United and Vidyarthi were found to have vertical relationship to some extent only. Atharai, Asia, CDC, Megha and Unique were found to have addressed this linkage in majority of the lessons but some gaps were noticed in their organization.

The fourth indicator of textbook evaluation was 'adequacy of the contents as per the age level of the children according to the curriculum (scope of the contents)'. Regarding this, textbooks of seven publishers (Allied, Asia, Airawati, Bhundi puran, JBD, Simrik and Sunrise) were found to have rarely met the indicator of scope and coverage of the contents as per the age level of the children with their grades. Textbooks of the publishers like Atharai, Cambridge, Megha, Pragya, Sangam, Satyal, Ekta, and Times have maintained this indicator to some extent compared to the seven publishers mentioned above. CDC, Pustak Prakashan, Satyal, Ekta and Unique have addressed this issue in majority of the cases. These books were found to have adequate scope and coverage but some gaps were there as to make them more sequential and rational.

As per the fifth indicator, the textbooks from Simrik and Sunrise seemed to have very little contents organized in proper order of ease and difficulty (simple to complex).Arranging the contents in simple to complex order is a basic indicator for sequencing the reading materials. Eight publishers (Cambridge, CDC, Megha, Pustak Prakashan, Satyal, Ekta, Unique, United, and Vidyarthi) had maintained this indicator in majority cases but with some gaps in their textbooks. Regarding the indicator, 'contents presented in the textbook could be taught using locally available materials', reading materials published by Vidyarthi was reported to have followed this indicator of probability of using local materials.

Textbooks published by the publishers (Asia, Bhundi puran, CDC, Pustak Prakashan and Unique) also indicated maximum possibility of using locally available materials for the delivery of their contents. However, they needed some adjustment in the content. In contrary to it, textbooks published by Atharai and JBD were found to have minimum possibility of using locally available materials in the delivery of their contents. Similarly, textbooks published by 11 other publishers had made some provision of using locally available materials only to some extent. These books therefore need more revision to use local materials for the delivery of their contents.

The seventh indicator was, 'whether the material provides varieties of exercises and activities focusing on all the components of reading' was found little addressed by the textbooks published by Atharai and Unique. Table 29 also shows that early grade textbooks published by Pragya publication did not have any provision of exercises and activities for all components of reading. In contrast to it, textbooks of other six publishers (Bhundi Puran, Cambridge, CDC, Pustak Prakashan, Times and United) had maximum provision of exercises and activities in the textbooks to promote all the components of reading skills.

The eighth indicator of curricular linkage, 'Exercises are properly ordered in terms of ease and difficulty' (related to language skills) was not or very little addressed by Sangam only. In contrast to it, CDC, Pustak Prakasan, Satyal, Ekta, Unique and United had adopted this indicator to a maximum extent. However, some gaps were still noticed remaining in those books. The remaining other 13 languages had made less provision about this order in their textbooks. The last indicator, 'whether exercises are balanced to the objectives of reading skills in the curriculum' seemed to have met by CDC published early grade textbooks. Asia, JBD, Pustak Prakashan, Satyal, Ekta, Sunrise, Times and Vidyarthi also seemed to have met

this indicator in their early grade textbooks in majority of the cases. Remaining 11 publishers have met this indicator in some of the cases only. In other words, these books had little balance in the exercises related reading skills within the objectives in the curriculum.

Regarding assessment of curriculum linkage in the reading materials, CDC published early grade textbooks seemed to have met two indicators fully and the other indicators in majority of the cases. Publishers can be ranked in order of meeting these indicators of curricular linkage from most to least decreasing order as Pustak Prakasan, Satyal, Ekta, Megha, Times, Vidyarthi and United respectively.

The thorough assessment of the reading materials from curricular linkage perspective showed the following impression:

Atharai	Class 1: Pronunciation/speaking and listening skills should be given equal emphasis as to the writing.
	Class 2: Need to reorganize lessons according to horizontal and vertical linkage. Subject matters still need to be reorganized from simple to complex. Requires exercises for loud reading and specific paragraph reading skills development.
	Class 3: Lessons are organized in simple to complex order but some lessons are very abstract to understand, e.g. lessons 4 and 7. It is appropriate to include real stories.
Allied	Class 1: Should be graded from simple to complex as guided by the curriculum.
Airawati	Class 3: Subject matter is more difficult for the student's level in grade three. It lacks exercises on listening and speaking.
Cambridge	Class 1: Lessons/ exercises/ activities should be included as per the objectives of curriculum. Lessons/ exercises are above the standard of the student level.
	Class 2: Lessons/ exercises are above the standard of the student level.
Ekta	Class 1: Teacher centered activities should be replaced by student centered activities.
JBD	Class 1: Level of the subject matter is found to be of high standard as compared to the curricular outcomes.
	Class 2: Subject matter should be simplified.
	Class 3: Additional subject matter should be included to maintain curricular linkage. Level of the subject matter is found to be of high standard as compared to the curricular outcomes.
Megha	Class 1: Subject matter is lacking and exercises are also not sufficient as recommended by the curriculum.
Pustak Prakashan	Class 1: All the skills of language should be balanced in exercises.
Sangam	Class 1: Should be balanced in terms of coherence as per the curriculum.
	Class 2: The horizontal linkage is very good but vertical organization should be maintained.
Satyal	Class 1: Curricular linkage is not maintained.
	Class 2 and 3: Subject matter should be revised according to the students' level.
Simrik	Class 1 and 2: Exercises should be made simple/ easier. Grammar related exercises should be removed.
Sunrise	Class 1: Listening and reading activities should be included.
	Class 2: The contents are not appropriate to the level of children in grade two.
	Class 3: Activities and exercises lacked listening skills.
Times	Class 1: Four language skills should be addressed in the text in a balanced way because reading ability is also related to other skills. Spelling and punctuation marks should be properly included in the textbook.
Unique	Class 1 and 2: Listening and speaking context should be included along with reading skills in the activities.
	Class 3: Activities of dictation should be added. Include activity for reading in the textbook.
United	Class 1: Activity based exercise should be incorporated to develop the student's language skills.
	Class 2: Should add sufficient contents as per the curriculum.
Vidyarthi	Class 1: Exercises related to listening skills are inadequate, more should be included.
	Class 2: Listening exercises as indicated in the curriculum should be included.

In conclusion, most of the private publishers' textbooks were found to link its contents with curriculum of the grades.

CDC published Nepali textbooks for early graders were reviewed by both experts from Nepali speakers and non-Nepali speakers. As per table 30, for non-Nepali speakers the textbooks were found better in comparison to Nepali speaking experts in all the indicators of curricular linkage.

Table 30: Curricular linkage in CDC Nepali textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Lessons and exercises are in line with grade-wise curriculum objectives	Contents are organized in proper sequence (horizontal linkage of contents among the lessons)	Contents are organized in terms of vertical linkage (grade 1 to 3)	Contents are adequate as per the age level of the children according to the curriculum (scope of the contents)	Contents are organized in proper order of ease and difficulty (simple to complex)	Contents presented in the textbook could be taught using locally available materials	Material provides varieties of exercises and activities focusing on all the components of reading	Exercises are properly ordered in terms of ease and difficulty (related to language skills)	Exercises are balanced to the objectives of reading skills in the curriculum
Nepali Speaker	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Non Nepali Speaker	4	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	4

According to table 30, for non-Nepali speakers, CDC published textbooks had lessons and exercises in line with the objectives of the curriculum. Similarly, according to them, exercises in these textbooks were balanced to the objectives of reading skills of the children. However, Nepali speakers rated these books as not maintaining these indicators. For non-Nepali speakers, the set indicators of assessment were found addressed comparatively well than the Nepali speakers. It is obvious from the discussion that for Nepali speaking experts there is greater room for improvement in early grade Nepali textbooks than the non-Nepali speaking experts.

4.2   Level Appropriateness in Textbooks

4.2.1   *Language*

It is essential for learners to achieve language competency for leaning. Language learning involves achieving competency in four language skills, viz. listening, speaking, reading and writing. Of these four language skills reading has been found most crucial, in that it helps to gain information and knowledge. Hence, this unit of level appropriateness of early grade reading materials has been focused on the issue: How do these materials ensure the reading competency areas. It is, however, to be borne in mind that these areas are not confined only to a single language skill, viz. reading; instead, they may also be achieved in other language skills (listening, speaking and writing) as well. In addition, it should also be observed that these competency areas are properly sequenced in arrangement in the materials. The competency areas include the following:

A. Phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness
B. Fluency
C. Vocabulary
D. Comprehension

This section evaluates these areas as presented in the early grade reading materials for 21 different mother tongues including Nepali.

4.2.1.1 Phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness

It is important that children be initially made familiar first with spoken language and gradually relate it with its written form. To achieve this result child need to be made familiar with sounds of the language. It requires pointing out and practicing sounds, drawing attention to the same or rhyming sounds in different words, etc. For example, teacher may speak out certain sounds in words and ask children to repeat them and find out other words beginning with the same sounds. Similarly, teacher may ask children to chant rhyming words or any other words beginning with the same sounds. During this practice children may proceed from simple sounds to more and more complicated sounds for the sake of ease in learning.

Next, children are required to be able to map the sounds of the language onto letters or groups of letters. For example, they look at a letter or hear a sound and then say which sound it stands for. Following the mastery of individual sounds, they should be helped to use this knowledge to decode unfamiliar words. This process of grapho-phonemic awareness should also be graded from simple to complex sounds and letters. It is, however, to be borne in mind by teachers that the letters used in a script for writing a language precisely represent the sounds of the language.

Table 31: Percentage distribution of indicators of phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness in textbooks

Phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness indicators	*not included this area at all (0)*	*Only lightly touched (1)*	*Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (2)*	*appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps (3)*	*thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order (4)*
1. Script used represents the phonemes of the language	0.8%	0.8%	15.1%	37.0%	46.2%
2. Contains exercises on recognition of sound by the learner	10.1%	10.9%	31.9%	32.8%	14.3%
3. Sequencing of sounds in words proceeds from simpler to more difficult sounds (such as simple sounds; conjuncts and words containing diacritics)	5.0%	14.3%	37.8%	29.4%	13.4%
4. Words with similar sounds creating rhyme are given in the exercises/activities	5.0%	11.8%	36.1%	30.3%	16.8%
5. Reading materials include exercises on children's chanting with special attention to rhyming words or words with the same sound	10.9%	11.8%	31.1%	31.1%	15.1%
6. Reading materials contain unfamiliar words which students are asked to segment into separate sounds	24.4%	19.3%	26.9%	21.8%	7.6%
7. Exercises ask students to replace a letter in a word by another letter and identify the new word	26.1%	16.8%	26.1%	21.0%	10.1%
8. Lessons are graded from letter recognition, single word reading, and sentence reading to text reading	8.4%	16.0%	35.3%	22.7%	17.6%

It is essential for children to be made familiar with the sounds of the language used in early grade reading materials. To achieve this, the reading materials need adequate exercises on sound recognition. While evaluating the materials in Nepali and other mother tongues by the language experts it was found (as shown in Table 31) that 31.9% and 32.8% materials included exercises on sound recognition though they were not balanced and had a few gaps while 10.1% materials lacked these exercises and 10.9% materials lightly touched them. 14.3% of the materials were, however, found to be adequate in including exercises on sound recognition.

To achieve ease in learning in early grades it is important to arrange sounds in words from simpler to more difficult (such as simple sounds; conjuncts and words containing diacritics). In assessing the early grade reading materials it was observed that 37% and 29.4% materials contained such arrangement of sounds though not in a balanced way and with a few gaps, respectively while 5.0% materials did not include it at all though 14.3% materials included it inadequately. 13.4% materials were, however, found fully adequate in this respect.

Chanting rhyming words can be helpful for sound recognition. Viewed from this perspective, the early grade reading materials in different mother tongues were evaluated as partially adequate without balance (36.1%) and with certain gaps (30.3%) whereas some materials were found to lack rhyming completely (5%) or partially (11.8). 16.8% of the materials were assessed to have thoroughly adequate in this respect. In addition, the reading materials were also found to have included exercises on children's chanting with special attention to rhyming words or words with the same sound.

To consolidate sound recognition in a language reading materials should contain unfamiliar words which students are asked to segment into separate sounds. In course of evaluating the early grade reading materials it was, however, observed that a large chunk of these materials (24.4%) did not include this item at all while only a few of them (7.6%) sufficiently deal with it. Similarly, most the materials were found inadequate in including exercises asking students to replace a letter in a word by another letter and identify the new word.

Finally, the lessons in the reading materials (35.3%) were mostly found graded from letter recognition, single word reading, and sentence reading to text reading in an imbalanced way while a few of these materials (8.4%) did not include such grading at all. 17.6% of the materials included this grading.

Regarding the phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness the first indicator is whether 'script used represents the phonemes of the language'. As shown in Table 32, textbooks of Nepali, Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Tamang (Devanagari and Sambhota), Limbu, Maithili and Athara Magarat found to be representing all the phonemes by the script used. In contrast, Tharu, Awadhi, Bantawa, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Dhimal, Gurung, Rajbanshi, Yakkha and Nepal Bhasa textbooks are evaluated to be lacking this feature in some respect. Further, Textbooks of Magar Dhoot, Bajjika and Sunuwar were found to be further below in representing the phonemes of the language by the script used.

Secondly, the textbooks were evaluated whether they 'contain exercises on recognition of sound by the learner.' Textbooks for Mugali, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Devnagari, Athara Magarat, Limbu and Awadhi include this area throughout, sequenced in a logical order whereas Tharu, Bhojpuri, Dhimal, Gurung and Yakkha include the area, and it appear across most of the text, still there are a few gaps. Likewise, Nepali, Tharu, Tamang Sambhota, Bantawa, Bajjika, Chamling and Sunuwar include the area, and it appears in the majority, but not in all of the areas. Lastly, Maithili and Rajbanshi textbooks have only lightly touched the indicator.

Table 32: Phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness by language

Language	Script used represents the phonemes of the language	Contains exercises on recognition of sound by the learner	Sequencing of sounds in words proceeds from simpler to more difficult sounds (such as simple sounds; conjuncts and words containing diacritics)	Words with similar sounds creating rhyme are given in the exercises/activities	Reading materials include exercises on children's chanting with special attention to rhyming words or words with the same sound	Reading materials contain unfamiliar words which students are asked to segment into separate sounds	Exercises ask students to replace a letter in a word by another letter and identify the new word	Lessons are graded from letter recognition, single word reading, and sentence reading to text reading
Nepali	4	2	2	2	2	1	1	2
Athara Magarat	4	4	3	2	2	2	2	2
Awadhi	3	4	4	4	4	3	4	4
Bajjika	2	2	4	3	3	1	0	4
Bantawa	3	2	2	1	1	2	1	1
Bhojpuri	3	3	3	2	2	3	2	4
Chamling	3	2	2	4	4	3	2	3
Dhimal	3	3	3	2	2	3	3	3
Gurung	3	3	2	0	0	1	1	2
Limbu	4	4	4	4	4	3	2	4
Magar Dhoot	2	3	3	4	4	4	3	3
Maithili	4	1	2	2	2	1	1	2
Mugali	4	4	4	3	2	0	3	4
Nepal	3	4	4	4	4	4	4	4
Rajbanshi	3	1	1	0	0	1	0	0
Sunuwar	2	2	3	3	3	2	3	2
Tamang Devnagari	4	4	3	2	2	1	1	2
Tamang Sambhota	4	2	1	3	3	2	1	2
Tharu	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
Tharu madhyachhetra	4	2	3	4	3	2	4	4
Yakkha	3	3	3	3	2	2	2	2

As per table 32, third indicator applied to evaluate the phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness is 'sequencing of sounds in words proceeds from simpler to more difficult sounds (such as simple sounds; conjuncts and words containing diacritics)'. The textbooks in Mugali, Nepal Bhasa, Limbu, Awadhi and Bajjika include this area throughout, sequenced in a logical order. Tharu, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Tamang Devnagari, Magars (Dhoot and Athara Magarat), Bhojpuri, Dhimal, Sunuwar and Yakkha include the area, and it appears across most of the text, there are a few gaps. Nepali, Bantawa, Chamling, Gurung and Maithili include the area, and it appears in the majority, but not in all of the areas whereas Tamang Sambhota and Rajbanshi include the area, but it is only lightly touched.

The fourth indicator is whether 'words with similar sounds creating rhyme are given in the exercises/activities'. Textbooks in Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi and Chamling include this area throughout, sequenced in a logical order.

Mugali, Tharu, Tamang Sambhota, Bajjika, Sunuwar and Yakkha include the area, and it appear across most of the text, but there are a few gaps. Nepali, Tamang Devnagari, Athar Magarat, Bhojpuri, Dhimal and Maithili include the area, and it appears in the majority, but not in all of the domains.

Bantawa includes the area, but it is only lightly touched. And, Gurung and Rajbanshi do not include this area at all.

The fifth indicator is whether 'reading materials include exercises on children's chanting with special attention to rhyming words or words with the same sound'. In this regard, Nepal Bhasa, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi and Chamling include this area throughout, sequenced in a logical order. Similarly, Tharu, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Tamang Sambhota, Bajjika and Sunuwar include the area, and it appear across most of the text, still there are a few gaps.

Likewise, Nepali, Mugali, Tamang Devnagari, Athar Magarat, Bhojpuri, Dhimal, Maithili and Yakkha include the area, and it appears in the majority, but not in all domains. In contrast, Bantawa includes the area, but it is only lightly touched. Gurung and Rajbanshi do not include this area at all.

The sixth indicator is whether 'reading materials contain unfamiliar words which students are asked to segment into separate sounds'. In this regard, Nepal Bhasa and Magar Dhoot include this area throughout, sequenced in a logical order. Tharu, Limbu, Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Chamling and Dhimal include the area, and it appears across most of the text but there are a few gaps.

Tharu Madhyachhetra, Athara Magarat, Tamang Sambhota Bantawa, Sunuwar and Yakkha include the area, and it appears in the majority, but not in all of the domains. Nepali, Tamang Devnagari, Bajjika, Gurung, Maithili and Rajbanshi include the area, but it is only lightly touched. According to the mean score Mugali does not include this area at all.

The seventh indicator is whether 'exercises ask students to replace a letter in a word by another letter and identify the new word'. In this regard, the textbooks for Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa and Awadhi include this area throughout, sequenced in a logical order. Mugali, Tharu, Magar Dhoot, Dhimal and Sunuwar include the area, and it appears across most of the text, but there are a few gaps.

Athara Magarat, Limbu, Bhojpuri, Chamling and Yakkha include the area, and it appears in the majority, but not in all the domains. Nepali, Tamang (Devanagari and Sambhota), Bantawa, Gurung and Maithili include the area, but it is only lightly touched. In terms of the mean score, Bajjika and Rajbanshi do not include this area at all.

The eighth indicator is whether 'lessons are graded from letter recognition, single word reading, and sentence reading to text reading'. In this regard, Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika and Bhojpuri include this area throughout, sequenced in a logical order.

Tharu, Magar Dhoot, Chamling and Dhimal include the area, and it appear across most of the text, still there are a few gaps. Nepali, Tamang (Devnagari and Sambhota), Athara Magarat, Gurung, Sunuwar, Maithili and Yakkha include the area, and it appears in the majority, but not in all the areas. Bantawa includes the area, but it is only lightly touched whereas Rajbanshi is rated (0) i.e., it does not include this area at all.

According to Table the textbooks in Nepal Bhasa found to be the best in terms of all the indicator and Rajbanshi holds the position of a textbook prepared with least indicator included.

Table 33 presents the mean score on indicators of phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness by grades 1 through 3.

Table 33: Phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness by grades

Laguage	Grade	Script used represents the phonemes of the language	Contains exercises on recognition of sound by the learner	Sequencing of sounds in words proceeds from simpler to more difficult sounds (such as simple sounds; conjuncts and words containing diacritics)	Words with similar sounds creating rhyme are given in the exercises / activities	Reading materials include exercises on children's chanting with special attention to rhyming words or words with the same sound	Reading materials contain unfamiliar words which students are asked to segment into separate sounds	Exercises ask students to replace a letter in a word by another letter and identify the new word	Lessons are graded from letter recognition, single word reading, and sentence reading to text reading
Nepali	1	4	2	2	3	2	1	1	2
	2	4	2	2	2	2	1	2	2
	3	4	2	2	2	2	1	1	2
Mother Tongue	1	3	3	3	3	3	2	2	3
	2	3	3	3	3	3	2	2	3
	3	3	3	3	2	2	2	2	3

According to the data, in terms of the first indicator '*script used represents the phonemes of the language*' for all the Nepali textbooks the mean score is (4), but it is (3) for Mother tongue textbooks which means that they '*include the area, and it appear across most of the text, there are a few gaps*. In the same fashion, for the indicators 2,3,5,6, 7 and 8 the mean score is (2) which means they *include the area, and it appears in the majority, but not all of the text (lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations)*.

For the fourth indicator which is '*Words with similar sounds creating rhyme are given in the exercises/activities'* the mean score of textbooks for grade 1 is (3) whereas it is (2) for grades 2 and 3.

When it was identified the publication wise phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness in Nepali subject books, the following information was produced.

Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of Phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness in Nepali subject books is presented in Table 34.

On the indicator '*contains exercises on recognition of sound by the learner'* the textbooks from Atharai and Simrik were rated (0) i.e, '*not included this area at all*'; United, Times, Pragya, Allied, Airawati and Asia publications are rated as only lightly touched. The textbooks from Cambridge, JBD, Megha, Pustak prakashan, Unique and Vidyarthi were rated as '*included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations',*whereas the books from Sunrise, Satyal, Ekta, Sangam, CDC and Bhundi Puran were rated as '*appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps*'.

The next indicator goes as '*sequencing of sounds in words proceeds from simpler to more difficult sounds (such as simple sounds; conjuncts and words containing diacritics)*. Based on this indicator, the textbook from Simrik publication was rated nill. Likewise, the books by Unique, Times, pragya, Airawati and Asia were rated as only lightly touched. United, Sunrise, Satyal, Ekta, Pustak prakashan, Megha, Cambridge, JBD, Allied and Atharai

publication were rated average whereas Vidyarthi, Sangam CDC, Bhundi Puran were rated better.

Table 34: Publication-wise phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness in Nepali textbooks

Publisher	Contains exercises on recognition of sound by the learner	Sequencing of sounds in words proceeds from simpler to more difficult sounds (such as simple sounds; conjuncts and words containing diacritics)	Words with similar sounds creating rhyme are given in the exercises/ activities	Reading materials include exercises on children's chanting with special attention to rhyming words or words with the same sound	Reading materials contain unfamiliar words which students are asked to segment into separate sounds	Exercises ask students to replace a letter in a word by another letter and identify the new word	Lessons are graded from letter recognition, single word reading, and sentence reading to text reading
Atharai	0	2	2	2	0	3	2
Allied	1	2	2	2	1	0	1
Asia	1	1	3	2	1	0	1
Airawati	1	1	1	0	0	0	1
Bhundi puran	3	3	3	3	1	1	2
Cambridge	2	2	2	2	0	0	1
CDC	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**2**	**2**	**3**
Ekta	3	2	3	2	2	3	3
JBD	2	2	2	2	2	1	2
Megha	2	2	2	2	2	2	2
Pragya	1	1	3	3	2	3	2
Pustak Prakashan	2	2	2	2	2	2	3
Sangam	3	3	2	2	2	2	1
Satyal	3	2	3	2	2	3	3
Simrik	0	0	2	1	0	2	0
Sunrise	3	2	2	2	1	0	2
Times	1	1	2	3	1	2	1
Unique	2	1	3	3	0	2	1
United	1	2	2	2	1	0	1
Vidyarthi	2	3	2	2	1	1	2

Table 34 further shows that the third indicator is whether '*words with similar sounds creating rhyme are given in the exercises/activities*'. Based on it, the textbooks from Airawati were rated (1), Vidyarthi, United, Times, Sunrise, Simrik, Sangam, Atharai, Allied, Cambridge, JBD, Megha, Pustak Prakashan publications were rated (2); and, Unique, Bhundi Puran, CDC, Satyal, Ekta, Pragya and Asia were rated (3).

In the indicator '*reading materials include exercises on children's chanting with special attention to rhyming words or words with the same sound*', Airawati was rated nill and Simrik (1). However, Atharai, Allied, Asia, Cambridge, Vidyarthi, United, Sunrise, Sangam, Satyal, Ekta, Pustak Prakashan, JBD, Megha were rated average. In addition, Unique, Bhundi Puran, CDC, Pragya, and Times were rated (3).

'*Reading materials contain unfamiliar words which students are asked to segment into separate sounds*' is the fifthindicator to measure the difference between CDC and private

publishers in mean score of Phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness in Nepali subject books. The textbooks published fromsUnique, Simrik, Cambridge, Airawati and Atharai are (0); Vidyarthi, United, Times, Sunrise, Bhundi puran, Asia and Allied are rated (1) whereas Satyal, Ekta, Sangam, Pustak Prakashan, Pragya, Megha, JBD and CDC are rated (2).

Indicatorsixth is whether '*exercises ask students to replace a letter in a word by another letter and identify the new word'*. The textbooks published from Allied, Asia, Airawati, Cambridge, United and Sunrise are rate (0); Vidyarthi, JBD and Bhundi Puran publications are rated (1); Unique, Times, Simrik, Sangam, Pustak Prakashan, Megha and CDC are rated (2), whereas Satyal, Ekta, Pragya and Atharai publications are rated (3).

Indicatorseventh is '*lessons are graded from letter recognition, single word reading, and sentence reading to text reading'*. Evaluated on this basis, the textbooks from Simrik are rated (0), Allied, Asia, Airawati, Cambridge, United, Unique, Times, Sangam publications are rated (1); Vidyarthi, Sunrise, Pragya, Megha, JBD, Bhundi puran and Atharai are rated (2) whereas Satyal, Ekta, Pustak Prakashan, CDC publications are rated (3).

Phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness in CDC Nepali subject books was observed from the perspective of Nepali speaking and non-Nepali speaking evaluators in table 35.

Table 35: Phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness in CDC Nepali textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Script used represents the phonemes of the language	Contains exercises on recognition of sound by the learner	Sequencing of sounds in words proceeds from simpler to more difficult sounds (such as simple sounds; conjuncts and words containing diacritics)	Words with similar sounds creating rhyme are given in the exercises/ activities	Reading materials include exercises on children's chanting with special attention to rhyming words or words with the same sound	Reading materials contain unfamiliar words which students are asked to segment into separate sounds	Exercises ask students to replace a letter in a word by another letter and identify the new word	Lessons are graded from letter recognition, single word reading, and sentence reading to text reading
Nepali Speaker	4	2	2	2	2	1	1	2
Non Nepali Speaker	4	3	2	3	3	2	2	3

Table 35 shows that from the perspective of the evaluator speaking Nepali as his/her mother tongue the CDC Nepali textbooks' mean score is (4); but it was (2), i.e. '*included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations'* for the indicators 2,3,4,5 and 8; whereas the same is (1), i.e. '*only lightly touched'* for the indicators 6 and 7.

From the perspective of an evaluator speaking Nepali as a second language, the mean score for the first indicator is (4) i.e., *thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order*. The same is (3) for the indicators 2, 4, 5 and 8 whereas it is (2) for the indicators 3, 6 and 7. Comparing the data it can be concluded that the textbooks' mean score on different indicators was higher from the perspective of non-native Nepali speaking evaluator compared to the evaluator speaking Nepali as his/her mother tongue.

4.2.1.2 Fluency

Fluency refers to learners' ability to read connected text smoothly, correctly, and rapidly enough to ensure solid comprehension. This is mainly achieved through giving students lots

of opportunities to practice reading connected text containing familiar words and simple sentences.

It is necessary for learners to gain fluency for comprehending a connected text. Table 36 presents the scores for the early grade reading materials with regards to the three aspects of fluency. First, the reading materials were evaluated from the perspective of whether students were given sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to gain greater fluency and comprehension.

Table 36: Percentage distribution of indicators of fluency in textbooks

Fluency indicators	not included this area at all (0)	Only lightly touched (1)	Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (2)	appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps (3)	thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order (4)
1. Students are given sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to achieve greater fluency and comprehension	1.7%	10.9%	37.8%	32.8%	16.8%
2. The texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words	0.0%	8.4%	31.9%	33.6%	26.1%
3. Emphasis is given on forming simple sentences to address fluency of students	2.5%	16.8%	26.1%	40.3%	14.3%

According to table 36, it was found that most of the reading materials (37.8% and 32.8%) included this aspect of achieving fluency though not adequately while only a few reading materials showed that they lacked it.

Similarly, most of the reading materials were found to have used familiar words while none of the reading materials did include them at all. Most of the reading materials (31.9% and 33.6%) used simple sentences while only a few of them (2.5%) did not include them.

The mean score of fluency by language is presented in Table 37. The first indicator to measure the fluency is whether *'students are given sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to achieve greater fluency and comprehension'*. Textbooks in different 5 languages (Mugali, Tharu madhyachhetra), Nepal Bhasa, Magar Dhoot and Awadhi are rated (4)*,* which means that these textbooks *'include this area throughout, sequenced in a logical order.'*

Similarly, 8 textbooks (Limbu, Bantawa, Bajjika, Chamling, Dhimal, Sunuwar, Maithili and Rajbanshi) are rated (3) which means they '*include the area, and it appear across most of the text but there are a few gaps.*'The textbooks rated (2) were Yakkha, Gurung, Bhojpuri, Athara Magarat, Tamang Sambhota and Nepali. It means that these textbooks '*included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.*' Bantawa '*only lightly touched'* the area. Contrastively, Rajbanshi does not include this area at all.

The second indicator for the measurement of fluency is '*the texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words'*. Textbooks for Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika and Dhimal are rated (4) in this regard. Similarly, Nepali, Tharu, Tamang Devnagari Tamang Sambhota, Athara Magarat Rajbanshi, Maithili, Sunuwar, Gurung and Chamling are rated (3) whereas Yakkha, Bhojpuri are rated (2) and Bantawa is rated (1).

Table 37: Fluency by language

language	Students are given sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to achieve greater fluency and comprehension	The texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words	Emphasis is given on forming simple sentences to address fluency of students
Nepali	2	3	2
Athar Magar	2	3	3
Awadhi	4	4	4
Bajjika	3	4	4
Bantawa	3	1	1
Bhojpuri	2	2	3
Chamling	3	3	3
Dhimal	3	4	3
Gurung	2	3	3
Limbu	3	4	3
Magar Dhoot	4	4	3
Maithili	3	3	2
Mugali	4	4	4
Nepal	4	4	3
Rajbanshi	3	3	0
Sunuwar	3	3	3
Tamang Devnagari	1	3	4
Tamang Sambhota	2	3	2
Tharu	1	3	3
Tharu madhyachhetra	4	4	3
Yakkha	2	2	2

In terms of the third indicator, i.e. '*Emphasis is given on forming simple sentences to address fluency of students'* the textbooks for Mugali, Tamang Devnagari, Awadhi, Bajjika and Magar Dhoot are rated (4); Tharu, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Dhimal, Gurung and Sunuwar are rated (3); Similarly, Nepali, Tamang Sambhota, Maithili and Yakkha are rated (2) and Bantawa and Rajbanshi are rated (1) and (0) respectively.

From the rating scale of the languages it can be concluded that the languages in groups (2), (1) and (0) are to be revised to include the expected indicator to enhance the fluency level of the language textbooks.

Mean score on indicators of fluency is presented by grades 1 through 3 in Table 38.

Table 38: Fluency by grades

Language	Grade	Students are given sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to achieve greater fluency and comprehension	The texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words	Emphasis is given on forming simple sentences to address fluency of students
Nepali	1	2	2	2
	2	2	3	2
	3	2	3	2
Mother Tongue	1	3	3	3
	2	3	3	3
	3	3	3	3

According to table 38, in terms of the first indicator '*students are given sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to achieve greater fluency and comprehension*' the mean score of the textbooks for grade 1 and 2 is (2) which means that

they included it but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.

The same is (3) for class 3 which means '*appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.*' In the same fashion, for the indicators 2 which reads '*the texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words'* all the textbooks for grades 1, 2 and 3 the mean score is (3) which means they '*appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.*' For the third indicator which reads '*emphasis is given on forming simple sentences to address fluency of students'* the mean score of textbooks for grade 1 is (3) whereas it is (2) for grades 2 and 3.

Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of fluency in Nepali subject books is presented in Table 39. There are three indicators.

Table 39: Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of fluency in Nepali textbooks

Publisher	Students are given sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to achieve greater fluency and comprehension	The texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words	Emphasis is given on forming simple sentences to address fluency of students
Atharai	2	3	3
Allied	1	2	2
Asia	2	2	2
Airawati	2	3	1
Bhundi Puran	3	4	4
Cambridge	2	2	2
CDC	**3**	**3**	**3**
Ekta	3	3	3
JBD	1	1	1
Megha	2	2	2
Pragya	3	2	2
Pustak Prakashan	3	2	2
Sangam	2	2	1
Satyal	3	3	3
Simrik	2	1	1
Sunrise	2	3	2
Times	3	2	1
Unique	1	2	2
United	2	3	2
Vidyarthi	3	2	3

As per Table 39, the first indicator is '*students are given sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to achieve greater fluency and comprehension*'. The textbooks published by Allied, JBD and Unique are rated (1) whereas Atharai, Asia, Airawati, Cambridge, Megha, Sangam, Simrik, Sunrise, United are rated (2). The books from Bhundi puran, CDC, Pragya, Pustak Prakashan, Satyal, Ekta, Times and Vidyarthi are rated (3).

The second indicator is whether '*the texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words*'. Based on this, textbooks from JBD and Simrik are rated (1); Vidyarthi,

Unique, Times, Sangam, Pustak prakashan, Pragya, Megha, Cambridge, Asia and Allied are rated (2) and, the books from Atharai, Airawati, CDC, Satyal, Ekta, Sunrise and United are rated (3). The only textbook from Bhundi puran is rated (4).

On the basis of the third indicator which goes '*emphasis is given on forming simple sentences to address fluency of students*', the textbooks from Airawati, JBD, Sangam, Simrik, Times are rated (1); United, Unique, Sunrise, Pustak Prakashan, Pragya, Megha, Cambridge, Asia, Allied are rated (2); Vidyarthi, Satyal, Ekta, CDC, Atharai are rated (3); and Bhudi puran's textbook is rated (4).

Moreover, fluency in CDC Nepali subject books was observed from the perspective of Nepali speaking and non-Nepali speaking evaluators in table 40 as following:

Table 40: Fluency in CDC Nepali textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Students are given sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to achieve greater fluency and comprehension	The texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words	Emphasis is given on forming simple sentences to address fluency of students
Nepali Speaker	2	2	2
Non Nepali Speaker	3	3	4

Table 40 shows that from the perspective of the evaluator speaking Nepali as mother tongue, the CDC Nepali textbooks' mean score is (2) for all the indicators; the same is (3) for the indicators 1 and 2 whereas it is (4) for the indicator 3 from the perspective of an evaluator speaking Nepali as a second language.

From the available data we can conclude that the textbooks' mean score on different indicators was much higher from the perspective of the evaluator speaking Nepali as a second language compared to the evaluator speaking Nepali as his/her mother tongue.

4.2.1.3 Vocabulary

The knowledge of vocabulary ensures students' comprehension of reading texts. To achieve this knowledge it is necessary to employ certain strategies. These strategies may include introducing new vocabulary to students before reading a story that contains those words, and either tells or asks the students what the word means. Besides, reading material should contain ample exercises for the use of vocabulary in sentences.

It is also necessary to sequence words in terms of ease and difficulty. It is important for students to build and increase vocabulary for better comprehension. Hence, reading materials need to involve approaches for this purpose.

Table 41 presents the picture of how reading materials employ various strategies for enriching students' knowledge of vocabulary. As shown in Table, most of the reading materials (46.2%) do not introduce new vocabulary with explanation before reading a text.

Table 41: Percentage distribution of indicators of vocabulary in textbooks

Vocabulary indicators	not included this area at all (0)	Only lightly touched (1)	Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (2)	appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps (3)	thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order (4)
1. Reading materials introduce new vocabulary with explanation before reading a text	46.2%	9.2%	11.8%	17.6%	15.1%
2. After completing the reading of the text certain words are discussed in the exercises	11.8%	10.1%	15.1%	36.1%	26.9%
3. Words given in the text are ordered in terms of monosyllabic to multisyllabic	15.1%	21.0%	36.1%	20.2%	7.6%
4. There are exercises in which the teacher speaks out a word and students are asked to write it	26.1%	13.4%	21.0%	25.2%	14.3%
5. Students are given opportunity to use the familiar words in sentences	5.9%	11.8%	21.8%	41.2%	19.3%
6. Words used in the text are sequenced from concrete to abstract	8.4%	21.8%	39.5%	20.2%	10.1%
7. Number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline	11.8%	19.3%	24.4%	28.6%	16.0%

After completing the reading of the text certain words were discussed in the exercises in most of the reading materials (36.1% and 26.9%) though this task calls for further adequacy. In a very few reading materials (7.6%) words given in the text were ordered in terms of monosyllabic to multisyllabic. Dictation of words was also found missing in several reading materials.

No or very few exercises were found for using familiar words in sentences. Words used in the text were partially found to be sequenced from concrete to abstract. Number of words in a sentence was not found to be appropriate to the grade in some cases as per CDC guideline.

Mean score on indicators of vocabulary by language is presented in Table 42.

In terms of the first indicator, i.e. *'reading materials introduce new vocabulary with explanation before'* the textbooks for Bhojpuri and Tharu Madhyachhetra are rated (4); Mugali, Athara Magarat, Magar Dhoot, Chamling, Gurung, Dhimal ane Maithili are rated (3); Limbu, Sunuwar and Yakkha are rated (2); Nepali, Thauru, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Devnagari are rated (1) and Rajbanshi, Bantawa, Bajjika, Awadhi, Tamang Sambhota are rated (0).

On the basis of the indicator 2, i.e. *'after completing the reading of the text certain words are discussed in the exercises'* Magar Dhoot Awadhi and Nepal Bhasa are rated (4); Nepali, Tharu, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Tamang Devnagari Magar (AtharaMagarat), Limbu,

Bhojpuri, Dhimal, Gurung, Sunuwar and Yakkha are rated (3); Tamang Sambhota, Bantawa, Bajjika, Chamling and Maithili are rated (2); Rajbanshi and Mugali are rated (0)

Table 42: Vocabulary by language

Language	Reading materials introduce new vocabulary with explanation before reading a text	After completing the reading of the text certain words are discussed in the exercises	Words given in the text are ordered in terms of monosyllabic to multisyllabic	There are exercises in which the teacher speaks out a word and students are asked to write it	Students are given opportunity to use the familiar words in sentences	Words used in the text are sequenced from concrete to abstract	Number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline
Nepali	1	3	1	2	3	2	2
Athara Magarat	3	3	3	3	3	2	2
Awadhi	0	4	4	3	4	4	3
Bajjika	0	2	4	0	2	2	2
Bantawa	0	2	1	1	0	1	2
Bhojpuri	4	3	2	4	3	2	3
Chamling	3	2	1	0	3	1	2
Dhimal	3	3	3	4	4	3	3
Gurung	3	3	2	0	3	2	3
Limbu	2	3	3	3	4	4	4
Magar Dhoot	3	4	2	3	1	3	2
Maithili	3	2	3	1	2	0	2
Mugali	3	0	3	0	3	1	4
Nepal	1	4	1	3	2	2	3
Rajbanshi	0	0	1	1	1	0	2
Sunuwar	2	3	3	2	3	3	3
Tamang Devnagari	1	3	2	1	2	3	3
Tamang Sambhota	0	2	1	1	2	2	2
Tharu	1	3	1	1	3	2	4
Tharu madhyachhetra	4	3	2	1	3	4	4
Yakkha	2	3	2	3	3	2	4

Moreover, as per table 42, based on the third indicator which reads 'w*ords given in the text are ordered in terms of monosyllabic to multisyllabic'* the textbooks for Awadhi and Bajjika are rated (4); Mugali, Magar (Athara Magarat), Limbu, Dhimal, Sunuwar and Maithili are rated (3); Tharu Madhyachhetra, Tamang Devnagari Magar Dhoot, Bhojpuri, Gurung and Yakkha are rated (2) whereas Nepali, Tharu, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Sambhota, Bantawa, Chamling and Rajbanshi are rated (1).

In terms of the fourth indicator which goes '*there are exercises in which the teacher speaks out a word and students are asked to write it'* the textbooks for Bhojpuri and Dhimal are rated (4)*;* Nepal Bhasa, Athara Magarat, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi and Yakkha are rated (3)*;* Nepali and Sunuwar are rated (2); Tharu, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Tamang Devnagari, Tamang Sambhota, Bantawa, Maithili and Rajbanshi are rated (1), Mugali, Bajjika, Chamling and Gurung are rated (0).

'Students are given opportunity to use the familiar words in sentences' is the fifth indicator to evaluate the vocabularies in the textbooks. According to the data, Limbu, Awadhi and Dhimal are rated (4), Nepali, Mugali, Tharu, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Athara Magarat, Bhojpuri, Gurung, Chamling, Sunuwar and Yakkha are rated (3); Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Devnagari Tamang Sambhota, Bajjika and Maithili are rated (2); Magar Dhoot and Rajbanshi are rated (1) and Bantawa is rated (0).

In terms of the sixth indicator '*words used in the text are sequenced from concrete to abstract',* the textbooks for Tharu Madhyachhetra, Limbu and Awadhi are rated (4), Tamang Devnagari, Magar Dhoot, Dhimal and Sunuwar are rated (3), Nepali, Tharu, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Sambhota, Athara Magarat, Bajjika, Bhojpuri, Gurung and Yakkha are rated (2); Mugali, Bantawa and Chamling are rated (1) and Rajbanshi is rated (0).

The seventh indicator reads '*number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline.*' On the basis of this indicator, Mugali, Tharu, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Limbu and Yakkha are rated (4), Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Devnagari, Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Dhimal, Gurung and Sunuwar are rated (3); Nepali, Tamang Sambhota, Athara Magarat, Magar Dhoot, Bantawa, Bajjika, Chamling, Maithili and Rajbanshi are rated (2).

It was sought information on the situation of vocabulary by language wise grades which is shown in Table 43.

Table 43: Vocabulary by grades

Language	Grade	Reading materials introduce new vocabulary with explanation before reading a text	After completing the reading of the text certain words are discussed in the exercises	Words given in the text are ordered in terms of monosyllabic to multisyllabic	There are appropriate in which the teacher speaks out a word and students are asked to write it	Students are given opportunity to use the familiar words in sentences	Words used in the text are sequenced from concrete to abstract	Number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline
Nepali	1	1	2	2	2	2	2	2
	2	1	3	2	2	3	2	2
	3	1	3	1	2	3	2	2
Mother Tongue	1	2	2	2	2	2	2	3
	2	2	3	2	2	2	2	3
	3	2	3	2	2	3	2	3

The mean score on the indicators of vocabulary by grades is presented in Table 43. On the basis of the first indicator the textbook for the grade 1 is rated (1) whereas the same is (2) for the grades 2 and 3 textbooks. Similarly, on the basis of the second indicator, textbooks for grade one are rated (2) whereas textbooks for grades 2 and 3 are rated (3). Textbooks for all the grades are rated (2) in terms of the indicators 4, 5, 6 and 7. In contrast, in terms of the fifth indicator textbooks for grade 1 is rated (2) whereas textbooks for grades 2 and 3 are rated (3).

On the basis of the available data, the textbooks for grade 1 is seen to lack some features compared to the textbooks prescribed for grades 2 and 3. However, the textbooks designed for early grades are below the expected standards in terms of vocabulary component.

Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of vocabulary in Nepali subject books is presented in Table 44. Different indicators are set for the evaluation.

Table 44: Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of vocabulary in Nepali textbooks

Publisher	Reading materials introduce new vocabulary with explanation before reading a text	After completing the reading of the text certain words are discussed in the exercises	Words given in the text are ordered in terms of monosyllabic to multisyllabic	There are exercises in which the teacher speaks out a word and students are asked to write it	Students are given opportunity to use the familiar words in sentences	Words used in the text are sequenced from concrete to abstract	Number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline
Atharai	4	1	1	0	2	2	2
Allied	0	3	0	1	2	1	2
Asia	1	0	1	1	3	2	1
Airawati	3	1	2	0	3	2	1
Bhundi puran	0	4	1	2	3	2	3
Cambridge	0	1	2	1	2	2	2
CDC	**1**	**3**	**2**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**
Ekta	0	4	2	3	3	3	1
JBD	1	3	1	2	1	1	0
Megha	0	3	2	2	3	2	2
Pragya	3	2	1	4	1	2	0
Pustak Prakashan	2	3	2	2	3	2	3
Sangam	1	3	1	2	2	1	0
Satyal	0	4	2	3	3	3	1
Simrik	0	0	0	0	2	1	1
Sunrise	0	3	2	3	4	3	2
Times	3	3	0	3	3	1	1
Unique	0	3	0	0	2	1	0
United	0	2	1	1	3	1	2
Vidyarthi	0	4	2	3	4	2	2

The first indicator is *'reading materials introduce new vocabulary with explanation before reading a text'.* The textbooks from Allied, Bhundi Puran, Cambridge, Megha, Satyal, Ekta, Simrik, Sunrise, Unique, United, and Vidyarthi are rated (0) in this indicator. It means that these books do not include this area at all. Similarly, the textbooks from Sangam, JBD, CDC, and Asia are rated (1) i.e. only lightly touched. Likewise, Pustak Prakashan has included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. In the same way, Times, Pragya, Airawati are rated (3) that means the features *appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.* The only books from Atharai are rated (4) which means the features arethoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.

Indicator 2 reads 'after completing the reading of the text certain words are discussed in the exercises'. The textbooks from Asia and Simrik are rated (0) which means they do not include this area at all. Atharai, Airawati and Cambridge have only lightly touched. Similarly, Pragya, and United are rated (2), i.e., they have included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. Unique, Time international, Sunrise, Sangam, Pustak Prakashan, Megha, JBD, CDC and Allied textbooks are rated (3)

which means the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Lastly, Vidyarthi, Satyal, Ekta and Bhundi Puran are found as thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.

On the basis of the third indicator, which reads *words given in the text are ordered in terms of monosyllabic to multisyllabic',* The textbooks from Allied, Simrik, Times andUnique are rated *(0, i.e.,* they *do not include this area at all.* Likewise, Atharai, Asia, Bhundi puran, JBD, Pragya, Sangam and United have*only lightly touched.* Airawati, Cambridge, CDC, Megha, Pustak Prakashan, Satyal, Ekta, Sunrisi and Vidyarthi are rated *(2)* which means they have*included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.*

The fourth indicator is whether '*there are exercises in which the teacher speaks out a word and students are asked to write it*'. The textbooks from Atharai, Airawati, Simrik and Unique are rated as they *do not include this area at all*. Furthermore, the textbooks from Allied, Asia, Cambridge and United rated as (1) *have only lightly touched*. Likewise, Sangam, Pustak Prakashan, Megha, JBD and Bhundi Puran are rated (2), i.e., *included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations*. Vidyarthi, Times, Sunrise, Satyal, Ekta and CDC textbooks are rated (3) which means the features '*appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps'*. The only textbooks from Pragya are rated (4) which depicts they have *thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order*.

On the basis of the fifth indicator which reads *'students are given opportunity to use the familiar words in sentences',* the textbooks from JBD and Pragyaare rated (1) that means they have '*only lightly touched'* the scope. Likewise the textbooks from Atharai, Allied, Cambridge, Sangam, Simrik and Unique are rated (2), i.e., they have *included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations*. The textbooks from United, Times, Satyal, Ekta, Pustak Prakashan, Megha, CDC, Bhundi puran, Airawati and Asia are rated (3) which means the features '*appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps'.*Vidyarthi and Sunrise publications, rated (4), *'thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order'*.

'Words used in the text are sequenced from concrete to abstract' is the sixth indicator to evaluate vocabulary in the textbooks from different publication. On this basis, Allied, JBD, Sangam, Simrik, Times, Unique and United are rated (1) which means they '*only lightly touched'* the area. The textbooks from Atharai, Asia, Airawati, Bhundi puran, Cambridge, Megha, Pragya, Pustak Prakashan and Vidyarthi are rated (2) which means they '*included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations*. Likewise, CDC, Satyal, Ekta and Sunrise are rated (3) which means the features '*appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.*'

The seventh indicator reads as 'number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline'. Based on this indicator the textbooks from Unique, Sangam, Pragya and JBD are rated (0) which means they 'do not include this area at all'. Likewise, publications from Asia, Airawati, Satyal, Ekta, Simrik and Times are rated (1) which means they have 'only lightly touched' the features. Vidyarthi, United, Sunrise, Megha, Cambridge, Allied and Atharai publications are rated (2), which means they have 'included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. The textbooks from Pustak Prakashan, CDC and Bhundi puran are rated (3) which means the features 'appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.'

Vocabulary in CDC Nepali subject books from the perspectives of the evaluators speaking Nepali as the mother tongue and speaking it as a second language was observed in presented in Table 45.

Table 45: Vocabulary in CDC Nepali textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Reading materials introduce new vocabulary with explanation before reading a text	After completing the reading of the text certain words are discussed in the exercises	Words given in the text are ordered in terms of monosyllabic to multisyllabic	There are exercises in which the teacher speaks out a word and students are asked to write it	Students are given opportunity to use the familiar words in sentences	Words used in the text are sequenced from concrete to abstract	Number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline
Nepali Speaker	1	2	1	2	3	2	1
Non Nepali Speaker	1	3	2	3	3	3	3

Table 45 shows that from the perspective of the evaluator speaking Nepali as the mother tongue, the CDC Nepali textbooks' mean score is (1) for the indicators 1,3 and 7; the mean score is (2) for the indicators 2, 4 and 6 whereas the same is (3) for the indicator 5. From the perspective of an evaluator speaking Nepali as a second language, the CDC Nepali textbooks' mean score is (1) for the indicators 1; it is (2) for the indicators 3 whereas the same is (3) for the indicators 2, 4, 5, 6 and 7. Based on the available data we can conclude that the textbooks' mean score on different indicators was much higher from the perspective of non-native Nepali speaking evaluator compared to the evaluator speaking Nepali as his/her mother tongue.

4.2.1.4 Comprehension

Comprehension refers to understanding the meaning of a text while reading it silently or loudly or listening to it. To achieve this task there are certain strategies which can help students think about the meaning of the text.

Table 46 presents the strategy wise scores gained while assessing the reading materials.

Table 46: Percentage distribution of idicators of comprehension in textbooks

Comprehension indicators	not included this area at all (0)	Only lightly touched (1)	Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (2)	appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps (3)	thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order (4)
1. Students are asked to read out a lesson and are asked questions about that	4.2%	6.7%	21.8%	35.3%	31.9%
2. Understanding of lesson promoting exercises are included in the material	0.0%	2.5%	21.8%	50.4%	25.2%
3. Order of sentences is simple to complex	3.4%	14.3%	37.0%	31.1%	14.3%
4. Passage contains a pre-reading activity such as giving the title or illustration and asking the students to guess its subject matter	12.6%	13.4%	35.3%	23.5%	15.1%

5. Reading materials contain discussion exercises after singing a song or reciting a poem given in the text	2.5%	4.2%	14.3%	38.7%	40.3%
6. Guidance given for exercises are appropriate to the level of students	0.8%	10.1%	29.4%	43.7%	16.0%
7. There is variety in exercises	0.8%	5.9%	29.4%	37.0%	26.9%
8. Other language skills are also integrated into the exercises of comprehension	8.4%	13.4%	34.5%	26.9%	16.8%

Most of the comprehension strategies were found to be more or less available in the given reading materials while only a few of these materials did not include or slightly touched them.

The mean score on indicators of comprehension by language is presented in Table 47.

Table 47: Comprehension by language

Language	Students are asked to read out a lesson and are asked questions about that	Understanding of lesson promoting exercises are included in the material	Order of sentences is simple to complex	Passage contains a pre-reading activity such as giving the title or illustration and asking the students to guess its subject matter	Reading materials contain discussion exercises after singing a song or reciting a poem given in the text	Guidance given for exercises are appropriate to the level of students	There is variety in exercises	Other language skills are also integrated into the exercises of comprehension
Nepali	3	3	2	2	3	2	3	2
Athara Magarat	4	4	3	3	4	4	3	4
Awadhi	4	4	4	3	4	4	4	4
Bajjika	4	3	3	4	4	2	4	3
Bantawa	2	2	1	1	2	1	2	2
Bhojpuri	4	4	3	3	4	4	3	3
Chamling	4	3	3	1	4	3	2	2
Dhimal	3	3	4	4	3	3	3	3
Gurung	3	3	2	2	3	3	3	2
Limbu	4	4	4	3	4	4	4	4
Magar Dhoot	4	3	3	3	4	2	4	2
Maithili	3	3	3	1	2	2	2	1
Mugali	1	4	4	3	1	3	3	0
Nepal Bhasa	3	4	3	3	4	4	3	4
Rajbanshi	3	3	1	1	3	2	1	2
Sunuwar	3	3	3	3	3	3	4	3
Tamang Devnagari	3	3	3	3	4	3	2	2
Tamang Sambhota	2	2	2	1	4	2	3	1
Tharu	3	2	2	2	3	2	3	3
Tharu madhyachhetra	4	4	3	3	4	3	4	2
Yakkha	2	2	1	2	3	2	2	2

On the basis of the first indicator which reads *'students are asked to read out a lesson and are asked questions about that'.* The textbooks for Tharu Madhyachhetra, Athara Magarat, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika, Bhojpuri and Chamling are rated (4) in this indicator. Nepali, Thauru, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Devnagari, Dhimal, Gurung, Sunuwar, Maithili and *Rajbanshi* are rated (3) whereas Tamang Sambhota, Bantawa and Yakkha are rated (2) and Mugali is rated as (1).

'Understanding of lesson promoting exercises is included in the material' is the second indicator in this regard. According to this, Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Athara Magarat, Limbu, Awadhi, Bhojpuri are rated (4); Nepali, Tamang Devnagari, Magar Dhoot, Bajjika, Chamling, Dhimal, Gurung, Sunuwar, Maithili, Rajbanshi are rated (3); Tharu, Tamang Sambhota, Bantawa and Yakkha are rated (2).

On the basis of the third indicator that goes 'order of sentences is simple to complex', the textbooks for Mugali, Limbu, Awadhi and Dhimal are rated (4) whereas Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Devnagari, Athara Magarat, Magar Dhoot Bajjika, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Sunuwar and Maithili are rated (3). Likewise, Nepali, Tharu, Tamang Sambhota and Gurung are rated (2) and Bantawa, Rajbanshi and Yakkha are rated (1).

The fourth indicator is whether the *'passage contains a pre-reading activity such as giving the title or illustration and asking the students to guess its subject matter'.* In this regard the mean score of the textbooks forBajjika and Dhimal is (4). It is (3) for Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Devnagari Athara Magarat, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bhojpuri and Sunuwar. For the textbooks in Nepali, Tharu, Gurung and Yakkha the mean score is (2) whereas it is (1) for Tamang Sambhota, Bantawa, Chamling, Maithili and Rajbanshi.

The fifth indicator is whether 'reading materials contain discussion exercises after singing a song or reciting a poem given in the text'. In terms of this indicator, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Devnagari, Tamang Sambhota, Athara Magarat, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika, Bhojpuri, Chamling are rated (4). Likewise Nepali, Tharu, Dhimal, Gurung, Sunuwar, Rajbanshi and Yakkha are rated (3) whereas Bantawa and Maithili are rated (2) and Mugali is rated (1).

In terms of the sixth indicator, which goes 'guidance given for exercises are appropriate to the level of students'; Nepal Bhasa, Athara Magarat, Limbu, Awadhi and Bhojpuri are rated (4). Similarly, Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Tamang Devnagari, Chamling, Dhimal, Gurung and Sunuwar are rated (3). Nepali, Tharu, Tamang Sambhota, Magar Dhoot, Bajjika, Maithili, Rajbanshi and Yakkha are rated (2) and Bantawa is rated (1)

The seventh indicator is whether 'there is variety in exercises'. The mean score (4) is assigned to Tharu Madhyachhetra, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika and Sunuwar. The same is (3) for Nepali, Mugali, Tharu, Nepal Bhasa, Tamang Sambhota, Athara Magarat, Bhojpuri, Dhimal and Gurung. Tamang Devnagari, Bantawa, Chamling, Maithili and Yakkha are rated (2) in contrast to Rajbanshi which is rated (1).

Nepal Bhasa, Athara Magarat, Limbu, and Awadhi are rated (4) in terms of eighth indicator which is whether 'other language skills are also integrated into the exercises of comprehension'. Tharu, Bajjika, Bhojpuri, Dhimal and Sunuwar are rated (3) in this indicator; Nepali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Tamang Devnagari, Magar Dhoot, Bantawa, Chamling, Gurung, Rajbanshi and Yakkha are rated (2); Tamang Sambhota and Maithili are rated (1) and Mugali is rated (0).

The mean score on the indicators of comprehension by grades is presented in Table 48 as following:

Table 48: Comprehension by grades

Language	Grade	Students are asked to read out a lesson and are asked questions about that	Understanding of lesson promoting exercises are included in the material	Order of sentences is simple to complex	Passage contains a pre-reading activity such as giving the title or illustration and asking the students to guess its subject matter	Reading materials contain discussion exercises after singing a song or reciting a poem given in the text	Guidance given for exercises are appropriate to the level of students	There is variety in exercises	Other language skills are also integrated into the exercises of comprehension
Nepali	1	3	3	2	2	3	2	3	2
	2	3	3	2	2	3	3	3	2
	3	2	3	2	2	3	2	3	2
Mother Tongue	1	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
	2	3	3	3	2	3	3	3	2
	3	3	3	3	2	3	3	3	2

On the basis of the first, second, fourth, fifth and sixth indicator, the mean score for the all the grades is (3) whereas the same is (2) for the indicators three, four and eight for all the textbooks. As per Table 48, the textbooks for all the grades are found more or less similar and average in most of the indicators.

Table 49: Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of comprehension in Nepali textbooks

Publisher	Students are asked to read out a lesson and are asked questions about that	Understanding of lesson promoting exercises are included in the material	Order of sentences is simple to complex	Passage contains a pre-reading activity such as giving the title or illustration and asking the students to guess its subject matter	Reading materials contain discussion exercises after singing a song or reciting a poem given in the text	Guidance given for exercises are appropriate to the level of students	There is variety in exercises	Other language skills are also integrated into the exercises of comprehension
Atharai	2	3	3	4	3	2	2	2
Allied	3	2	2	1	3	3	3	2
Asia	3	3	2	1	3	3	4	2
Airawati	3	2	2	2	2	1	2	2
Bhundi Puran	3	3	1	3	3	2	3	2
Cambridge	3	3	2	2	3	3	3	2
CDC	**3**	**4**	**3**	**2**	**4**	**3**	**4**	**3**
Ekta	3	3	3	2	3	3	3	3
JBD	1	2	1	2	2	2	2	2
Megha	3	3	2	2	2	2	2	2
Pragya	2	4	1	3	4	2	2	2
Pustak Prakashan	3	3	2	2	2	3	3	2
Sangam	2	2	1	2	2	1	1	0
Satyal	3	3	3	2	3	3	3	3

Simrik	2	2	1	0	2	2	2	2
Sunrise	3	3	3	3	4	1	3	2
Times	4	4	1	2	4	3	3	1
Unique	2	3	2	1	1	3	2	2
United	1	3	2	1	3	3	3	3
Vidyarthi	4	3	2	0	4	3	3	3

Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of comprehension in Nepali subject books is presented in Table 49.On the basis of the first indicator, which reads *'students are asked to read out a lesson and are asked questions about that'* thetextbooks from JBD and United are rated (1) which means they have only lightly touched the feature. Likewise, Unique, Simrik, Sangam, Pragya and Atharai are rated (2) which means that the features are *included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.*

The textbooks from Allied, Asia, Airawati, Bhundi puran, Cambridge, Megha, Pustak Prakashan, Satyal, Ekta and Sunrise are rated (3), i.e., the features are '*appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.* The textbooks from Vidyarthi and Times are rated (4) which means the features are *thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.*

The second indicator is whether *'understanding of lesson promoting exercises are included in the material'.* The textbooks fromsSimrik, Sangam, JBD, Airawati and Allied are rated *(2)* which means that the features are *included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.* Conversely, the textbooks fromVidyarthi, United, Unique, Sunrise, Satyal, Ekta, Pustak Prakashan, Megha, Cambridge, Bhundi puran, Atharai and Asia are rated (3) which means the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Lastly, Times, Pragya and CDC publications are rated (4) i.e., the features arethoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.

The third indicator is whether the *'order of sentences is simple to complex'.* Based on this indicator the textbooks from *Times, Simrik, Sangam, Bhundi puran, JBD and Pragya are rated (1)* which means they have only lightly touched the feature.Similarly, the textbooks from Vidyarthi, Unite Nepal, Unique international, Pustak Prakashan, Allied, Asia, Airawati, Cambridge and Megha are rated (2) i.e., they have included the features but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. The textbooks from Atharai, CDC, Sunrise and Satyal, Ekta (rated 3) appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.

'Passage contains a pre-reading activity such as giving the title or illustration and asking the students to guess its subject matter' is the fourth indicator to evaluate the textbooks. Vidyarthi, and Simrik publications were rated (0) that means these textbooks do not include this area at all.Allied, Asia, United and Unique have only lightly touched. The textbooks from Airawati, Cambridge, CDC, JBD, Megha, Pustak Prakashan, Times, Satyal, Ekta, Sangam have '*included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations'.* Whereas, Sunrise, Pragya and Bhundi puran are rated (3) which means the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. The only textbook from Atharai is rated (4) which means the features arethoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order in this.

The fifth indicator is whether the *'reading materials contain discussion exercises after singing a song or reciting a poem given in the text'.* The textbooks from Unique is rated (1) that means it has only lightly touched the area. Similarly, Simrik, Sangam, Pustak Prakashan, Megha, JBD and Airawati have included the features but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. Atharai, Allied, Asia, Bhundi puran,

Cambridge, Satyal, Ekta and United are rated (3) which means the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Lastly, the textbooks from Vidyarthi, Times, Sunrise, Pragya, and CDC are rated (4). It means they havethoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.

According to the sixth indicator which reads 'g*uidance given for exercises are appropriate to the level of students',* the textbooks from Airawati, Sunrise and Sangam have only lightly touched the area.Atharai, Simrik, Pragya, Megha, JBD, Bhundi puranhave included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. Similarly, Allied, Asia, Cambridge, Vidyarthi, United, Unique, Times, Satyal, Ekta, Pustak Prakashan and CDC textbooks are rated (3), i.e., the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.

The seventh indicator is whether *'there is variety in exercises'.* Sangam is rated (1), i.e., it has only lightly touched the feature. The publications from Unique, Simrik, Pragya, Megha, JBD, Atharai and Airawati are rated (2) which means it has *included the feature but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustration.* Similarly, the textbooks from Vidyarthi, United, Times, Sunrise, Satyal, Ekta, Pustak Prakashan, Cambridge, Allied and Bhundi puran are rated (3) i.e., the features *appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.* Lastly, Asia, and CDC publications as rated (4) have *thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.*

'Other language skills are also integrated into the exercises of comprehension' is the eighth indicator to evaluate the comprehension of the Nepali textbooks from different publications. The textbooks from Sangam are rated (0), i.e., they do not include this area at all. The textbooks published from Times have only lightly touched the area. Likewise, Unique, Sunrise, Simrik, Pustak Prakashan, Pragya, Megha, JBD, Cambridge, Bhundi puran, Airawati, Asia, Allied and Atharai publications have included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. In contrast, CDC, Satyal, Ekta, United and Vidyarthi publications are rated (3) which means the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.

Table 50: Comprehension in CDC Nepali textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Students are asked to read out a lesson and are asked questions about that	Understanding of lesson promoting exercises are included in the material	Order of sentences is simple to complex	Passage contains a pre-reading activity such as giving the title or illustration and asking the students to guess its subject matter	Reading materials contain discussion exercises after singing a song or reciting a poem given in the text	Guidance given for exercises are appropriate to the level of students	There is variety in exercises	Other language skills are also integrated into the exercises of comprehension
Nepali Speaker	3	3	2	2	3	2	3	2
Non Nepali Speaker	3	4	3	2	4	3	4	3

Comprehension in CDC Nepali subject books was observed from the perspective of Nepali speaking and non-Nepali speaking evaluators. Table 50 shows that from the perspective of evaluator speaking Nepali as mother tongue the CDC Nepali textbooks' mean score is (3) for the indicators 1,2, 5 and 7. The score is (2) for the indicators 3, 4, 6 and 8. From the

perspective of an evaluator speaking Nepali as a second language, the CDC Nepali textbooks' mean score is (4) for the indicators 2, 5 and 7. It is (3) for the indicators 1, 3, 6 and 8 whereas the same is (2) for the indicators 4. Based on the available data we can conclude that the textbooks' mean score on different indicators is higher from the perspective of non-native Nepali speaking evaluator compared to the evaluator speaking Nepali as his/her mother tongue.

In totality, the the study found the following exemplary situations of language in the mother language textbooks:

Bajjika	Class 1: In one place there is a use of Deergha, which doesn't exist in Bazjika language. Ra, La, Na are available in Bajjika but not used in the textbook.
Dhimal	Class 1: 39 lessons in class 1 are more than enough.Writing symbols used are more than the actual phonemes of the language.
	Class 2: There should be consensus in writing the borrowed words in Dhimal. Spelling should be correct and uniform.
	Class 3: There should be uniformity in spelling and punctuations. Spelling should be correct and uniform.
Sunuwar	Class 1, 2 and 3: Uniformity in writing, phonemic inventory and spelling is mandatory.
Limbu	Class 2: Many of the sentences are longer than the level of the students.
Rajbanshi	Class 1: Difficult/technical words used in the lessons require explanation for meaning.
Tamang Devnagari	Class 2: Very limited exercises related to comprehension
	Class 3: Single letter and multiple letter are not sequenced.
Tamang Sambhota	Class 1: The words/terms commonly used in Tamang community are not used (e.g. hinna, mhi, hyulsa etc.).
	Class: 2: Tibetan words are used in Tamang textbooks. The language commonly spoken by Tamangs is not used.
	Class: 3: Exact Tamang words are not used in some places. The same word is spelt in two or more different ways. Number of words in a sentence is more than the student's level.
Tharu	Class 2: Very limited exercises related to comprehension are present. Needs addition of exercises promoting comprehension.
	Class 3: Single letter and multiple letter are not sequenced.

Furthermore, the publisher wise Nepali textbooks also revealed the following insights from the analyses:

Atharai	Class 1: Dictation should be added. Exercise to increase vocabulary should be added. Students should be made to use the familiar words in sentences.
	Class 2: Questions are required in exercises. Instructions of the exercises are long and complex. Similar types of exercises are present. Exercises should be linked to lesson.
	Class 3: Exercises are more focused on writing skills. Needs exercises on other skills too.
Allied	Class 1: Vocabulary, comprehension should be included.
	Class 2: Emphasis should be given to all skills of language, not the writing skill only.
Airawati	Class 1: Sentences are long, content and language should be edited in terms of housestyle of CDC. Longer lessons should be reduced.
	Class 3: New Nepali language should be used. Should follow CDC housestyle. Lacks exercises on listening and speaking.
Bhundi Puran	Class 2: Letters for the children are very small. They should be enlarged to adopt for early graders.
Cambridge	Class 1: No paragraph was included to develop comprehension level but questions were asked

	in the same level. Spellings should be according to CDC house style.
	Class 3: Short questions on comprehension should be provided for exercise.
Ekta	Class 1 and 2: Spellings are not following the house style of CDC.
JBD	Class 1 and 3: Complex sentence structure should be made easier.
	Class 2: Language and sentence structure are found to be complex and need simplification.
Sangam	Class 1: Should edit the spelling errors in words, structure and presentation.
	Class 2 and 3: Attention should be paid on level of class, forming simple words and and comprehension according to guided language structure.
Satyal	Class 1: Spellings are not following the house style of CDC.
Simrik	Class 1: Exercises should be arranged into simple to complex. Simplicity should be maintained while in sentence structure. Sentence with limited number of words should be made.
	Class 2: Exercises should be arranged into simple to complex. Simplicity should be maintained while in sentence structure. Sentence with limited number of words should be made.Lessons should be made short.House style of CDC should be followed especially in spellings.
Sunrise	Class 1 and 2: Listening and reading activities should be included.
Times	Class 1: Four language skills should be included.
	Class 2: Exercises related to all the four language skills should be included in the lessons.
Unique	Class 1: There is need to adjust discussion, telling, re-telling, writing and dictation related questions in the lessons.
	Class 2: Text should be readjusted for children whose mother tongue is other than Nepali.
	Class 3: Words in a sentence, language structure and paragraph writing should be as simple and short as possible.
United	Class 1: Short words should be used.
	Class 2: Sound recognition, word formation, and grammer and punctuation need improvement.
Vidyarthi	Class 1: Lessons are as per the level of private schools. Some sentences are lengthy and complex for early graders.
	Class 2: Language is difficult for early graders and sentences are lengthy. Comprehension practices are needed in more amounts.
	Class 3: Some lessons should be made easier. More diversity should be made in the lessons for comprehension.

Private publishers' Nepali textbooks seem to have problems in case of their difficulty level and longer sentences for respective grades.

4.2.2   Contents

Contents of the prescribed textbooks are reviewed for identifying their extent of level appropriateness. Content appropriateness are assessed with respect to ten point framework for their presence in the textbooks. Text lengths, spelling, punctuation marks, difficulty level of the contents, activity based contents, picture characteristics, color of the pictures are the major aspects of content analysis.

Table 51 presents distribution of contents of the textbooks in line with level appropriateness to early grade children.

Table 51: Percentage distribution of indicators of contents in textbooks

Content indicators	not included this area at all (0)	Only lightly touched (1)	Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (2)	appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps (3)	thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order (4)
1. Text lengths are appropriate as per grade level	0.0%	18.5%	32.8%	31.1%	17.6%
2. Reading material is accurate in terms of spelling according to the house style of CDC	6.7%	6.7%	30.3%	37.8%	18.5%
3. Punctuation marks are used correctly	0.0%	3.4%	21.0%	45.4%	30.3%
4. Difficulty level of the contents is appropriate to the level	2.5%	19.3%	26.9%	35.3%	16.0%
5. Activity oriented contents are selected	0.0%	5.9%	34.5%	36.1%	23.5%
6. Ratio of pictures to the text is adequate	0.8%	4.2%	29.4%	37.8%	27.7%
7. Pictures are related to the content	0.0%	2.5%	23.5%	43.7%	30.3%
8. Pictures are placed in appropriate place	0.0%	2.5%	25.2%	37.8%	34.5%
9. Shape and size of the pictures is appropriate to the grade/age level	0.0%	9.2%	20.2%	37.8%	32.8%
10. Pictures used are multi-colored and well-illustrated	28.6%	8.4%	19.3%	25.2%	18.5%

Table 51 shows a clear picture of content appropriateness of the textbooks. Thirty to thirty five percent of the textbooks were reported to have used punctuation marks, content related pictures, placement of the pictures and shape and size of the pictures thoroughly and logical order in the textbooks published of early graders. However, 28.6 percent of the reviewed books do not have pictures with multi-colored and well-illustrated. Considerable number of textbooks (18.5% and 19.3%) have addressed very little about text length and difficulty level of the contents as per grade level.

Remaining indicator of content evaluation like text length, following house rule of CDC for length and spelling, use of punctuation marks, activity oriented contents, adequacy of the ration of pictures in the text, use of content related pictures, placement of the picture in appropriate place, use of grade level pictures were observed in all the evaluated Nepali textbooks but not in a balanced way and remaining gap for their adequacy and logical sequencing.

Textbooks of different mother languages were evaluated using ten indicators. Responses regarding these indicators are converted into mean score and presented in a table for comparison. Table 52 below presents comparative picture of the languages with respect to the indicators.

Table 52: Contents by language

language	Text lengths are appropriate as per grade level	Reading material is accurate in terms of spelling according to the house style of CDC	Punctuation marks are used correctly	Difficulty level of the contents is appropriate to the level	Activity oriented contents are selected	Ratio of pictures to the text is adequate	Pictures are related to the content	Pictures are placed in appropriate place	Shape and size of the pictures is appropriate to the grade/age level	Pictures used are multi-colored and well-illustrated
Nepali	2	2	3	2	3	3	3	3	3	3
Athar Magar	3	3	4	3	3	3	4	3	3	0
Awadhi	4	3	3	3	4	4	4	4	4	1
Bajjika	4	4	2	4	3	3	4	4	4	0
Bantawa	2	2	2	1	1	1	2	2	2	0
Bhojpuri	3	3	4	4	3	2	4	4	4	0
Chamling	3	3	2	3	4	3	3	3	2	0
Dhimal	2	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	2
Gurung	3	2	3	2	2	3	2	2	3	0
Limbu	3	4	4	3	4	4	4	4	4	1
Magar Dhoot	3	3	3	3	3	4	4	4	4	2
Maithili	2	2	3	3	1	2	2	2	3	0
Mugali	4	4	4	4	4	3	4	4	4	0
Nepal Bhasa	3	4	4	4	4	4	3	4	4	4
Rajbanshi	2	2	2	2	2	3	3	3	3	3
Sunuwar	2	2	4	2	4	4	4	4	3	0
Tamang Devnagari	4	4	4	4	3	3	2	3	4	0
Tamang Sambhota	2	2	2	2	2	2	4	4	3	1
Tharu	3	3	2	2	2	2	3	3	3	2
Tharu madhyachhetra	4	3	4	3	4	4	4	4	3	0
Yakkha	4	4	3	2	3	2	1	1	1	0

Regarding evaluation of the contents the first indicator is whether 'the text length is appropriate as per the grade level'. As shown in Table 52, Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Tamang Devnagari, Awadhi, Bajjika, and Yakkha language textbooks have text length as per grade level. However, Nepali, Tamang Sambhota, Bantawa, Dhimal, Sunuwar, Maithili, Rajbanshi have maintained this indicator of making text length appropriate as per the grade level very little in some chapters only but not adequately.

The second indicator of content evaluation is whether the 'reading material is accurate in terms of spelling according to the house style of CDC'. Regarding this indicator, six languages (Mugali, Nepal, Tamang Devnagari, Limbu and Bajjika) are found to have followed house style of CDC for maintaining reading materials accurately in terms of prescribed spelling.

However, Nepali, Tamang Sambhota, Bantawa, Gurung, Sunuwar, Maitili and Rajbanshi language textbooks have addressed this issue or indicator in some lessons and this issue is not adequately and properly addressed in the early grade textbooks. Similarly, Tharu, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Athar Magarat, Magardoot, Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Chamling and Dhimal language textbooks have followed the house style of CDC in most of the chapters but some gaps were reported by the resource persons of the concerned languages.

The third indicator applied to evaluate the content appropriateness is 'use of punctuation marks correctly'. Regarding this indicator, eight language textbooks (Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal, TamangDevnagari, AtharMagarat, Limbu, Bhojpuri, and Sunuwar) are found to use punctuation marks correctly. In contrary to it, Tharu, TamangSambhota, AtharMagarat, Bantawa, Bajjika, Chamling and Rajbanshi language textbooks have minimal use of punctuation marks correctly. It is indicative that these textbooks need more revision to make them as per the level of early grade learners. Other language textbooks have used punctuation marks more than these books. However, they are not perfect and logical as per the grade level.

The fourth indicator is '*difficulty level of the contents appropriate to the level'*. Only four languages (Mugali, Nepal, TamangDevnagari, Bajjika and Bhojpuri language textbooks are found to have difficulty level of the contents appropriate to the level of early grade children. However, Bantawa language textbook has maintained minimum level of content appropriateness almost negligible for early grade children. Similarly, Nepali, Tharu, TamangSambhota, Gurung, Sunuwar, Rajbanshi and Yakkha language textbooks have maintained difficulty level in some of the lessons only. It indicates that maintaining difficulty level was found a problem in most of the mother languages books except four languages mentioned above.

The fifth indicator of content evaluation as per the level is *'selection of activity oriented contents'*. For early grade level children, contents should promote children's activities. Regarding indicator, Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepal, Limbu, Awadhi, Chamling and Sunuwar language textbooks have incorporated activity oriented contents in the textbooks in logical and systematic order.

Bantawa and Maithili language textbooks are very poor to selecting activity oriented contents for early grade children. Moreover, four other language textbooks (Tharu, Tamang Sambhota, Gurung and Rajbanshi) have included some contents in some of the chapters only. Remaining languages have selected activity oriented contents in most of the texts but not logically and sequentially arranged.

The sixth indicator of content evaluation is *'adequacy of the ratio of pictures to the text'*. Tharumadhyachhetra, Nepal, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, awadhi and Sunuwar languages have their early grade textbooks with the ratio of adequate pictures in all the chapters in the textbooks. However, Bantawa language textbooks have very negligible number of pictures in the textbooks. Five language textbooks (Tharu, Tamang Sambhota, Bhojpuri, Maithili and Yakkha) have pictures in some of the lessons but not in all the lessons in a balanced way. Remaining languages have pictures in all the lessons but they are not ordered in a logical and sequential order as per the level of the children. The seventh indicator for evaluation of the content is whether pictures are related to the content.

Content specific pictures help the children learn lessons more easily and the learning remains for a long period. Regarding this indicator, Mugali, Tharumadhyachhetra, TamangSambhota, AtharMagarat, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika, Bhojpuri and Sunuwar languages have their textbooks with content specific pictures in the text and exercises. It shows that nearly 50 percent of the languages have included content related pictures in the lessons. Yakkha language textbook has very minimum number of content related pictures in the textbook.

Likewise, four other languages (Tamang Devnagari, Bantawa, Gurung and Maithili) have their textbooks with content related pictures only in some of the lessons not adequate as per the nature of content and level of students. Remaining six languages have pictures in

majority of the lessons not adequate for early grade children and some gaps also found in them.

The eighth indicator is whether the 'pictures are placed in appropriate place in the lessons'. Regarding this indicator, the Yakkha language book has slightly meet the indicator but it was negligible in number. However, other languages like Mugali, Tharu madhyachhetra, Nepal, Tamang Sambhota, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika, Bhojpuri, and Sunuwar have fully maintained this indicator in their textbooks. Similarly, Bantawa, Gurung and Maithili languages have use in some of the lessons and they are inadequate for early grade textbooks. Is Shape and size of the pictures appropriate to the grade/age level of the children? It has been the ninth indicator for the evaluation of contents in the textbook.

Regarding the size of the pictures, which is the ninth indicator for evaluation of the contents, in the textbook of mother languages, Mugali, Nepal, Tamang Devnagari, Magar Dhoot, Limbu, Awadhi, Bajjika and Bhojpuri textbooks are found to have appropriate size of the pictures in the lessons. In Yakkha language textbooks, the sizes of the pictures are not suitable as per the grade level of the children. Resource persons recorded that very few of such books have met this indicator.

Bantawa and Chamling languages have to some extent adopted the indicator more than the Yakkha language books. Majority of the languages (remaining 10 out of 21) are found to have addressed this indicator in the sense that majority of the lessons have appropriate size of the pictures in the lessons but there is some problems of logical sequence and balance among the lessons. The tenth indicator of content evaluation is *'whether pictures used are multi-colored and well-illustrated'*. Multi-colored and well-illustrated pictures motivate younger children in reading the materials.

As shown in Table majority of the mother languages (12 out of 21) such as Mugali, Tharu madhyachhetra, Tamang Devnagari, Athara Magarat, Bantawa, Bajjika, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Gurung, Sunuwar, Maithili and Yakkha language textbooks do not have multi-colored well illustrated pictures in the textbooks at all. Moreover, Tamang Sambhota, Limbu, Awadhi language textbooks also have very minimal use of multi-colored and illustrated pictures suitable for early graders. This indicator is to some extent applied in the textbooks of Tharu, Magar Dhoot and Dimal languages.

Table also shows that textbooks of Nepali and Rajbanshi languages are also found to have multi-colored and well-illustrated pictures in majority of the lessons. However, the problem is also there not being balanced and gaps in the logical sequence as per the level of the children. Nepal Bhasa textbooks are reported to have addressed the indicator of contents appropriately.

Regarding the contents in the mother language, the following insights and suggestions were found:

Awadhi	Class 1: Reduction in lengthy senteces is needed. Lessons on consonants and vowels should be broken and made shorter, eg. In lesson 15.
	Class 2: More pictures are needed.
	Class 3: Reduction in lengthy senteces is needed.
Bantawa	Class 1: Pictures need to be colorful and related to Bantawa society and culture.
	Class 2: Pictures are not as prescribed by the CDC.
	Class 3: Colorful pictures are needed.
Bajjika	Class 1: Colorful illustrations, Not enough illustration as compared to texts.
Bhojpuri	Class 2: Still need to bring down to early graders' level.
	Class 3: Attractive pictures are needed in lessons.
Dhimal	Class 1: More pictures be used in class one to help the students understand the content.
Sunuwar	Class 1: Pictures used are good but not colorful. It may create color-blindness, so multi-colored pictures are recommended to be used.

	Class 2: Multi-colored pictures are recommended to be used.
	Class 3:Multi-colored pictures are recommended to be used.
Limbu	Class 1: Local objects/animals are better to be used in place of elephant, horse or rhinoceros.
Rajbanshi	Class 1: Idiom and proverbs are not explained; the objectives of some of the lessons is not clear. Subject matter is not able to create curiosity among students.
	Class 2: Matching (picture and word) exercises should be managed on the same page.
	Class 3: Punctuation marks should be properly used.
Tamang Devnagari	Class 3: Clear and multi-colored pictures should be kept.
Tamang Sambhota	Class 1: The story presented with pictures is appropriate for grade one. This is lacking.
	Class 2: Sentences are longer than the students' level. Picture size is smaller than appropriate.
	Class 3: Additional effort is required to select better content. Pictures are not qualitative.
Tharu	Class 2: In page 22 there is a picture of a boy where it should be a girl's and vice versa.
	Class 3: Three lessons have no pictures/illustrations. No colorful. There is an error in the exercise 3 of lesson 1. In page 23, the word Satkar is shown as respect, but in Tharu it denotes stringent.

Regarding overall comparison of the mother tongue textbooks across the given indicator, Mugali, Nepal Bhasa language textbooks have addressed all the indicator except the indicator of multi-colored and well-illustrated pictures in the textbooks of Mugali Language is found absent. Limbu, Awadhi and Bajjika language textbooks also have satisfied majority of the indicator of content evaluation. Remaining language textbooks are reported to be less effective in line with the content evaluation.

Furthermore, the indicators of contents were analysed as per language wise grades in Table 53 as follows:

Table 53: Contents by grades

Language	Grade	Text lengths are appropriate as per grade level	Reading material is accurate in terms of spelling according to the house style of CDC	Punctuation marks are used correctly	Difficulty level of the contents is appropriate to the level	Activity oriented contents are selected	Ratio of pictures to the text is adequate	Pictures are related to the content	Pictures are placed in appropriate place	Shape and size of the pictures is appropriate to the grade/ age level	Pictures used are multi-colored and well-illustrated
Nepali	1	2	2	3	2	3	3	3	3	3	3
	2	2	2	3	2	3	3	3	3	3	3
	3	2	2	3	2	3	3	3	3	3	3
Mother Tongue	1	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	1
	2	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	1
	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	1

As per table 53, there was found difference among Nepali and Mother tongue textbooks in terms of the indicator *text lengths are appropriate as per grade level* because all the grades of Nepali subject were found that it appears in the majority, but not all of the text and/or there is an attempt at logical sequencing, but it is not consistent (rated 2).

This context is better than Nepalitextbooks in all the grades of other 20 mother language textbooks as it appears across most of the text but there may be a few questions about its sequencing (rated 3). However, in case of indicator *picutres used are multi-colored and well illustrated*, mother tongue texbooks were found only lightly touched on and not sequenced in a logical fashion.

Early grade textbooks developed by CDC and private publishers are evaluated in their content appropriateness through ten indicators. Responses of the resource persons with respect to the different indicators are presented in mean score in Table 54 below:

Table 54: Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of contents in Nepali textbooks

Publisher	Text lengths are appropriate as per grade level	Reading material is accurate in terms of spelling according to the house style of CDC	Punctuation marks are used correctly	Difficulty level of the contents is appropriate to the level	Activity oriented contents are selected	Ratio of pictures to the text is adequate	Pictures are related to the content	Pictures are placed in appropriate place	Shape and size of the pictures is appropriate to the grade/age level	Pictures used are multi-colored and well-illustrated
Atharai	2	3	3	2	2	3	3	4	4	4
Allied	1	3	3	1	2	3	3	2	2	3
Asia	1	4	4	1	2	4	3	3	3	4
Airawati	1	2	3	1	2	2	3	3	3	3
Bhundi Puran	2	0	3	1	2	3	3	3	3	4
Cambridge	3	2	3	2	2	3	3	3	2	1
CDC	**3**	**3**	**4**	**3**	**4**	**3**	**4**	**4**	**4**	**3**
Ekta	2	1	2	3	3	4	3	3	3	4
JBD	1	1	2	1	2	2	2	2	2	3
Megha	2	2	3	2	3	2	2	2	3	3
Pragya	2	3	3	2	3	3	3	2	3	2
Pustak Prakashan	3	2	3	3	3	3	2	2	2	2
Sangam	2	3	3	1	2	1	2	2	1	1
Satya	2	1	2	3	3	4	3	3	3	4
Simrik	1	2	3	1	2	2	2	2	2	2
Sunrise	1	2	2	1	4	3	4	3	3	4
Times	3	2	3	2	3	2	2	2	2	3
Unique	2	0	2	2	3	3	3	3	2	3
United	3	2	3	2	3	3	3	3	3	3
Vidyarthi	2	3	4	3	2	2	3	3	3	3

Table 54 depicts the picture of the assessment of the books based on different indicator related to content appropriate for early grade readers. Appropriateness of the contents is evaluated through ten indicators. The first indicator of the evaluation on content appropriateness is, 'whether the text lengths are appropriate as per grade level'. The textbooks published by 10 publishers such as Allied, Asia, Airawati, JBD, Simrik, Sunrise, Times, Unique, United, Vidyarthi are found to be less effective in line with text length as per grade level. They have maintained text length as per grade level in very minimum level. In contrary to it, Cambridge, CDC Pustak Prakashan, Times, United have maintained this indicator in majority of the cases in their textbooks. However, there is also gap to maintain text length as per grade level. Remaining publishers have maintained this indicator less effectively than the publishers mentioned above.

Whether the reading material is accurate in terms of spelling according to the house style of CDC has been the second indicator of the content evaluation. As shown in Table Asia publication has fully maintained this indicator. In contrary to it, Bhundi puran and Unique

publication have not maintained this indicator in their textbooks at all. Atharai, Allied, CDC, Pragya, Sangam and Vidyarthi publications have followed the indicator of following house style of CDC accurately in their reading materials in majority of the cases with some gaps to maintain. The other publishers have followed the house style of CDC less than the above mentioned publishers.

The third indicator is, 'whether the punctuation marks are used correctly' in the textbooks. Asia, CDC and Vidyarthi publishers are found to have used punctuation marks correctly in their textbooks. The other 12 publishers such as Atharai, Allied, Airawati, Bhundi puran, Cambridge, Megha, Pragya, Pustak Prakashan, Sangam, Simrik, Times and United have maintained this indicator in majority of cases remaining some gaps to satisfy the indicator fully. Remaining four publishers JBD, Satyal, Ekta, Sunrise and Unique also have maintained this indicator in some of the lessons that need more revision than others.

'Whether difficulty level of the contents is appropriate to the level' has been the fourth indicator of the content evaluation. The early grade textbooks published by Allied, Asia, Airawati, Bhundi puran, JBD, Sangam, Simrik and Sunrise publications have maintained difficulty level of the contents in their textbooks very less appropriate to students' level. CDC, Pustak Prakashan, Satyal, Ekta and Vidyarthi publications have maintained the indicator of level appropriateness of the contents in majority of the lessons but remains some gaps for their logical sequence and balance. Remaining publishers also have maintained this indicator in some of the lessons. It means there remain some problems in these textbooks with respect to level appropriateness of the contents.

Early grade readers should have activity related contents in their reading materials. Following this principle the fifth indicator of content selection is made whether contents are selected based on activity. The early grade textbooks published by CDC and Sunrise were found to have fully followed the indicator of selection of activity oriented contents in their textbooks. Megha, Pragya, Pustak Prakashan, Satyal, Ekta, Times, Unique and United are found to have satisfied this indicator in majority of the lessons but not in all lessons. The other remaining publications have maintained this indicator in some of the lessons. It indicates that they need major modifications in the contents to make them activity based for the children.

Remaining five indicator for content evaluation are related to level size and other characteristics of pictures appropriate to early grade readers. The sixth indicator is, 'whether ratio of pictures is adequate to the text.' Asia and Satyal, Ekta publications have met this indicator fully. Atharai, Allied, Bhundi puran, Cambridge, CDC, Pragya, Pustak Prakashan, Sunrise, Unique and United have managed ratio of the pictures in their textbooks adequate to the text in almost all the lessons but remains the problems of balance and logical sequence. Remaining publishers (Airawati, JBD, Megha, Sangam, Simrik, Times, Vidyarthi) have maintained this indicator in some of the lessons only. It indicated that they have to revise their textbooks to maintain this indicator. Whether pictures are related to the contents has been the seventh indicator of content evaluation. Pictures related to the contents make the early grade readers easier to understand and comprehend the lessons. As shown in Table 54, textbooks published by CDC and Sunrise are found to have pictures in the lessons are more related to the contents.

Pictures are related to the content JBD, Megha, Pustak Prakashan, Sangam, Simrik and Times are found to have pictures related to the contents in some cases not in all lessons. It is indicative that they need more revision in the pictures so as to make pictures appropriate to the contents. Remaining publishers have met this indicator in almost of the lessons. However, there is also gap in balancing and sequencing of the pictures in the lessons. The

eighth indicator of content evaluation is, 'whether pictures are placed in appropriate place.' Atharai and CDC has maintained this indicator fully.

Asia, Airawati, Bhundi puran, Cambridge, Satyal, Ekta, Sunrise , Unique , United, Vidyarthi publications have placed pictures in appropriate places in most of the lessons but remains some gap in maintaining balance and appropriateness. Remaining publishers have maintained this indicator in some of the lessons only. Shape and size of the pictures also counts for making the lessons understanding to the children.

The ninth indicator has been whether the shape and size of the pictures is appropriate to the grade/age level. Atharai and CDC have maintained this indicator fully. It means shape and size of the picture in the textbooks are appropriate to understand the lessons by the children. In contrast to it Sangam publication has maintained this indicator in a few lessons. Asia, Airawati, Bhundi puran, Megha, Pragya Satyal, Ekta, Sunrise, United, Vidyarthi publication have maintained this indicator in majority of the lessons.

However, they need some revision to make fully adaptable to this indicator. Remaining publishers have maintained this in some of the lessons only. It means they need more revision to meet this indicator in their textbooks. Well colored pictures attract the children for the reading materials. The last indicator for the evaluation of the content is whether the pictures are multi-colored and well-illustrated. Atharai, Asia, Bhundi puran, Satyal, Ekta, Sunrise publications have multi-colored and well-illustrated pictures in their textbooks. It means they have maintained this indicator fully.

In contrast to it, Cambridge and Sangam publications have minimum pictures with multi-colored and well-illustrated in their textbooks. It indicated that they need more revision in the pictures. Allied, Airawati, CDC, JBD, Megha, Times, Unique, United, Vidyarthi publications have majority of the lessons in the textbooks with multi-colored and well-illustrated pictures. Remaining publications such as Pragya, Pustak Prakashan and Simrik have maintained this indicator in their textbooks very little. It indicated that they need major revision in their textbooks.

While comparing publication wise textbooks through different indicators, it is clear that textbooks published by CDC for early grade children are comparatively better than the others. Among ten indicators, five are fully met and other five indicators are addressed in majority of the cases regarding content appropriateness as per the level of early grade children. Comparatively better textbooks published by other publishers are Atharai, Asia, United, Vidyarthi, Satyal, Ekta, and Sunrise in decreasing order of following the indicator of content appropriateness.

The insights from the evaluators in terms of level of contents in the publication and class wise Nepali textbooks were found as follows:

Atharai	Class 1: Long lessons (220 words) are used. Violence related lessons need to be replaced as per child's level and psychology.
	Class 2: Shorter lessons are needed.
	Class 3: Some lessons are too long, even upto 328 words per lesson, and even upto 16 words per sentence are used.
Asia	Class 3: The first figure in the lesson 'viveki bandar' does not match the contex and place.
Airawati	Class 1: Lesson should be made short. It should be made as per CDC's housestyle and spelling style.
	Class 2: Lesson should be made short. It should be made as per CDC's housestyle and spelling style.
	Class 3: Subject matter should be reduced to lesser difficulty level.
Cambridge	Class 1: Letter recognition exercise should be placed prior to the lesson.
	Class 3: Lessons/ exercise are above the standard. Pictures are not natural.
JBD	Class 2: Lessons are long, language editing is required.

Megha	Class 3: Short and simple lessons should be made.
Pragya	Class 1: Diversity in contents is needed.
	Class 2: Simple sentences, short lessons and simple subject matter should be made.
Pustak Prakashan	Class 1: Pictures should be made clear and attractive.
	Class 2: Number of lessons is too high, it should be under 16-18 lessons per book.
Sangam	Class 1: Shape, size and number of the figures/pictures should be improved since these books contain less figures and small size.
	Class 2: Presentation of the contents should be of good standard.
Simrik	Class 1: Content should be matched with class level.
	Class 2: Content should be matched with class level.
Unique	Class 1: In lesson 15, the picture on the front should be replaced with the picture at the back. Short and simple sentences should be used.
	Class 2: There should be balance among the size of the lessons, events and contents. Pictures should be enlarged.
	Class 3: Some contents are ambitious and not matching the difficulty level of the level. Even some contents need to be made relevant.
United	Class 1: Figures should be added. Interesting contents are needed.
	Class 2: Lesson six should be replaced by any other lesson of social customs.
Vidyarthi	Class 1: Lengthy lessons should be made short.
	Class 2: Contents should have shorter sentences. Conents should be interesting to read.

Early grade reading textbooks are also assessed by Nepali speaking and non-Nepali speaking resource persons based on the same indicator as mentioned in table 55. The level of contents in CDC Nepali subject books were evaluated from Nepali and non-Nepali speakers as follows:

Table 55: Contents in CDC Nepali textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Text lengths are appropriate as per grade level	Reading material is accurate in terms of spelling according to the house style of CDC	Punctuation marks are used correctly	Difficulty level of the contents is appropriate to the level	Activity oriented contents are selected	Ratio of pictures to the text is adequate	Pictures are related to the content	Pictures are placed in appropriate place	Shape and size of the pictures is appropriate to the grade/age level	Pictures used are multi-colored and well-illustrated
Nepali Speaker	2	2	3	2	3	3	3	3	3	3
Non Nepali Speaker	4	3	4	3	4	4	4	4	4	3

Table 55 also depicts the picture that non-Nepali speaking resource persons rated highly than that of Nepali Speaking resource persons. They agreed that seven indicators are fully met by CDC published textbook and the other three are maximum addressed by them. However, Nepali speaking resource persons accepted seven indicators as applied in majority of the lessons and the other three indicators are partially met by the textbooks.

4.2.3 *Reading Level of Children*

In the reviewed 119 books, Table 56 states the status of the reviewed textbooks concerning the different issues related to the provision of reading materials developed by CDC and other private publishers of Nepal. In the review process an attempt has been made to analysis the subject expert views that enhance the reading ability of the elementary level students.

To find out the textbooks competency, five questions related to reading level of children with a view to raise the ability of student have been adjusted. It contains the questions like: instructions for the students for reading a passage aloud, material provides sufficient opportunities for reading to the children, reading texts are effectively organized in

improving reading abilities, and it is used by the student independently. The experts' respondent in filling the framework and giving the importance as indicated in the framework. A five level rating scale was introduced having a provision of zero to four for not to be included to excellent level of combination in the prescribed textbook. Note that for syllable segmentation and initially reading level of children, the percentage is based on the scaling of the expert. Five items; therefore one correct item out of five would result in a score of 20%. Thus the average of initial of reading level of children is less than one correct item for out of five items for grade 1-3.

Table 56: Percentage distribution of idicators of reading levels of children in textbooks

Reading levels of children indicators	*not included this area at all (0)*	*Only lightly touched (1)*	*Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations (2)*	*appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps (3)*	*thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order (4)*
1. *Reading materials contain instructions for the students for reading a passage aloud*	9.2%	17.6%	24.4%	26.1%	22.7%
2. *Material provides sufficient opportunities for reading to the children*	1.7%	10.9%	29.4%	38.7%	19.3%
3. *Reading texts are effectively organized in improving reading abilities of the children*	2.5%	13.4%	40.3%	26.9%	16.8%
4. *There is a provision of loud reading*	6.7%	20.2%	26.1%	30.3%	16.8%
5. *Material can be used by the student unaided (e.g. during his/her illness and consequent absence from classes)*	8.4%	19.3%	35.3%	28.6%	8.4%

This table also presents zero score as a range. At both base point and end point, this is the category with the largest share of the textbooks for grade (1-3) alike. At the base point, 9.2% of the respondents mentioned that the reading materials contain instructions for the students for reading a passage aloud was not included this area at all, where at the end line most of the experts (26.1%) mentioned that it appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Similarly, a considerable number of respondent (17.6%) was agreed to be slightly addressed where (24.4%) experts were convinced that it was Included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. Likewise the very good number of experts (22.7%) was fully satisfied with the subject matter.

The similar variation were observed from Table concerning to the material provides sufficient opportunities for reading to the children. A very less (1.7%) of the respondent were fully negative, whereas only (10.9%) experts were seemed to have some connections but the most of the expert (38.7%) mentioned it has a very good as it appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Likewise, most of the respondent (19.3%) were fully agreed with the subject matter stating thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order whereas a considerable number of respondent (29.4%) had agreed that it included in the text but not balanced in all, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.

Regarding reading texts are effectively organized in improving reading abilities of the children most of the respondent (40.3%) had mentioned that the textbook included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations whereas the least

(2.5 %) were admitted that it has not been included in the textbook but a very considerable number (16.8%) were fully convinced that it improved the reading skills of the student. Likewise, few (13.4%) were agreed that the textbooks had only lightly touched the matter while a very considerable number (26.9%) were mentioned that it appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.

While interpreting the data regarding the provision of loud reading, the picture was different. A very few (6.7%) mentioned that there was no such provision whereas (20.2%) seemed that the textbooks had some slightly linkage where most of the respondent (30.3%) reported that the provision of loud reading appeared in most of the textbooks with some possible error while a very considerable number (16.8%) were fully convinced that the text had a fully provision of loud reading. Likewise, very good number (26.1%) experts were reported that the text had included the provision of loud reading but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.

In relation to the textbook material can be used by the student unaided very few (8.4%) mentioned that the textbooks had no such strength that the early graders could work independently whereas (19.3%) of the respondent admitted that the textbooks had some linkage to work independently. Similarly, most of the experts (35.3%) were admitted that the textbooks had Included but it had not balanced in all of the appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps however a very few (8.4%) experts reported that the text had thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order so that it prepared the students to study independently.

Table 57: Reading levels of children by language

Language	Reading materials contain instructions for the students for reading a passage aloud	Material provides sufficient opportunities for reading to the children	Reading texts are effectively organized in improving reading abilities of the children	There is a provision of loud reading	Material can be used by the student unaided (e.g. during his/her illness and consequent absence from classes)
Nepali	2	3	2	2	2
Athara Magarat	3	4	3	4	3
Awadhi	4	4	4	4	4
Bajjika	4	4	0	3	4
Bantawa	1	1	1	1	1
Bhojpuri	1	2	3	3	2
Chamling	2	3	1	2	2
Dhimal	4	4	3	3	2
Gurung	1	2	2	0	1
Limbu	4	4	4	3	3
Magar Dhoot	2	4	3	2	2
Maithili	2	2	2	2	2
Mugali	4	4	4	3	3
Nepal	4	3	3	3	3
Rajbanshi	0	1	1	1	1
Sunuwar	3	3	2	3	2
Tamang Devnagari	2	2	2	3	2
Tamang Sambhota	3	3	2	1	2
Tharu	1	2	2	2	2
Tharu madhyachhetra	3	4	4	2	3
Yakkha	3	2	2	2	2

Table 57 presents extremely positive as well as extremely negative in some of the mother tongue textbooks. The mother tongue textbook of Awadhi was excellent in all aspects as it scores (4) in all measuring tools whereas Rajbanshi and Bantawa were found to be poor

textbook as l as they scored (0-1) in each category. Likewise, Mugali, Nepal (Nepal Bhasa), Athar Magarat and Limbu and Tharu Madhyachetra, Dhimal were good textbooks as it all scores (3-4) in all category. Similarly Nepali subject, Yakkha and Sunuwar, Magar Dhoot, Tamang Devnagri, Maithali, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Bajjika language textbook were found to be adequate in all respect of rating scales as it scores (2-3) in all category. However, Gurung, Tamang Sambhota and Tharu language textbooks also can be categorized in the textbook having poor condition to raise the reading level of the elementary grades (1-3) students as it scores(0-2) in more test items.

Being specific, the mother language textbooks were found with the following cases of reading levels of children:

Bajjika	Class 1: In one place there is a use of Deergha, which doesn't exist in Bazzika language. Ra, La, Na are available in Bazzika but not used in the textbook.
Dhimal	Class 3: If extra-curricular material and lessons could be linked, the students would get involved in creative activities and read with fun.
Sunuwar	Class 1: Improvement in presentation of reading materials according to the grade/level is necessary.
	Class 2: Improvement in presentation of reading materials according to the grade/level is necessary.
	Class 3: Improvement in presentation of reading materials according to the grade/level is necessary.
Rajbanshi	Class 1: There should be gradual activities for reading from syllable-word-sentence- paragraph. But it is not considered in the textbook.
Tamang Devnagari	Class 1: Lack of the instruction for reading laud.
Tharu	Class 2: Very limited lessons for loud reading.
	Class 3: Very limited lessons for loud reading. Difficult even for teachers to teach lesson 13. Very limited exercises related to comprehension Single letter and multiple letter are not sequenced.
Yakkha	Class 1: Colorful illustrations/pictures would have made it easier to teach and attract children. Along with reading, writing skills should also be given emphasis.
	Class 2: Colorful illustrations/pictures would have made it easier to teach and attract children. Better to include texts and lessons as per age specific interests.
	Class 3: Colorful illustrations/pictures would have made it easier to teach and attract children. Better to include texts and lessons as per age specific interests.

It is also important that the NERGMA study gathered the data about the reading level of the children in the elementary level grades (1-3) in order to make the inference about the skills acquired in these levels of learning.

Table 58: Reading levels of children by grades

Language	Grade	Reading materials contain instructions for the students for reading a passage aloud	Material provides sufficient opportunities for reading to the children	Reading texts are effectively organized in improving reading abilities of the children	There is a provision of loud reading	Material can be used by the student unaided (e.g. during his/her illness and consequent absence from classes)
Nepali	1	2	2	2	2	2
	2	2	2	2	2	2
	3	2	3	3	2	2
Mother Tongue	1	3	3	3	2	2
	2	2	3	2	2	2
	3	3	3	3	3	2

Table 58 reveals the grade wise picture in reference to the reading level of the children. For every additional grade that the student is in, we expect to see an increase in scores and that increase is statistically significant.

The mean scores of grade 3 students are higher (3 in three categories and 2 in 2 categories) in all aspects than the lower graders. As shown in Table the mean scores of grade one and two are the same in all category and in all respect but the mean scores of grade three is little higher.

Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of reading levels of children in Nepali subject books is presented in Table 59.

Table 59: Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of reading levels of children in Nepali textbooks

Publisher	Reading materials contain instructions for the students for reading a passage aloud	Material provides sufficient opportunities for reading to the children	Reading texts are effectively organized in improving reading abilities of the children	There is a provision of loud reading	Material can be used by the student unaided (e.g. During his/her illness and consequent absence from classes)
Atharai	1	1	2	1	2
Allied	2	2	1	2	2
Asia	1	3	2	1	3
Airawati	2	3	2	1	2
Bhundi puran	1	3	2	3	2
Cambridge	1	2	2	2	2
CDC	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**
Ekta	2	3	3	3	2
JBD	1	2	2	1	1
Megha	2	2	2	2	2
Pragya	4	2	3	3	4
Pustak Prakashan	3	2	2	3	2
Sangam	2	2	2	2	0
Satyal, Ekta	2	3	3	3	2
Simrik	1	1	1	1	1
Sunrise	3	2	2	2	0
Times	4	4	3	3	3
Unique	1	2	2	1	1
United	1	2	2	2	3
Vidyarthi	4	3	2	4	3

There are five indicators. The first indicator is *'reading materials contain instructions for the students for reading a passage aloud'.* The textbooks published by United, Unique, Simrik, JBD, Cambridge, Bhundi Puran, Asia, and Atharai are rated (1) that means the feature is only lightly touched. In contrast, Ekta, Satyal, Ekta, Samgam books, Megha, Airawati and Allied are rated (2) i.e., *'included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.* The books from Sunrise, Pustak Prakashan and CDC are rated (3) which means the feature '*appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.'* Vidyarthi, Times, and Pragya are rated (4) since they*thoroughly included and sequenced* the feature *in a logical order.*

The second indicator is whether the '*material provides sufficient opportunities for reading to the children*'. Based on this, textbooks from Atharai and Simrik are rated (1) which means they have only lightly touched the feature.Allied, Cambridge, JBD, Megha, Pragya, Pustak Prakashan, Sangam, Sunrise, Unique and United are rated (2) i.e., they included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. The books from Vidyarthi, Satyal, Ekta, Ekta, CDC, Bhundi Puran, Airawati and Asia are rated (3) that means the feature appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. The only textbook from Times is rated (4) which means it thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.

On the basis of the third indicator which goes '*reading texts are effectively organized in improving reading abilities of the children*', the textbooks from Simrik and Allied are rated (1), i.e., they only lightly touched the indicator. Vidyarthi, United, Unique, Sunrise, Sangam, Pustak Prakashan, Megha, JBD, Cambridge, Bhundi Puran, Airawati, Asia and Atharai are rated (2) which means they included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. Likewise, Times, Satyal, Ekta, Pragya, Ekta, and CDC are rated (3) i.e., the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.

The fourth indicator is whether '*there is a provision of loud reading.*' The textbooks from Unique, Simrik, JBD, Airawati, Asia and Atharai are rated (1), thus, only lightly touched the indicator.United, Sunrise, Sangam, Megha, Cambridge and Allied are rated (2) which means they included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.Times, Satyal, Ekta, Pustak Prakashan, Pragya, Ekta, CDC and Bhundi Puran are rated (3), i.e., the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Only textbooks from Vidyarthi is rated (4) which thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.

The fifth indicator is whether the '*material can be used by the student unaided (e.g. during his/her illness and consequent absence from classes)*'. On this basis the textbooks from Sunrise and Sangam are rated (1) i.e., the feature is only lightly touched. Similarly, Satyal, Ekta, Pustak Prakashan, Megha, Ekta, Cambridge, Bhundi Puran, Airawati, Allied and Atharai are rated (2) which means the features were included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. The textbooks from Vidyarthi, United, Times, CDC and Asia are rated (3) which means the feature appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. In contrast, Pragya is rated (4) which means the feature is thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.

The insights and thorough observation of the publication-wise Nepali textbooks too result that there should be sufficient exercises for loud reading to the students.

Atharai	Class 3: There should be motivational instructions to read the lessons.
Allied	Class 1: There should be sufficient opportunity to read the text.
Cambridge	Class 1: Loud reading exercise was found only in one lesson except in poems/songs.
	Class 3: Loud reading exercises should be included in other lessons rather than poems and songs.
JBD	Class 1: Exercises should be added to develop reading levels of children.
	Class 2: Style of the lessons is of traditional one and needs editing.
	Class 3: Appropriate reading materials can be added.
Sangam	Class 1: Should balance the provision of the reading skills.
	Class 2: Self-reading skills should be accommodated in the text.
Simrik	Class 1 and 2: Adequate exercise should be added on loud reading.
Times	Class 1: There should be provision of loud reading.
	Class 3: Should provide more opportunity for reading text in the book.
Unique	Class 1: There should be proper instruction for reading.
	Class 2: There should be provision of loud reading.
	Class 3: There should be diversity in provision of loud reading and appropriate instructions in the lessons.

Moreover, the reading level of children in CDC Nepali subject books was identified according to the perspective of Nepali and non-Nepali speaker evaluator, which resulted the following information:

Table 60: Reading levels of children in CDC Nepali textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Reading materials contain instructions for the students for reading a passage aloud	Material provides sufficient opportunities for reading to the children	Reading texts are effectively organized in improving reading abilities of the children	There is a provision of loud reading	Material can be used by the student unaided (e.g. during his/her illness and consequent absence from classes)
Nepali Speaker	2	2	2	2	2
Non Nepali Speaker	3	4	4	3	3

Reading levels of children in CDC Nepali subject books was observed from the perspective of Nepali speaking and non-Nepali speaking evaluators. Table 60 shows that from the perspective of evaluator speaking Nepali as mother tongue the CDC Nepali textbooks' mean score is (2) for all the indicators which means the features were*included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations*. From the perspective of an evaluator speaking Nepali as a second language, the CDC Nepali textbooks' mean score is (3)'for the indicators 1, 4 and 5 which means '*appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps*'. The mean score is (4) for the indicator 2 and 3 which means the features are '*thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order*.'

Based on the available data we can conclude that the textbooks' mean score on different indicators is higher from the perspective of non-native Nepali speaking evaluator compared to the evaluator speaking Nepali as his/her mother tongue.

4.3 Physical Aspects in Textbooks

The physical aspect of the reading materials is equally important while reviewing them. Therefore, attempts were made to assess the physical quality of the reading materials. The incoming analyses present the status of the physical aspect of the reading materials.

Table 61: Percentage distribution of indicators of physical aspects of textbooks

Physical aspect indicators	Poor (0)	Fair (1)	Good (2)	Very good (3)	Excellent (4)
Size and shape of the book is students' friendly	0.0%	1.7%	17.6%	42.0%	38.7%
Book binding is appropriate to hold and read	0.0%	2.5%	15.1%	43.7%	38.7%
The textbooks is durable	0.8%	6.7%	32.8%	38.7%	21.0%
The size of the book is appropriate to the level	0.0%	3.4%	30.3%	32.8%	33.6%
Font size is appropriate to the level	2.5%	4.2%	23.5%	31.1%	38.7%

All the subject experts were asked to rate whether or not the size and shape of the reading materials is student friendly. Table 61 indicates that the size and shape of the reading materials are found to be student friendly because 42 percent experts rated it very good and 38.7 percent experts rated excellent. That means more than 80 percent experts rated that the size and shape of the reading materials are student friendly.

Regarding the book binding, 43.7 percent experts rated very good and 38.7 percent experts rated excellent. On the other hand, only 2.5 percent experts rated fair. It is also obvious that the banding of almost all the books was found to be very good and excellent.

Experts were also asked to rate the durability of the books. Their ratings showed that 38.7 respondents rated very good and 21 percent respondents rated them excellent. Only 6.7 percent experts rated fair. It means that the textbooks were found to be durable. The similar response can also be found in size of the textbook and font size inside the textbooks. In overall observation, the physical quality of textbooks was found to be relevant in terms of their size and shape.

During the assessment, it was also tried to identify the physical quality of the textbooks separately in terms of mother tongue. Table 62 presents the picture of the status.

Table 62: Physical aspects by language

language	Size and shape of the book is students' friendly	Book binding is appropriate to hold and read	The textbooks is durable	The size of the book is appropriate to the level	Font size is appropriate to the level
Nepali	3	3	3	3	3
Athar Magar	4	4	3	4	4
Awadhi	4	4	3	4	4
Bajjika	4	4	3	4	4
Bantawa	2	2	2	2	2
Bhojpuri	4	4	3	3	4
Chamling	2	2	2	1	2
Dhimal	3	2	2	3	4
Gurung	2	2	2	2	2
Limbu	2	2	2	2	2
Magar Dhoot	4	4	4	4	4
Maithili	4	4	2	4	4
Mugali	2	2	2	2	2
Nepal	3	3	3	3	3
Rajbanshi	4	4	4	3	4
Sunuwar	4	2	1	4	4
Tamang Devnagari	2	4	2	4	4
Tamang Sambhota	3	3	2	2	2
Tharu	3	3	3	3	3
Tharu madhyachhetra	4	4	4	4	3
Yakkha	3	3	1	2	2

According to Table 62, the ratings of experts in different textbooks are presented. In terms of MT textbooks, the experts of Mugali, Tamang Devnagari, Tamang Sambhota, Limbu, Bantawa, Chamling and Gurung rated their books as good, and rest of the experts rated them very good and excellent. Though the size of the books is almost same, however, due to the individual differences of the experts they are found to be different in their ratings.

As far as the binding of books is concerned The experts of Mugali, Limbu, Bantawa, Chamling, Dhimal, Gurung and Sunuwar rated good whereas rest of the experts rated them very good and excellent. The experience of the study team also found to be very good in terms of binding. In addition to that experts rated very good and excellent in durability of the books, however, the experts of Mugali, Tamang Devnagari, Tamang Sambhota, Limbu, Bantawa, Chamling, Gurung, Sunuwar and Maithili rated them good only.

Regarding the appropriateness of the size of the book and font size, all the experts rated very good and excellent except the experts of Mugali, Tamang Sambhota, Bantawa,

Chamling, Gurung and Yakkha. In conclusion, physical quality of books was found to be appropriate in terms of the level of students and size.

The assessment team also analyzed the rating of physical quality according to the grades in Table 63.

Table 63: Physical aspects of the books by grades

Language	Grade	Size and shape of the book is students' friendly	Book binding is appropriate to hold and read	The textbooks is durable	The size of the book is appropriate to the level	Font size is appropriate to the level
Nepali	1	3	3	3	3	3
	2	3	3	3	3	3
	3	3	3	3	3	3
Mother Tongue	1	3	3	3	3	3
	2	3	3	2	3	3
	3	3	3	2	3	3

As per table 63, in average all the experts rated them as very good and only two ratings were found to be good in terms of durability in mother tongue textbooks of grade 2 and 3.

Moreover, during the course of assessment, the team also compared the difference between private publishers' books and CDC's books in terms of their physical qualities. Table 64 presents our observations.

Table 64: Difference between CDC and private publishers in mean score of physical aspects of the Nepali textbooks

Publisher	Size and shape of the book is students' friendly	Book binding is appropriate to hold and read	The textbooks is durable	The size of the book is appropriate to the level	Font size is appropriate to the level
Atharai	4	4	4	3	3
Allied	3	3	3	3	3
Asia	4	4	4	4	4
Airawati	2	3	2	2	2
Bhundi puran	3	2	2	3	1
Cambridge	3	3	3	3	3
CDC	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**	**3**
Ekta	4	4	4	3	3
JBD	4	4	4	4	3
Megha	3	3	3	3	3
Pragya	3	3	3	2	2
Pustak Prakashan	3	3	3	2	2
Sangam	3	3	2	2	3
Satyal, Ekta	4	4	4	3	3
Simrik	3	3	3	3	2
Sunrise	3	3	3	3	4
Times	4	4	4	4	4
Unique	4	3	2	4	3
United	3	3	3	3	3
Vidyarthi	4	4	4	4	4

According to Table 64, the experts rated all the books from different publications as very good and excellent except some books published by Airawati, Bhundi puran, Pragya, Pustak Prakashan and Sangam. The under ratings were mostly found in font size and durability of the books. However, in totality, physical aspect of books published by different publications was found very good. They can be improved with some corrections with font size and binding.

Nepali textbooks published by CDC must be read by all the students except where there are mother tongue textbooks. These textbooks are used for Nepali as the first language and

Nepali as the second language. Therefore, the study team tried to find some evaluators from non-Nepali speakers to assess those books. The ratings of those evaluators are presented in Table 65.

Table 65: Physical aspects of CDC Nepali textbooks by Nepali and non-Nepali speaker

Evaluator	Size and shape of the book is students' friendly	Book binding is appropriate to hold and read	The textbooks is durable	The size of the book is appropriate to the level	Font size is appropriate to the level
Nepali Speaker	3	3	3	3	3
Non Nepali Speaker	3	4	3	3	4

Table 65 shows that Nepali speaker evaluators rate all the parameters of quality aspect in very good. In contrast to them, the non-Nepali speaker evaluators rated the appropriateness of book binding and font size as excellent. In rest of the parameters, both the evaluators rated very good. It means that we can see consistency in their ratings.

In conclusion, the physical aspect of textbooks is appropriate in terms of their size, binding, and durability, level and font size.

4.4 Grammer Books of Nepali

Some publishers have been producing grammar books for early grade (grade one to three) readers. Most of these books were even approved as supplementary reading material for the early grader by the CDC. All the grammer books published by the private publishers were traced, collected and reviewd at initial, however, the study team did not rated them further. The following observations were recorded with respect to their appropriateness for early grade readers.

Direct reading approach is appropriate for the beginners. Grammar does not enhance reading ability of children.

There is no need of separate book to support the learning of grammar. If grammar seems essential or it helps the learners to promote learning, the exercises can be included at the end of the learners. Grammar books were based on theoretical orientation and not related to communicative skills.

Font size used in grammar books was very small for early graders.

Theoretically, the early graders should not be taught grammar. It hinders them to learn other reading skills. Functional grammar can be taught from grade four. Such functional grammar can be the part of the lesson incorporated in an integrated way.

5 Findings and Discussion Related to the Nepali and Mother Tongue Supplementary Readers

The supplementary readers are those reading materials which can be used to support textbooks. These enhance the free reading among students. This study assessed the 16 languages' supplementary readers.

5.1 Content Appropriateness in Supplementary Readers

5.1.1 Cultural Appropriateness

Table 66 shows Cultural Appropriateness of supplimentary readers. There are all together 16 languages starting from Awadhi and ending with Urdu.

Table 66: Cultural appropriateness in supplementary readers by language

Language	Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises	Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable	Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases	Succeeds in avoiding cultural/religious stereotypes and biases	Succeeds in avoiding caste/ethnic stereotypes and biases
Awadhi	0	4	4	1	2
Bantawa rai	3	2	3	2	2
Bhojpuri	3	4	4	3	4
Chamling	3	4	4	4	4
Dangaura Tharu	3	3	2	3	3
Doteli	4	4	3	3	4
Gurung	0	3	3	3	3
Limbu	4	4	3	3	4
Magar	4	4	1	3	3
Maithili	2	3	2	1	1
Nepal bhasa	4	2	3	4	4
Nepali	2	3	3	3	2
Sanskrit	3	3	3	3	3
Thakali	2	4	3	0	0
Thami	2	4	4	2	3
Urdu	1	4	2	2	2

In four languages namely Doteli, Limbu, Magar and Nepal bhasa reviewers found materials highly appropriate in integration of cultural contents in the texts, figures and exercises. Withregards to supplementary materials, experts of these languages also mentioned that local culture and religious contents, life style and dresses should be included in the books (Doteli), pictures should be added to address cultural contents (Limbu) and some pictures are not representing the cultural aspects.

For example, emphasis was placed on cultures of Kathmandu, Lalitpur and Bhaktapur only. So geographic and regional cultures should be included in supplementary readings (Nepal Bhasa).

In five of the languages Bantawa, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Dangaura Tharu and Sanskrit reviewers found it appropriate. On the other hand in Maithil, Nepali, Thakali and Thami they found not balancely included. In Urdu they found remote inclusion, whereas, in Awadhi and Gurung they found total negation of the inclusion of the same. In this regard, expert from Dangaura Tharu and Bhojpuri also opined that other cultures from the community should be included to make the materials culturally more appropriate.

In Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Doteli, Limbu, Magar, Thakali, Thami and Urdu languages reviewers found highly appropriate inclusion of pictures and figures. In Dangaura Tharu, Gurung, Maithali, Nepali and Sanskrit reviewers found appropriate inclusion of pictures and figures. In two of the languages Nepal Bhasa and Bantawa they found not that balanced inclusion of the same.

From the point of view of avoiding linguistic biasesness, Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Chamling and Thami are highly successful. Bantawa, Doteli, Gurung, Limbu, Nepal Bhasa, Nepali, Sanskrit and Thakali are also found to be successful for the same. In Dangaura Tharu, Maithili and Urdu, only very little successful in avoiding linguistic biasesness while Magar is negligibly successful.

Reagarding avoiding cultural/religious stereotypes and biasesness Chamling and Nepal Bhasa are highly successful while Bhojpuri, Dangaura Tharu, Dotely, Gurung, Limbu, Magar, Nepali and Sanskrit are only considerably successful. Bantawa, Thami and Urdu are found to be imbalanced for the same. On the other hand Awadhi and Maithili are unable to avoid it. Thakali is totally negligint about it.

Regarding avoiding caste/ethnic stereotypes and biasesness Bhojpuri, Chamling, Doteli, Limbu and Nepal Bhasa have paid full attention while Dangaura Tharu, Gurung, Magar, Sanskrit and Thami have given considerable attention. Awadhi, Bantawa, Nepali and Urdu seem imbalanced even though attention is paid.

Maithali paid negligible attention Whereas Thakali did not pay attention.In this regard Bantawa language experts also observed that Bantawa language supplementary books were only appropriate for grade four and five not for early grade readers.

Regarding cultural appropriateness, expert of Thakali culture opined that children's reading materials should have the lessons with simple and short languages. Sanskrit language expert also gave his opinion that diverse cultural contents and story related to character building should be included in the lessons to make the materials more culturally appropriate.

5.1.2 Social Inclusion

Language wise social inclusion assessment of the supplementary readers was analyzed from three indicators (Table 67)- inclusiveness of disadvantaged groups, inclusiveness of people with disability, and inclusiveness of skills, behaviors, attitudes and understandings that enable students to construct equal and respectful relationship across different social backgrounds.

Chamling language supplementary readers were best in all three categories. Bhojpuri, Limbu and Nepal Bhasa were best in the last category, whereas, Gurung and Urdu languages were at the bottom in all 3 categories.

Table 67: Social inclusion in supplementary readers by language

Language	Material is inclusive of disadvantaged groups	Material is inclusive of people with disability	Material helps in developing skills, behaviors, attitudes and understandings that enable students to construct equal and respectful relationship across different social backgrounds
Awadhi	2	1	2
Bantawa rai	3	2	2
Bhojpuri	3	0	4
Chamling	4	4	4
DangauraTharu	2	2	3
Doteli	2	0	2
Gurung	0	0	1
Limbu	2	0	4
Magar	3	1	3
Maithili	0	0	2
Nepal bhasa	0	0	4
Nepali	1	0	3
Sanskrit	2	1	3
Thakali	2	0	3
Thami	4	0	2
Urdu	0	0	1

As per Table 67, Nepal Bhasa experts observed that the text was silent about disadvantaged people. So, culture of disadvantage community should also be included in the reading materials. In this regard, Bhojpuri and Limbu experts also opined that supplementary books should also include social reality and diverse culture of the society.

Limbu language experts also mentioned that the book should have included contents related to other ethnic people and disablec people also.

For Thakali language experts, the book should address the inslucion aspect in the lessons with small lessons and simple words. Similarly, to make the reading materials for early grade readers, Tharu language expert observed that some contexts of other languages should be included to make the lesson more inclusive. Only mentioning Tharu culture is not sufficient to make content inclusive.

In order to make the supplementary readers more inclusive inclusive, majority of the experts from different languages opined to incorporate diverse culture of the society in the reading materials.

5.1.3 Gender Balance

In terms of gender balance in the supplementary readers (Table 68) Nepal Bhasa was the best followed by Bhojpuri and Dangaura Tharu in inclusiveness of skills, behaviors, attitudes and understandings that enable students to construct equal and respectful relationship across different social backgrounds.

Bhojpuri expert mentioned some lessons were found to have gender discrimination which should be avoided. Similarly, Dangore Tharu language expert gave emphasis to include content related to Tharu learned female in make the material more gender balance.

Table 68: Gender balance in supplementary readers by language

Language	Material treats both male and female equitably	Material maintains balance between male and female	Contents are not gender blind	Contents are not gender neutral	Material is designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities
Awadhi	3	2	2	2	0
Bantawarai	1	2	2	2	1
Bhojpuri	3	3	4	4	3
Chamling	4	3	4	4	0
DangauraTharu	3	3	3	3	3
Doteli	2	2	2	1	2
Gurung	2	3	3	3	2
Limbu	2	2	2	1	2
Magar	3	3	3	3	0
Maithili	3	3	2	2	1
Nepal bhasa	3	3	4	2	4
Nepali	2	3	3	3	1
Sanskrit	3	3	3	1	3
Thakali	3	3	4	1	2
Thami	3	2	4	1	0
Urdu	2	1	0	2	0

As per table 68, Awadhi, Chamling, Magar, Thami and Urdu were worst in this category. None of these language readers included this category at all. Urdu language experts also emphasized to include the pictures of female in its language readers. Bantawarai, Maithili and Nepali readers were at the lower end in this category because they only touched upon this indicator. In terms of treating female and male equitably all were at average level except Bantawara, which was at the lower end.

Thami language experts also claimed that Thami language readers also included traditional gender role of women in the lessons which should be dincontinued in their supplementary readers.Similarly, Sanskrit language expert also observed that role played by women in epic and historical period should be included in the materials. In the same way, Thakali language experts also observed some discriminatory words regarding gender balance used in the supplementary readers. So care should be taken not to use such discriminatory words in the learning materials.

5.1.4 Human Rights and Child Rights

Supplementary readers were assessed from 2 indicators of human and child rights (Table 69). Chamling and Nepal Bhasa readers were best in both categories. Besides Dangaura Tharu, Doteli and Limbu were best in instructing children to respect others' rights. However, Linbu expert also insisted that there was also room to add contents to address child right issues and creativity in the lessons. Similarly, besides Chamling and Nepal Bhasa Thami readers was best in promoting children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, artistic expressions).

Table 69: Human rights and child rights in supplementary readers by language

Language	Material instructs children to respect others' rights	Material promotes children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, artistic expressions)
Awadhi	3	3
Bantawarai	2	2
Bhojpuri	3	3
Chamling	4	4
DangauraTharu	4	3
Doteli	4	3
Gurung	2	2
Limbu	4	3
Magar	2	3
Maithili	2	3
Nepal bhasa	4	4
Nepali	2	2
Sanskrit	2	2
Thakali	2	2
Thami	0	4
Urdu	2	1

Bantawa rai, Gurung, Nepali, Sanskrit and Thakali language supplementary readers included these two indicators but not balanced in all the texts, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. In this regard, Thakali and Bantawa Rai experts mentioned that stories could be written addressing child right issues and incorporate tham in supplementary readers.

5.1.5 Curricular Linkage

Supplementary readers are the materials that enhance reading ability. Such materials motivate students towards reading and understanding the lessons. Supplementary materials should have direct linkage with the curriculum of the prescribed grades. They also support the textbook lessons so that learning of the textbook become easier to the students. Supplementary materials of sixteen languages were assessed by the experts of the concerned languages. They were assessed through the indicator of appropriateness of the contents as per grade level, organization of the contents in order of ease and difficulty and their appropriateness in developing reading habit.

Their responses are presented in Table 70 below. The first indicator of assessment was whether 'the contents are appropriate as per the age level of the children (grade 1 to 3) according to the curriculum (scope of the contents). Table shows that this indicator was fully and satisfactorily met by Urdu language. Scope of the contents are adequate as per the age level of the children in Urdu language books. Awadhi, Dangaura Tharu, Limbu, Magar, Sanskrit and Thami language supplementary books were found to have adequate materials less than the Urdu language supplementary books. It indicates that these books have adequate coverage but lacks some balance and logical sequencing. However, Chamling, Gurung, Nepal Bhasa and Thakali language supplementary books do not have adequate

materials so as to meet the reading needs of the early grade children. The other supplementary books of the languages were found to have met this indicator to some extent.

Table 70: Cultural linkage in supplementary readers by language

Language	Contents are appropriate as per the age level of the children (grade 1 to 3) according to the curriculum (scope of the contents)	Contents are organized in proper order of ease and difficulty (simple to complex)	Material is appropriate to develop reading habit
Awadhi	3	2	4
Bantawarai	2	2	2
Bhojpuri	2	2	2
Chamling	1	2	4
Dangaura Tharu	3	2	2
Doteli	2	3	1
Gurung	1	1	2
Limbu	3	3	3
Magar	3	3	3
Maithili	2	1	3
Nepal bhasa	1	1	1
Nepali	2	1	2
Sanskrit	3	2	2
Thakali	1	0	3
Thami	3	3	2
Urdu	4	3	4

According to Table 70, the second indicator for the assessment of supplementary books in relation to their curricular linkage was whether 'the contents are organized in proper order of ease and difficulty (simple to complex)'. Organization of the contents is a crucial factor to make the readers' child friendly and understandable. Regarding this indicator, Doteli, Limbu, Magar, Tharu and Urdu language supplementary books were found to have organized their contents as per the proper order of difficulty level of the reading materials. But they also lack to maintain adequacy as per the level of the children. The other supplementary books of the languages like Awadhi, Bantawa, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Dangaura Tharu and Sanskrit have met the indicator in some of the lessons. In contrary to these supplementary books, Thakali language supplementary books were reported by the expert of the same language not to have met the indicator and the other languages (Gurung, Maithili, Nepal Bhasa and Nepali) have their supplementary books not addressing this indicator. They only touched this indicator. They do not have ordered in simple to complex order in their supplementary materials.

The last indicator of assessment with respect to curricular linkage was 'whether material is appropriate to develop reading habit of the early grade children'. Regarding this indicator, Awadhi, Chamling and Urdu language supplementary books were reported to have met the indicator of reading habits in the children. Limbu, Magar, Maithili and Thakali language supplementary books were also reported by the experts to have met this indicator in maximum cases. These books also need revision to make them more appropriate to develop reading habits in the children. Doteli and Nepal Bhasa textbooks have the contents not fulfilling the indicator of making them appropriate to develop reading habits of the children. Remaining seven other supplementary books have just touched the indicator in some chapters which is not sufficient to make it children friendly.

Over all language comparison with respect to curricular linkage as reported by the experts show that Urdu and Awadhi language supplementary books have highly satisfied the indicator curricular linkage followed by Limbu, Magar, Thami and Sanskrit respectively in order of meeting the indicator.

Experts from different languages also gave suggestions for the improvement of the supplementary readers. Awadhi expert emphsized to include contents related to nationality in the early grade readers. Doteli language expert impasized to inlcude the lessons related to early age children, their birth days, naming, wearing ceremony, wearing holy threads like festivals in the lessons to motivate the children. Tharu language experts, moreover, emphasized on lessons of the supplementary readers should be related to local context like dress, eating habits, work habits and life styles. Majority of the experts further opined to include local context, short sentences and textbooks supporting contents in supplementary materials in order to maintain curricular linkage.Thakali, Magar and Nepal Bhasa experts observed that supplementary materials of these languages are above early grade standards.

5.2   Level Appropriateness in Supplementary Readers

5.2.1   Language

Level appropriateness of the supplementary materials in terms of language is presented in Table 71.

Table 71: Language of supplementary readers by language

Language	Material is presented in simpler sentences	Material is appropriate to achieve greater fluency	The texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words	Number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline	Words used in the material are sequenced from concrete to abstract	Number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline	Material is appropriate to increase reading comprehension
Awadhi	4	4	4	4	4	3	4
Bantawarai	2	3	2	1	2	2	3
Bhojpuri	2	2	4	4	3	2	2
Chamling	2	3	4	0	1	2	4
DangauraTharu	4	3	3	2	2	3	3
Doteli	2	2	4	1	3	1	1
Gurung	2	2	3	0	0	1	2
Limbu	3	4	4	3	3	2	4
Magar	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
Maithili	2	3	2	1	0	1	2
Nepal bhasa	2	2	3	1	2	2	2
Nepali	2	2	3	0	1	1	2
Sanskrit	2	3	3	2	2	1	2
Thakali	1	2	3	2	3	1	3
Thami	2	2	2	1	1	1	2
Urdu	4	4	4	3	2	2	4

There are seven indicator set to evaluate the supplementary reading materials published by CDC in different languages. The first indicator is whether *'material is presented in simpler sentences'.*The supplementary reading materials for Awadhi, Dangaura Tharu and Urdu are rated (4), i.e., thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order. Limbu and Magar are rated (3), i.e., appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Bantawa, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Doteli, Gurung, Maithili, Nepal Bhasa, Nepali, Sanskrit, and Thami

are rated (2) which means included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations and Thakali is rated (1) that means only lightly touched the area.

The second indicator is whether the '*material is appropriate to achieve greater fluency'*. The materials for Awadhi, Limbu and Urdu are rated (4) which means the features thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order. Similarly, Bantawa, Chamling, Dangaura Tharu, Magar, Maithili and Sanskrit are rated (3) i.e., the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Likewise the materials in Bhojpuri, Doteli, Gurung, Nepalbhasa, Nepali, Thakali and Thami are rated (2) which means the features are included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.

The third indicator is whether '*the texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words'*. The supplementary materials forAwadhi, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Doteli, Limbu and Urdu are rated (4) which means the features are thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.Similarly, Dangaura Tharu, Gurung, Magar, Nepal Bhasa,Nepali, Sanskrit and Thakali are rated (3), i.e., the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Bantawa, Maithili and Thami materials rated as (2) have included the features but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations.

The fourth indicator is whether the '*number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline'*. The materials in Awadhi and Bhojpuri are rated (4) which means they have thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order. Likewise the materials forLimbu, Magar and Urdu appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Dangaura Tharu, Sanskrit and Thakali have included the features but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. Bantawa Rai, Doteli, Maithili, Nepal Bhasa and Thami have only lightly touchedwhereas Nepali, Gurung and Chamling (0) have not included this area at all.

The fifth indicator is whether the '*words used in the material are sequenced from concrete to abstract.'* The material forAwadhi have thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.Bhojpuri, Doteli, Limbu, Magar andThakali appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Similarly, Bantawa, Dangaura Tharu, Nepal Bhasa, Sanskrit and Urdu have included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations; Nepali, Chamling and Thami have only lightly touched the feature. The materials forGurung and Maithili have not included this area at all.

The sixth indicator is '*number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline'*. On the basis of this indicator the supplementary materials in Awadhi, Dangaura Tharu and Magar are rated (3), i.e., the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Similarly, the material forBantawa, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Limbu, Nepal Bhasa and Urdu have included the features but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. Likewise, Doteli, Gurung, Maithili, Nepali, Sanskrit, Thakali and Thami have only lightly touched the area.

According to the seventh indicator which reads '*material is appropriate to increase reading comprehension'*, the materials for Awadhi, Chamling, Limbu and Urdu are rated (4), i.e., they have thoroughly included and sequenced the features in a logical order. Bantawa Rai, Dangaura Tharu, Magar and Thakali are rated (3) which means the features appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps. Similarly, Bhojpuri, Gurung, Maithili, Nepal Bhasa, Nepali, Sanskrit and Thami have included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations. Doteli has only lightly touched the area.

With regards to the use of simpler sentences to make supplementary materials more level appropriate, Dangaura Tharu language expert opined that since more difficult words, long

109

sentences and long paragraphs were used in the text, they should be made easier for early grades. Doteli language also suggested giving word meaning at the end of the lesson. It indicates that lessons in supplementary materials are not as per the level of early grade children. Similarly, Thakali language, generally, has long sentences. There is a need to make short sentences in the text so that early grade children can understand the paragraph easily. Similar suggestion was provided by Sanskrit language expertts for making the sentences very sort and using simple language in the lessons of supplementary lessons. Supplementary reader written in Magar language 'Konung Ross' was reported difficult for grade three. It means it should be made easier for early grade learners. Further more, Limbu and Nepal Bhasa supplementary readers were reported to be difficult for early grade learners. So they sould be made easier to make them understandable to the early grade learners.

5.2.2 Contents

Contents of the supplementary readers should be selected to meet the indicator of lengths appropriate to grade level, accuracy in terms of spelling, use punctuation, ratio, size and placement of the pictures in the text appropriate to the children's grade level. Experts from mother tongue are requested to assess the supplementary materials based on the indicators mentioned below.

Table 72: Contents in supplementary readers by language

Language	Text lengths are appropriate as per grade level	Reading material is accurate in terms of spelling according to the house style of CDC	Punctuation marks are used correctly	Difficulty level of the contents is appropriate to the level (grades 1 to 3)	Ratio of pictures to the text is adequate	Pictures are related to the content	Pictures are placed in appropriate place	Shape and size of the pictures is appropriate to the grade (1-3) and age level
Awadhi	2	2	3	3	4	4	4	4
Bantawa rai	2	3	3	2	2	2	2	2
Bhojpuri	2	2	3	3	4	4	4	2
Chamling	2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Dangaura Tharu	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	4
Doteli	0	1	4	1	4	4	3	4
Gurung	2	2	3	1	2	2	2	1
Limbu	3	4	4	4	2	4	4	4
Magar	3	3	4	3	4	4	4	4
Maithili	1	1	3	2	1	2	1	3
Nepal bhasa	1	1	3	0	2	3	3	1
Nepali	1	2	3	2	3	4	4	3
Sanskrit	3	3	3	2	2	3	3	3
Thakali	0	4	0	0	2	3	3	4
Thami	2	2	1	2	2	2	2	2
Urdu	4	3	4	3	3	3	3	2

As shown in Table 72, the first indicator was 'whether text lengths are appropriate as per grade level'. Urdu language was found to have followed this indicator fully in its supplementary books. Dangaura Tharu, Limbu, Magar and Sanskrit language supplementary books have met the indicator at the maximum level. In contrast to it, Doteli

and Thakali languages supplementary books were reported not to have used the indicator of text lengths as per grade level. Maithili, Nepal Bhasa and Nepali language supplementary books were found to have used this indicator very little.

'Reading material is accurate in terms of spelling according to the house style of CDC' was the second indicator for the assessment of supplementary materials. As regards to this indicator, Limbu and Thakali language early grade supplementary books were found to have used the house style of CDC in reading materials. Supplementary books of five language such as Bantawa rai, Dangaura Tharu, Magar, Sanskrit, Urdu were reported to have their supplementary books with the house style of CDC in almost all the cases. But there remains some gap in balanced use of the prescribed styles. Chamling, Doteli, Maithili and Nepal Bhasa language supplementary readers have found to touch this indicator which was reported inadequate for early grade readers. Supplementary books of the remaining five languages (Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Gurung, Nepali, and Thami) were reported by the experts to have used indicator to some extent.

The third indicator was the 'use of punctuation marks correctly in the books Doteli, Limbu, Magar and Urdu language supplementary books have used the punctuation marks correctly. Nine supplementary books of other languages used the punctuation marks in almost all lessons of the supplementary readers. Awadhi, Bantawa rai, Bhojpuri, Dangaura Tharu, Gurung, Maithili, Nepal bhasa, Nepali, Sanskrit, languages have used punctuation marks in some of the cases which needs to be improved. Chamling and Thami language supplementary books were rated to have minimum use of punctuation marks. It indicates that these books have more problems related to punctuation parks. Thakali language supplementary books have found almost no use of punctuation marks. It was found poor in this respect.

The fourth indicator of contents assessment of supplementary books was 'whether difficulty level of the contents is appropriate to the grade level (grades 1 to 3). Expert of the Limbu language assessed the supplementary books having contents fully appropriate to the grade level. However, in contrast to it, Nepal Bhasa and Thakali language supplementary books were reported not to have at all the contents of these books appropriate to the grade level. Chamling, Doteli and Gurung supplementary books have met this indicator at minimum level. Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Dangaura Tharu and Urdu language supplementary books have maintained difficulty level of the contents appropriate to the grade level. Remaining language books were assessed as having some lessons or contents with difficulty level.

The remaining indicator of the content (indicator no 5 to 8) appropriateness were related to ratio of picture and their use in the books Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Doteli and Magar language supplementary books have adequate pictures with ratio in the lessons. But Chamling and Maithili language supplementary books have ratio of pictures in the lessons in rare cases. In case of Dangaura Tharu Nepal bhasa, Sanskrit, Thakali, and Urdu language supplementary books were found to have tried to satisfy this indicator in most of the cases. Resource persons were also asked whether pictures were related to the content. Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Doteli, Limbu, Magar and Nepali language supplementary books were assessed to have followed the indicator of maintaining picture in the books. Dangaura, Tharu, Nepal bhasa, Sanskrit, Thakali and Urdu language also used the content related pictures in most of the cases. Chamling language was reported not to have met this indicator but touched in came lessons. Remaining languages such as Bantawa rai, Gurung, Maithili, and Thami were found to have followed this indicator in some cases only.

The indicator of pictures to be placed at appropriate place was regarded as the seventh indicator of content evaluation. In regards to this, five languages Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Limbu,

Magar and Nepali supplementary books have highly satisfied the indicator of placing pictures in appropriate place of the lessons. Dangaura Tharu, Doteli, Nepal bhasa, Sanskrit, Thakali and Urdu languages were reported by the experts to have followed the indicator of placing the pictures in appropriate places in majority of the cases. Bantawa rai, Gurung, and Thami have satisfied this indicator in some of the cases. However, Chamling, Maithili and Nepali language supplementary books were reported poor to follow this indicator.

Experts were also asked to assess the supplementary books based on the indicator of 'shape and size of the pictures is appropriate to the grade (1-3) and age level'. As reported by them, Awadhi, Dangaura Tharu, Doteli, Limbu, Magar and Thakali languages have their supplementary books to have followed the indicator of having shape and size of the pictures appropriate to the grade level. Maithili, Nepali and Sanskrit languages have followed this indicator in majority of the lessons. Bantawa rai, Bhojpuri, Thami and Urdu languages were found to have this indicator in some cases in that shape and size of the pictures in supplementary books were as per the grade level. Chamling, Gurung and Nepal bhasa satisfied this indicator in a very few cases. It indicates that these books need more revision in this respect.

Regarding content appropriateness to the early grade readers some language experts suggested to mention the grade and level in the supplementary readers. Majour suggestions mentioned by the experts of different languages are making the pictures largar and colourful, making short sentences in the text, gradual increment in the length of the lessons, use of larger font size then the exinting size in the text,

As shown in Table 72, Limbu, Magar, Awadhi, Bhojpuri and Urdu language supplementary books have met most of the indicator of content appropriate to the grade level of the children. Chamling, Maithili, Nepal Bhasa and Thakali language supplementary books were found not to have satisfied majority of the indicator of content appropriateness. These supplementary books need more revision to satisfied most of the indicator of content appropriateness.

5.2.3   Reading Levels of Children

The analysis followed identification of the appropriateness of the reading level of the children in the supplementary readers, which is shown in table 73.

Table 73: Reading levels in supplementary readers by language

Language	Reading material is appropriate to promote reading ability as per level (grades 1-3)
Awadhi	4
Bantawa rai	2
Bhojpuri	2
Chamling	3
Dangaura Tharu	3
Doteli	1
Gurung	1
Limbu	4
Magar	3
Maithili	2
Nepal bhasa	1
Nepali	2
Sanskrit	3
Thakali	0
Thami	2
Urdu	4

Table 73 shows that Awadhi, Limbu and Urdu were the best rated in terms of their appropriateness to promote reading ability as per grade. In contrast to it, the Thakali supplementary reader was found nill in this indicator. Linbu language experts suggested mentioning exercises or reflective questions at the end of the lesson in order to enhance reading levels of the children.

Doteli language expert while assissing the supplementary book 'Hamara Viktityo' suggested that contents should include the languaage skills like letter recognition and word constructio, Similarly, Thakali and Thami language experts complained that supplementary bookd of their languages were found above the grade level of the children. They suggested using words in the lessons from daily use so that children can understand and comprehend the lessons easily. Similarly, Thami language experts opined that reading text, length of the lesson, pictures should match the reading levels of the children. Chamling language experts also gave the similar opinion as given by Thami language experts.

5.3 Physical Aspects in Supplementary Readers

Analysis was also made to see the physical quality of supplementary materials published in different mother tongues. All the experts were asked to rate the parameters in five category of Likert scale as excellent, very Good, Good, Fair and Poor. Table 74 gives the clear picture of the physical quality of the supplementary materials.

Table 74: Physical aspect of supplementary readers by language

Language	Size and shape of the book is students' friendly	The size of the book is appropriate to the level (grade 1-3)
Awadhi	4	3
Bantawa rai	2	2
Bhojpuri	4	4
Chamling	2	1
Dangaura Tharu	3	3
Doteli	4	3
Gurung	2	2
Limbu	4	3
Magar	3	4
Maithili	4	4
Nepal bhasa	3	3
Nepali	3	2
Sanskrit	3	3
Thakali	4	3
Thami	3	2
Urdu	4	4

Ratings: Excellent - 4, Very Good – 3, Good – 2, Fair – 1 and Poor - 0

According to Table 74, there were supplementary materials published in 16 different languages. Supplementary materials developed in Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Doteli, Limbu,

Maithali, Thakali, and Urdu was rated excellent by the experts in terms of their size and shape as students' friendly. Similarly, the materials developed in Dangaura Tharu, Magar, Nepal Bhasa, Nepali, Sanskrit and Thami was rated very good by the respective experts. The experts of only two languages that are Chamling and Gurung rated the materials good in terms of their size and shape as students' friendly.

Table 74 also indicates that the experts of Bhojpuri, Magar, Maithali and Urdu rated excellent in terms of size appropriateness according to the level of students (grade 1-3). In the same parameter, the experts of Awadhi, Dangaura Tharu, Doteli, Limbu, Nepal Bhasa, Sanskrit and Thakali rated very good. In contrast to the above ratings, the experts of Bantawa Rai, Gurung and Nepali rated good and the expert of Chamling rated only fair.

After analyzing the ratings of different experts, the study team realized that the assessment made by the experts was found to be subjective. Therefore, it was tried to match the ratings with study teams' views. Regarding the size of the supplementary materials, all the materials' size was 18 cm x 24 cm, however; the experts of mother tongue perceived them differently. Similarly, the paper used in the supplementary materials was almost of cream wove paper (Approximately 60 gm). In the same way the cover page paper of the materials was of art board and some of them were laminated, too. Therefore, it can be concluded that physical aspect of the supplementary materials was very good, however, suggestions of experts to use multi-color pictures in the material were appreciated.

Regarding physical quality of the book, Dangora Tharu language expert opined that many pictures in the cover page make the message confusing. So, specific but large pictures should be printed in the cover page. Supplementary books were found to have multi-coloured pictures in rare cases. Language experts suggested making inside pictures multi-colored and number of pictures sould be increased in the texts. Similarly, font size should be increased and number of lessons should be not more than three to four in one supplementary readers depending on the grade level.

6 Findings and Discussion Related to Instructional Materials of Various Organizations

6.1 Room to Read

6.1.1 Introduction

Room to Read has been developing and providing educational teaching and learning materials to the developing countries since 2000 in collaboration with local partners (Room to Read, 2010.) (Global Strategic Plan 2010 – 2014. A Roadmap for Learning: Literacy and Girls' Education). In order to enhance reading skills and develop reading habit for future learning Room to Read focuses on children's literacy. In order to materialize this venture Room to Read Nepal publishes variety of teaching learning and reading materials and also help schools establish libraries. All together there are six types of materials. Among them five are directly related to language teaching/learning and one, which is story books, is for reading habit development. All the teaching learning materials are based on the MOE prescribed curricula therefore they are appropriated linked with objectives and contents of the Nepali language curricula.

6.1.2 Type of the Materials Developed/Used

Types of materials developed by the organization are: 1. Wooden dice, 2. Big reading book, 3. Flip chart, 4. Matra Recognition cards, 5. Booklets, and 6. self-reading materials (story books).

6.1.2.1 Wooden dice

a) **Objective**
   To teach students help students recognize letters and words, and for building grapho-phonemic awareness though playing with the dices.
b) **Contents covered**
   Vowels, consonants and diacritics.
c) **Content appropriateness**
   Dices contain 'parts of the whole' thus not include sentences to judge the content appropriateness.
d) **Level appropriateness**
   All the materials are graded in terms of students' level of reading, so are appropriateness.
e) **Physical quality**
   Wooden dice are durable and attractive.
f) **Overall impression**
   These materials are impressive in terms of the age level of the students.

6.1.2.2 Diacritic recognition cards

a) **Objective**
   To help children recognize diacritics and construct letters using diacritics.
b) **Contents covered**
   Diacritics.

c) **Content appropriateness**
Cards contain diacritics only therefore to judge the contents for their appropriateness is not relevant in this case.
d) **Level appropriateness**
Cards are appropriate to teach diacritics to beginner readers.
e) **Physical quality**
Size of the cards and the prints are appropriate and durable.
f) **Overall impression**
Appropriate for lower grades and beginner readers, and small size class.

6.1.2.3 Booklet

a) **Objective**
To help early grade readers recognize simple to complex/conjunct consonants and vowels, and diacritics; and to help develop comprehension skills and reading habit.
b) **Contents covered**
Among 15 booklets some are theme based such as festivals, and some are information focused.
c) **Content appropriateness**
Contents and illustrations are socially inclusive. They include different religion, events and attire. Male and female are equally represented. However some gender stereotypical images are found, such as girls alone are shown dancing.
d) **Level appropriateness**
With some exceptions simple, readable (short sentences) and interesting matters are included to teach, vowels and complex consonants to beginner readers. However some words are more complex for early grade readers (ref. book 12), and in some books stanzas are not rhythmic. Selection of words and sentences are not appropriate in some places and grammatically incorrect, e.g. use of 'uu' vowel in book 6.
e) **Physical quality**
Paper and print quality is fine but size of the booklets is rather small for early grade readers and pages are not numbered.
f) **Overall impression**
Interesting reading but if the pages were numbered children would learn the figures/numbers simultaneously with consonants and vowels. Instruction is given in every book making it easier for teachers to facilitate students in reading the book. However, words and sentences do not appear/sound normal or natural in many places, e.g. there is unnecessary use of emphatic words.
g) **Suggestions**
It is better to slightly enlarge the size of the booklets and pages are numbered. Moreover, grammar and words used need to be reviewed for correctness and natural flow.

6.1.2.4 Big reading book

a) **Objective**
To develop fluency, vocabulary, comprehension skill, concept (e.g. height, level, size, color, time, etc.) and reading habit among early grade students.
b) **Contents covered**

All 15 books cover different themes. One book is dedicated to one theme.

c) **Content appropriateness**

Big books have variety of contents that young children can identify with. Girls and boys are equally represented in the books. Gender sensibility is ensured.

d) **Level appropriateness**

Big books are appropriate to grade 1 to 3 students. They are generally readable because of the size, colorfulness, and interesting presentation. These books are developed for different levels of readers therefore size of the sentences rage from 2 to 10 words. However there are still few complexities which are more appropriate to higher grade students, e.g. multisyllabic words are used in some places. Moreover, some books use classical spellings, which children may not find in other books that they use. Inconsistency in spellings and punctuations are also noted.

e) **Physical quality**

Size, and paper and print quality are fine. But pages are not numbered.

f) **Overall impression**

Interesting reading but 10 word sentence is too long for early graders. Where complex words are introduced students need assistance.

g) **Suggestions**

Complexities mentioned above need to be removed and consistency in spelling and punctuation need to be maintained.

6.1.2.5 Flip chart

a) **Objective**

To help develop listening and comprehension skills; and recognize sounds of conjunct words and diacritics.

b) **Contents covered**

Flip charts cover stories and events familiar and interesting to the children.

c) **Content appropriateness**

Flip charts have attempted to deconstruct traditional gender roles, e.g. older brother is carrying his younger brother. However, girls alone are assigned dancing and singing roles and they are shown playing with dolls.

d) **Level appropriateness**

Classical Nepali language is used, e.g. hyphenation between emphatic words- 'pachhi-pachhi' (Eng. behind-behind). Flip charts are heavily loaded with words, which is likely to hinder comprehension skill development. In some instances spellings errors are noted. Long sentences (e.g. 12 words) are not quite appropriate if the intent is to develop comprehension and listening skills among early graders.

e) **Physical quality**

Size, and paper and print qualities are fine. Flip charts are colorful too. But one of the flip charts out of 2 reviewed is not properly bound.

f) **Overall impression**

Flip charts include interesting stories in an attractive presentation including color.

g) **Suggestions**

Size of the sentences need to be reduced. Spellings need to be consistent and correct. Subtle gender stereotypes need to be reviewed minutely.

6.1.2.6 Self-reading books or library books

Room to Read Nepal has published numerous books for different reading levels and grades. For the purpose of this review books designed for early grades and beginner readers were grouped and sampled. Books with English subtitles were not reviewed though some of them were designed for early graders. These self-reading books were primarily designed to develop reading habits and they were not directly related to the curricular objectives. All the books published are intended for library purpose i.e., they are not used in the classroom. Therefore format used to review other teaching learning materials were not applied in this case. Outcomes of overall review of the books are presented below.

Types of materials

Books in different sizes (booklets to bigger than A4 size books) and story books with associated colored pictures.

Some books are bilingual i.e., in Nepali and English which are not useful to early grade Nepali reading promotion. It distracts the attention of the students.

Genre covered

Poems, stories (real life and imaginary), essays, dialogues, factual narratives, etc.

Themes covered

Animal world (wild animals, domestic animals, birds and insects), natural phenomenon (sun, moon, forest, water, river, rainfall, snowfall, environment, surroundings (flower, garden, kitchen garden, vegetables, etc.), geography, and daily activities etc.

Objectives/implications

Letter recognition, enhancing reading habits, developing literacy skill and enhancing creativity

General impression on the language

a. **spelling**
Inconsistent (not uniformity) in spelling (e.g. *ma baalak*/ Me a child, by Mitralal Pangeni, 2067)

b. **sentence length**
Sentences are longer than the comprehension level of the targeted students (14 words in a sentence eg. *dinko euta kitab padnuhos*/Read one book per day, by Christine Stone, 2069).

c. Sentences are quite complex to the level of the students (e.g. first paragraph p. 4 of *dinko euta kitab padnuhos*; first paragraph p. 21of *Thulo phool*/big flower). Similarly, there are 21 words in a sentence in *Tomy, Tempo ra Tek Tuk Tuk*(p.6) by Christine Stone; 22 and 36 words respectively in a sentence in page nos. 28 and 36 in *Birkhe bagh ra saikshik Vraman* by Christine Stone. (Perhaps it is translated from English).

Difficulty level

a. Separate words are compounded unnecessarily which are likely to hinder in developing fluency.

b. Unnecessary use of compound verbs (*sikisakeko chha* instead of *sikeko chha*; *paisakeko chha* instead of *paeko chha*; *uphradai gariraheka* in place of uphriraheka or uphradai gareka, bataidinuhunchha ki in place of bataunuhunchha ki in Thulo phool)

c. In some books letter size does not match with the picture size in some books (e.g. *phuchche hatti*by Gopikrishna Dhungana, 2070; ma baalak by Mitralal pangyani, 2067; and Dingo Dragon by Pawan Singh Karki 2069).

d. In some books letter size is not appropriate to early grade students (15 books targeted for early grades have this issue)

e. Books translated from other languages are not adapted to the Nepalese context and/or culture (activities, names of the characters, dresses, etc.), (e.g. *Dingo Dragon* by Pawan Singh Karki 2069), *Tommi Tempo Chitwanma* by Christine Stone, 2067 and Mermaid).

f. There are also examples where word does not match the figure/illustration. For example, *bharseli* is an empty space at the side of traditional mud stove where rice pot is kept to keep it warm and well cooked. But in the book a big milk pan kept on a table is shown as *bharseli*.

Positive aspects

a. Rhymes with colored picture in Chunumunu series are useful to the early grade readers. The shape, size and quality of the booklets are appropriate.

b. Books are pictorial to attract the learners easily

c. Books are graded in terms of concept, vocabulary, reading level and concept development in the children.

Content appropriateness from gender, rights and social inclusion perspectives

Self-reading books or library books include interesting stories and information. While attempting to develop literacy skills the books also intend to form socially desirable or acceptable behaviors and habits in young children. From gender lens lessons and stories are equally represented by male and female characters. In terms of social inclusion the books in general are neutral. There are not enough examples or stories about children with disabilities. From rights perspective books do not include matters that violate children's rights or promote violence against children. The books are multicolored and thus attractive.

However when minutely reviewed some issues were observed in the self-reading books. Stories or books still consist of certain images, ideas and beliefs which are likely to inculcate bias outlook and behavior in children. For example a thug is represented by a hefty person and shark is introduced as a bad guy. Neither a hefty person is always a thug or vice versa, nor is shark bad. Similarly, a story about a mermaid ends with a lie without any discussion about whether such behavior was correct.

From gender perspective, a father is accompanied by his daughter while traveling to the city but in another story, which is about travel to the moon only male figures are used. Similarly, books repeatedly project gender stereotypical images and roles. For example, in the "Ramri baneki sani" (a little girl making herself nice looking) a girl opts to look beautiful and tries her mother's make-ups (lipstick, cream, etc). This story instills the notion that girls in general want to look beautiful, are interested in make-up and fashion, and thus decorate themselves from early age. In one story boy is shown in a sports' good store while women and girl in cosmetics, and milk and fruit stores. Such portrayals on one hand reinforce such behavior in girls and on the other people take it as a biological trait of females. Nevertheless in one of the stories (Ref. Mohan in uncle's home) uncle is shown washing clothes. But since such images are not many children are not likely to accept it. And in another story (e.g. Chhunu Munu) two girls are shown engaged in variety of things such as touring, going to school, doing household chores, playing, etc. But boys are hardly portrayed in multiple

roles like these. In only one story (Ref. who says what?) from those selected for review a boy is shown sweeping the floor. In a story about a mouse couple both male and female share household obligations but since they are not humans children so not get the message from such story.

Except in one or two cases (e.g Raju and Sheru) feelings, emotions and attributes such as love, affection, care, etc. are all projected in female characters (e.g. Suri and Sani, Hira and Moti, Bachhi karayo). Moreover girls alone are shown appreciating flowers, nature, garden, etc. and enjoying dancing and singing. Good behavior, beauty, loveable personality, etc. are all projected in little girls. The entire effort is thus to be loveable in a story about a girl's young age.

A story called miraculous pen tries to teach good behavior but the messages are not related with good behavior. It is too abstract and imaginary that a character in the story obtains whatever is written by a particular pen.

Another critical issue in the book is about the use of ear bud. In the story book called 'My Ten Friends' one of the friends is ear bud. Although a medical doctor is involved in writing this book it is not safe to use ear bud routinely. On the other hand most families of community school going children cannot afford to buy ear buds. In this situation such messages can promote two things- one, children are likely start using other stuff like hair pin or traditional ear cleaner made of brass to clean their ears, two, they are likely to end up buying cheap ear buds suspected to be made of used cotton collected from hospital waste and are sold by street vendors.

6.2   Save the Children

6.2.1   Introduction

Save the Children is a child-centeredorganization committed to the protection of children from all sorts of violence, abuse and exploitation. It is also committed to protect child rights to education and health. It supports programs that are proven to promote learning in school and in the community.

Under the basic education program, it works with primary schools, focusing on bringing out-of-school children to school, involving teachers in adopting active teaching and learning methods, and boosting school management committees' capacity to support child friendly learning in school. It also works with schools, teaches and communities to support primary grade children's early reading, writing and numerical skills.

Save the Children has been working in Nepal for more than 30 years in the field of child rights in different parts of country through partnerships with the government and local authorities and schools to Increase accountability and strengthen capacity of education institutions.

One of the major focuses of the organization is to support the promotion of early grade reading. For this purpose it has published a series of reading and instructional materials. According to the task assigned by the USAID, all the early grade reading materials produced by the organization should be reviewed to ensure their appropriateness in terms of content, level and their quality. Altogether Save the Children developed five types of early grade reading materials namely, Calendar with Children's Songs, Story Cards, Big Story

Books, Flash Cards and Sentence Cards with Story Lines. The findings of the review are separately presented in the following way.

6.2.2 *Type of the Materials Developed/Used*

6.2.2.1 Calendar with Children's Songs

Save the Children has developed a calendar with children's song. It can be used for students as well as teachers.

a) **Objectives**

The objective of the material is to enhance the reading habit of children with comprehension.

b) **Contents covered**

The material covers contents such as, fruits, animals, family members and natural entities. All the descriptions are in rhymes or in poem form.

c) **Content Appropriateness**

Descriptions are culturally appropriate. Presentation of male and female is balanced. However, the description of a pretty girl, her outfit and behavior indicates the existence of some stereotype image.

d) **Level Appropriateness**

The level is not mentioned in the material. However, most of the description, word use, and spelling are within the level of early grade except some difficult words such as *Basundhara.*

e) **Physical Quality**

Calendar is printed in black and white, however, the letter size and pictures presented are quite appropriate and relevant. The main advantage of this material is the provision of hanging on the wall. It helps students to see the reading materials daily.

f) **Overall Impression**

Calendar is appropriate in terms of its shape. It can be used to enhance reading competence of the students. However, it needs to specify the intended user group in the material.

g) **Suggestions**

This type of material is quite useful for developing reading performance of the students. Therefore, it can be used in other subjects so that the reading performance of the students can be raised.

6.2.2.2 Story Cards

The other material which Save the Children has developed is Story Cards. There are altogether 8 cards in use. The intended users of these materials are students as well as the teachers.

a) Objectives

The objectives of the materials are to enable students to use *Matra* in the alphabet and enable them to read aloud.

b) Contents covered

Story (Contents should be found out from the materials)

c) Content Appropriateness

The contents of the materials are good for promoting the inclusiveness. It is equally useful for promoting the girls' activities.

d) Level Appropriateness

Cards are useful according to the grade of the children. The language used in the cards is very simple and texts are also very interesting. It can be hoped that children can enjoy reading these cards. There are 20 to 40 words in cards. As far as the complexity of words is concerned, single word is used in most of the cards except in some cards.

e) Physical Quality

Letters used in the cards are appropriate in terms of their size and the level of the children. All the cards are attractive though they are in black and white.

f) Overall Impression

Cards are useful for teaching alphabets. As we know Nepali alphabets have very complexity in writing. These cards can be used to teach those complexities.

g) Suggestions

There should be indication of level, grade, and competency area of learning at the back of each story card so that teachers can use them accordingly.

6.2.2.3 Big Story Books

Save the Children has also developed Big Story Books. There are 6 story books in total. These are intended to use on newly literate students. They can also be used by the teachers.

a) Objectives

The objective of those story books is to familiarize students with the printed materials.

b) Contents covered

The book contains the stories related to animal/insect world related to children environment.

c) Content Appropriateness

The books are appropriate from the cultural appropriateness. The male and female characters used in the story books make the book balanced in gender. No human rights and child rights were discussed in the book since it mostly used animal/insects etc. The story books are not applicable in form of social inclusion and curricular linkage.

d) Level Appropriateness

The sentences used in the book are longer than the level of the intended readers, almost 9 words per sentence is used. Language used is simple but some words seem to be complex in terms of intended readers. Altogether 85 words are used in one big book.

The used words are usually single, but some complex and conjunct words are also used. In terms of comprehension and error and punctuation, the book is satisfactory.

e) Physical Quality

The text size used in the books is appropriate. The pictures are relevant to the story and big, clear and attractive; however, it can be more effective if the pictures are colorful.

f) Overall Impression

The story books seem satisfactory for the intended user groups. The book can develop the reading habit and capacity and visualization of children. However, the book can be made more interesting to the children by making proper curricular linkage.

g) Suggestions

The sentences used are comparatively longer. The material is applicable for a small class for round table illustration.

6.2.2.4 Flash Cards

The other material which Save the Children has developed is flash cards. There are 48 flash cards. These are intended to use by the teachers.

a) Objectives

The objectives of flash cards are to teach grapho-phonemic awareness and recognition of pictures with words and vice versa.

b) Contents covered

Eight of these flash cards contain the two single letters, twenty flashcards contain two letter words with diacritics, and two flashcards contain two words with conjunct letters. The other two contains three single letter words. There are 23 flashcards that contains three letter words. Only one flashcard has three letter words with conjunct. And remaining two flashcards have four single letter words.

c) Content Appropriateness

The words used in the flashcards are culturally appropriate. The word with picture of devil with sword is not found appropriate to the early graders. The contents are well covered by the flash cards. The words used are 1000, 1500, and 2000 in grades 1, 2 and 3 respectively.

d) Level Appropriateness

The language used is simple and good for the level intended. The local words used helps in enhancing the comprehension of the children. No differentiation is found in children reading level. The single words are used in flash cards. Spelling and punctuation errors are not found. The single words used are 12 words, 43 are *matra* words and 3 conjunct words are used.

e) Physical Quality

The size of the flash cards is appropriate. The colored used is black and white, however, they are simple, clear and attractive. The size is found appropriate to the early graders. Picture size is fine and the used pictures are clear.

f) Overall Impression

The overall impression that the book creates is satisfactory.

g) Suggestions

The number of words with conjunct letters can be increased. It would be better to prepare cards with different ==cultures (sath icon) only==. The pictures could be colored to make more impression to readers.

6.2.2.5 Cards with Story Lines

a) Objectives

The objectives of the story lines are to improve reading fluency of the intended users, to read and write 3 to 5 word sentences.

b) Contents covered

Familiar activities that students encounter almost every day.

c) Content Appropriateness

The contents used are more factual and related to rural children's everyday life and nature. The gender balance is not found as only mother is related with cooking, vegetable cutting etc. but father is not mentioned.

d) Level Appropriateness

Familiar words and sentences are used so it will improve the fluency and comprehensiveness. Number of words used is 3 to 5. There are no spelling and punctuation errors observed. The size of the words is appropriate for the intended groups.

e) Physical Quality

The size is appropriate. However, the description of Saturday on the card might be abstract concept for the children because of the provision of holiday on the day.

f) Overall Impression

The sentence cards can be quite useful to enhance the reading performance of the children

g) Suggestions

It would be better if level, grade, competency are mentioned on the back of the sentence cards so that users can use it as instructions.

6.3   World Education/Rato Bangala Foundation

6.3.1   Introduction

World Education is working with Rato Bangala Foundation to increase the quality of reading materials available for use in the junior grades; and train teachers to increase the use of reading materials, engage parents and communities in their children's efforts to learn to read. Rato Bangala School is a leading private school that has an Outreach Program linking

it to support government schools. It also has a Foundation that focuses on teacher training in conjunction with the Bank Street School and Kathmandu University.

Rato Bangala has been a pioneer in developing reading materials and books from their foundation and has a commercial entity Rato Bangala Kitaab to market books and materials produced. Through this partnership a team of 54 writers, early grade reading experts, teacher training experts, literacy experts, artists, graphic designers have developed a comprehensive early grade reading program that is being piloted and then rolled out to 1,400 government schools over the next two years mainly in remote districts.

Through the program 'Let's read, learn and know', the learners under the umbrella are provided with different thirteen types of materials divided into six levels. To make the materials easily identifiable to students and teachers, these materials are colored differently for different levels.

6.3.2 *Type of the Materials Developed/Used*

Types of materials developed by the organization are: 1. Reading cards 2. Flex chart of boy and girl 3. Charts 4. Dice (wooden) 5. Magic Ball 6. Poster (letter card) 7. Sponge letter 8. Game cards 9. Reading poem cards 10. Small and medium cards 11. Library activity cards 12. Library books 13. Teacher's activity book

6.3.2.1 Reading cards

a) **Objective**
Reading cards are used for gradual development of reading by students. Such cards are graded from level one through six. Cards for each level are colored differently so that the users could figure out the appropriate card for appropriate level easily. There are altogether 85 cards, with back to back contents. Each card is leveled with the heading and reading level at the foot of the card.

b) **Contents covered**
Reading level 1: In this level the students can read graphemes, syllables and simple words containing two to four syllabic words. This cards are used for recognition of single letters. This level contains 14 steps with 22 types of reading cards. Cards for this level are in light yellow color.
Reading level 2: In this level the students learn the words combined with vowels. 21 reading cards in 10 steps are prepared and used in this level. Cards instructed as 'look at the pictures and Read' help students read simple sentences. It is coded with green color.
Reading level 3: In this level the students are facilitated to recognize and read the conjunct words. Cards in this level are in light blue color. 10 cards divided into six steps are available.
Reading level 4: The students are enabled to read simple sentences and act accordingly. Cards colored in light orange are divided into 2 steps with altogether 10 cards (6+4).
Reading level 5: Students are enabled to read shorter and longer simple sentences. Cards in light pink are divided into two steps. Informative paragraphs in 3 levels in step 1 and paragraphs regarding 12 months including festivals celebrated throughout the year are introduced. There are 18 cards for this level.

Reading level 6: In this level 13 library books are provided to the students for free reading.

c) **Content appropriateness**
Contents are organized appropriately for different levels.

d) **Level appropriateness**
Reading cards are already leveled in terms of the reading level of the students. First the reading level of the students is measured and then the appropriate graded materials are provided. So, the level appropriateness is considered while preparing the cards.

e) **Physical quality**
Physical quality of the reading cards is appropriate in that they are laminated and also considered in terms of font size, 4 color, with color coding to denote reading levels and are cost effective.

f) **Overall impression**
Varied materials prepared level wise with instructions to teachers through teacher's manual are impressive and result oriented.

6.3.2.2 Flex picture of boy and girl

a) **Objective**
The teachers use the flex picture of boy and girl with two objectives: a. developing social characteristics in students, and b. developing vocabularies through the description of physical activities.

b) **Contents covered**
Students start with naming the boy and girl shown in the picture. Subject matter is presented in three thematic concepts: Social traits/ characteristics; emotions/ experiences; and Festivals.
Preparation class: In this level the students are asked to name the boy and girl shown in the picture. Then they are requested to write the names given by different students in the board. Students select the most appropriate name from the list and then they will have an agreement to call by the selected name to the boy and girl.
Theme one: Social qualities/traits/characteristics
Students are asked to discuss on what good habits of the boys and girls they like and are encouraged to develop such thing in them.
Theme two: Feelings/emotions
Students are encouraged to discuss on their feelings and emotions and the words representing such things are familiarized.
Theme three: festivals
Different festivals observed in Nepalese society are discussed. Teachers list all the festivals and students are asked to name and describe about the festivals. Further they are asked to write about at least one festival as home assessment.

c) **Content appropriateness**
Contents are organized appropriately for different levels.

d) **Level appropriateness**
All the materials are graded in terms of students' level of reading, so are appropriateness.

e) **Physical quality**
Physical quality of the flex picture card is appropriate in terms of visibility and appropriateness.

f) Overall impression

A flex picture card of boy and girl is used in different ways to discuss on various things aiming at enhancing vocabulary and getting the students to discuss on various themes/subjects.

6.3.2.3 Flex charts

a) Objective

A total of 15 Flex charts are prepared for classroom teaching which are hung on the walls of the classroom. These charts are looked at by the students to learn the intended subject matter. Prepared from beginning level to the level four, these charts are used to teach vowels, consonants, conjuncts, word recognition, formation and use of words in simple sentences.

b) Contents covered

There are four types of such charts. First is song chart (objective: to teach sound and rhyme. Second one is picture chart (objective: to build vocabulary and letter and word development through pictures). Third chart is alphabet and vowel chart (Objective: to teach vowel and consonants). The last chart is frequently used word chart. Each chart has got 50 words selected from the curriculum prescribed.

c) Content appropriateness

Contents are organized appropriately for different levels.

d) Level appropriateness

All the materials are graded in terms of students' level of reading, so are appropriate.

e) Physical quality

Physical quality of the flex charts is appropriate in terms of visibility and appropriate. Size of these flex is 2'x3'.

f) Overall impression

These charts seem to be appropriate to enhance vocabulary among students.

g) Suggestions

The words presented in the chart are not organized in terms of the level of difficulty in pronunciation and also in terms of concrete/abstract concept. It would be better if they were organized in this way.

6.3.2.4 Dice (wooden)

a) Objective

Three sets of sixteen pieces each wooden and colored dices are there. These are used to teach students vowels, consonants, diacritics and numbers playing simultaneously with the dice.

b) Contents covered

Vowels, consonants, diacritics and numbers

c) Content appropriateness

Building blocks of language are appropriate.

d) Level appropriateness

All the materials are graded in terms of students' level of reading, so are appropriateness.

e) Physical quality

Wooden dice are durable and attractive.

f) Overall impression

These materials are impressive in terms of the age level of the students.

6.3.2.5 Magic ball

a) Objective

It is a locally available ball used creatively by the teachers to teach letters and words to the students dividing them into different groups. It is a game instrument to enhance learning with fun.

b) Contents covered

Syllables, diacritic and words

c) Content appropriateness

Appropriate to the objective as well as students reading level.

d) Level appropriateness

It is graded in terms of students' level of reading, so is appropriate.

e) Physical quality

It is a small, light and colorful rubber ball which is soft and appropriate to be handled by the students.

f) Overall impression

Students might learn by playing, so magic ball is impressive and attractive.

6.3.2.6 Poster (letter card)

a) Objective

There are five sets of letter cards in a poster size. These are used to recognize syllable structure and vowel-consonant combination (*barakhari*); to form simple words and write the syllables and words in their notebook.

b) Contents covered

Syllables, diacritics and words

c) Content appropriateness

The chart of *barakhari* is appropriate to achieve the targeted goal.

d) Level appropriateness

All the materials are graded in terms of students' level of reading, so are appropriate.

e) Physical quality

These are of 17'x23' printed material. This is preliminary in a poster form but in classroom, teacher can use it by cutting into pieces as per the lesson plan. This is a two color material with printed in art board.

f) Overall impression

Poster (letter card) hung on the wall familiarize the students with *barakhari* table, so is appropriate.

6.3.2.7 Sponge letters

a) Objective

There are 20 sponge letter which are used to familiarize the students the structures of the letters and formation of the words by joining vowels and consonants letters practically. 50 words can be formed with the help of such sponge letters.

b) Contents covered

Phonemes (vowel, consonants) 10 sponge letters. *Matras* 9 sponge letters

c) **Content appropriateness**
Appropriate to the objective mentioned.

d) **Level appropriateness**
All the materials are graded in terms of students' level of reading, so are appropriateness.

e) **Physical quality**
It is made up of sponge, which is soft and easier to be handled by the students.

f) **Overall impression**
These materials are appropriate to teach letter structure and word formation.

6.3.2.8 Game cards

a) **Objective**
There are 414 pieces of game cards consisting letter, words and pictures. The objective of using the material is to facilitate the students to recognize pictures and match out the names with pictures form level 1 to level 3.

b) **Contents covered**
There are 12 headings with pictures. Headings are: body parts, vegetables, fruits, domestic animals, wild animals, edibles, birds, our world, home apparatus, school apparatus, clothes and means of transportation.

c) **Content appropriateness**
Appropriate to the objective mentioned.

d) **Level appropriateness**
All the materials are graded in terms of students' level of reading, so are appropriate.

e) **Physical quality**
It is four colored, printed, glossy laminated material printed in art board.

f) **Overall impression**
These materials are appropriate to associate pictures and words.

g) **Suggestions**
The teacher should be well trained to handle and manage the cards in classroom because their number is very high.

6.3.2.9 Poem cards

a) **Objective**
Different 8 poem cards with 16 poems/rhymes (two poem/rhyme in each card in both sides) intended to enhance the reading level of the students from level 1 to 5.

b) **Contents covered**
Thematic concepts like animal's dwelling, family life, relationship, units of measurement, color terms, friendship and counting are covered.

c) **Content appropriateness**
Contents covered are related to daily activities/life of the children, so appropriate to be covered.

d) **Level appropriateness**
All the materials are graded in terms of students' level of reading, so are appropriateness.

e) **Physical quality**
These are A4 sized, multi-colored cards printed in glossy laminated art board papers. These are easy to handle, durable and attractive.

f) Overall impression

Poems presented in the cards help enhancing reading level of the students.

g) Suggestions

Additional useful themes can be included.

6.3.2.10   Small and medium books

a) Objective

Different 43 small and 13 medium sized books' with varied contents are given to the students with an objective to encourage the student towards free reading. These books are leading towards enhancing reading among students after they use reading cards.

b) Contents covered

Contents covered are: sky, vegetable garden, animal sounds, flowers and vegetable, name of the animal's offspring, activities of different animals, counting system, social life, moral lessons, sanitation, health, means of transportation etc.

c) Content appropriateness

Contents covered are related to daily activities/life of the children, so appropriate to be covered.

d) Level appropriateness

All the materials are graded in terms of students' level of reading, so are appropriateness.

e) Physical quality

These are A4 and A5 sized books which have glossy laminated cover. However, the inner pages are printed in maplitho paper. The books are attractive and very appealing to the students in promoting self-learning.

f) Overall impression

Contents presented in the books help enhancing reading level of the students.

g) Suggestions

Additional useful themes can be included.

6.3.2.11   Library activity cards

a) Objective

There are four library activity cards which aims to develop vocabulary and Enhance reading comprehension through fun activities.

b) Contents covered

Collecting words from library books, retelling the stories, reading stories, acting and making dramas.

c) Content appropriateness

Contents covered are related to daily activities/life of the children, so appropriate to be covered.

d) Level appropriateness

All the materials are graded in terms of students' level of reading, so are appropriateness.

e) Physical quality

These are A5 cards printed in glossy laminated art board paper and are 4 colored.

f) Overall impression

Contents presented in the books help students getting involved in different activities

g) Suggestions
Additional useful themes can be included.

6.3.2.12   Library books

a) Objective
These are level 6 books, which are selected and bought from the market of varied publications. These have an objective to enhance reading by making the classroom like a library.

b) Contents covered
Altogether 113 books of short stories and poems on varied subjects.

c) Content appropriateness
Contents of the book serve different interests of the students, so appropriate.

d) Level appropriateness
All the materials are graded in terms of students' level of reading, so are appropriate.

e) Physical quality
A wide variety of books are selected which are attractive.

f) Overall impression
Contents presented in the books help students getting involved in intensive reading.

g) Suggestions
Need to include such materials which use modern Nepali language. Since some materials have longer sentences, they need to be replaced by some additional useful books.

7   Summary of the Findings

A total of 119 (63 Nepali and 56 mother language) early grade (1-3) reading textbooks materials were reviewed. Moreover, supplementary readers of 16 languages were also reviewed. In addition to this, all the teaching learning materials of Room to Read, Save the Children and World Education/Rato Bangala Foundation were also specifically evaluated.

Based on the analysis of the information from resource persons, observation of early grade reading materials by the study team, analysis of instruction materials developed by different organizations and NGOs and review of early grade reading materials, the following findings are derived:

Content Appropriateness

Cultural appropriateness
- Almost all the materials were found to be better than average in terms of cultural appropriateness. All Nepali textbooks were found appropriate in cultural contents, however, in some places, it is necessary to address the issue.
- Textbooks of Mugali, Tharu (Madhya), Limbu, Sunuwar and Nepal Bhasa included cultural contents thoroughly in a logical order. It was found that books on Tamang devnagari were found better than that of Tamang Sambhota.
- Textbooks on Athar Magarat, Awadhi, Bajjika, Bhojpuri were found to be in the best position. Books on Chamling, Magar Dhoot were found in better position. Books on Dhimal and Yakkha were found in good position.
- Books on Bantawa were found in weak position. Books on Rajbanshi were found weaker as compared to others in case of cultural appropriateness.

- Mostly the books need to address the cultural diversity in Nepalese context and incorporate local contexts. As in Simrik publication's books, it was found some contents even discriminating specific ethnic group which should be improved. Even in the case of CDC's Nepali textbooks, it was found not including the costumes of terai in pictures of people.

- Regarding culturally appropriateness in supplementary readers, Chamling, Bhojpuri, Doleti, Limbu and Nepal Bhasa were found to be highly satisfied. However, supplementery readers of Maithili, Thakali and Urdu languages were reported to be poor, except in one or two indicators.

- Room to Read published varieties of reading materials for enhancing reading skills and developing reading habits among children. It also supports schools in establishing libraries. It had produced altogether six types of materials. The selected materials were found culturally appropriate, however, the translated materials from English or other languages were inappropriate to Nepali culture.

- Save the Children published a series of reading and instructional materials in order to support early grade reading. Altogether, Save the Children developed five types of early grade reading materials namely, Calendar with Children's Songs, Story Cards, Big Story Books, Flash Cards and Sentence Cards with Story Lines.

Instructional materials developed by Save the Children were found culturally appropriate.

- World Education in association with Rato Bangala Foundation through the program 'Let's read, learn and know', were provided with different thirteen types of materials divided into six levels. Types of materials developed by the organization were: 1. Reading cards 2. Flex chart of boy and girl 3. Charts 4. Dice (wooden) 5. Magic Ball 6. Poster (letter card) 7. Sponge letter 8. Game cards 9. Reading poem cards 10. Small and medium cards 11. Library activity cards 12. Library books and 13. Teacher's activity book. All of these materials were found culturally appropriate.

Social inclusion

- In terms of social inclusion, no single pattern was observed in the textbooks in their approach to these dimensions. Irrespective of language, publishers and grades the textbooks were better in some aspects and not satisfactory in others. For example, most had tried to ensure representation of more than one social diversity of Nepal and had tried to ensure equal representation of female and male figures.

- Textbooks were not balanced in incorporating social inclusion dimensions. Since the early grade textbooks have specific purposes and cannot be more elaborate therefore it is not possible to touch upon all the dimensions on each and every lesson. However in some aspects they were very behind. For example almost all the textbooks failed to ensure representation of people with disability and their issues. Some had only touched upon but some others totally ignored this dimension.

- Most mother tongue based textbooks had been able to localize the contents. However only very limited textbooks (e.g. Sunuwar, Awadhi and Tharu Madhyachhetra) were found better in helping students build a respectful and harmonious relationship with each other. It appeared that most textbooks writers and publishers paid little to no attention to the diverse levels of language competence that student bring to the classrooms.

- Moreover, the mother tongue based textbooks seemed to believe that students from the respective MT who come to the classroom are well versed in their respective mother tongues. This is reflected in the textbooks as most of them irrespective of the grade, medium of language and publishers were not appropriate to the students with limited to no exposure to the language of the textbook. Nepali language textbooks of all three grades were worse in this respect.

- No pattern was observed in the supplementary readers in terms of their social inclusiveness. Some books were better in some indicators and some in others. Nevertheless best among the MT supplementary books were Bhojpuri, Limbu and Nepal Bhasa, and worse among them were Gurung and Urdu.

- In four languages of supplementary readers (among 16 languages) namely Doteli, Limbu, Magar and Nepal bhasa reviewers found materials highly appropriate in integration of cultural contents in the texts, figures and exercises. However, in Awadhi and Gurung they found total negation of the inclusion of the same. Similarly, in Urdu it was found remote inclusion.

- Chamling language supplementary readers were observed to have satisfied all indicators of social inclusion. Regarding social inclusion, Bhojpuri, Limbu and Nepal

133

Bhasa were best in developing skills, behaviors, attitudes and understandings that enable students to construct equal and respectful relationship across different social backgrounds. Gurung and Urdu languages satisficied least on this criteria.

- Supplementary readers were found poor in satisfying the criteria of inclusive of disability except Chamling (highly satisfied), Bantawa and Dangaura Tharu (partially satisfied).

- Contents and illustrations used in the materials of Room to Read, Save the Children and WE/RBF were socially and culturally inclusive. However, some gender stereotypical images were found, such as girls alone were shown dancing in the pictures of some materials in case of Room to Read materials.

Gender balance/equality
- Token representation of female and male figures in number is not the only measure to ensure gender equality and gender justice. Viewing from this perspective most textbooks had not been able to incorporate aspects that would help children think differently in terms of gender roles/responsibilities, images, power relation, etc. They were still unconsciously reinforcing gender stereotypes.
- While classroom and school processes are more critical in inculcating a culture of equality in children and deconstructing gender stereotypes, textbooks, other learning materials and instructional materials are also very important means to behavior change and habit formation. Therefore, such materials were expected to pay attention to subtle nuances that cultivate and/or reinforce gender stereotypes, gender roles and power relations.
- Interestingly, when viewed from linguistic lens the status of gender balance corresponded with the general gender equality status of the caste ethnicity. For example, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Limbu and Sunuwar language textbooks were better than Rajbanshi, Maithili and Bhojpuri in this dimension.
- Supplementary readers, however didn't correspond with the gender status of the language community that they represent. For example in treating female and male equitably all were at average level except Bantawa, which was at the lower end.
- Presentation of male and female was balanced in materials produced by Save the Children. However, the description of a pretty girl, her outfit and behavior indicated the existence of some stereotype images. The contents of the materials were good for promoting the inclusiveness. It was equally useful for promoting the girls' activities.
- Materials of WE/RBF had contents that were found related to daily activities/life of the children. Materials of WE/RBF were found promoting gender balance.

Human and child rights
- The textbooks were assessed from five indicators related to human and child rights. These specific indicators were developed keeping in view the age groups and development stages of grade 1 to 3 children. Most textbooks in terms of this dimension and corresponding indicators were at different stages. Only few were better in all the indicators. Only 5 MT based textbooks (Awadhi, Bhojpuri, Chamling, Sunuwar, Limbu, and Tharu Madhyachhetra) were best in instructing children to respect other's rights.

- Most were better in ensuring children's right to participation. However, the indicators were not incorporated throughout the book in balanced way.
- The materials of Save the Children, Room to Read and WE/RBF were found addressing the human and child rights as these materials promote learning with fun, handy to use, included contents respecting others rights and their security.

Curricular linkage
- Nearly 40 percent of the Nepali textbooks were found to have lessons and exercises in line with grade wise objectives in most of the cases followed by 28.6 percent with no balance in all the chapters and exercises. Moreove, nearly 25 percent of experts accepted that they are thoroughly included and sequenced and properly sequence in logical order with full satisfaction.

- As reported by the Nepali language experts, 29.4 percent of the textbooks can be taught using local materials followed by 30.3 of them with little provision and 27.7 also have the provision in all the chapters but not in a balanced way.

- It was reported by 53 percent (34.5% in majority of cases and 18.5% in all cases) of the resource persons that textbooks provided varieties of exercises and activities focusing on all the components of reading. Majority of the experts (35.3% in most of the cases and 20.2% in all cases) further expressed that exercises are balanced to the objectives of reading skills in the curriculum

- Textbooks of the five languages (Mugali, Tharu Madhyachhetra, Limbu, Awadhi and Bajjika) have made the provision of exercises balanced to the objectives of reading skills in the curriculum. Bantawa and Rajbanshi language textbooks, however, have very little provision of exercises in line with the objectives of reading skills in the curriculum. Similarly, textbooks of Tharu, Gurung, Maithili and Yakkha languages have inadequate provision of exercises balanced to the objectives of reading skills in the curriculum.

- With regard to curricular linkage, experts further reported that Awadhi language textbook is acceptable and appropriate for early grade children. Other acceptable textbooks other than Awadhi are Mugali and Limbu (highest rating in 7 of the assessment indicator) followed by Bajjika and Bhojpuri (highest rating in 6 assessment indicator).

- Nepali textbooks published by JBD and Simrik were found to have touched the indicator of lessons and exercises are in line with grade-wise curriculum objectives. Early grade textbooks published by CDC have met this indicator fully and logically in that early grade textbooks published by CDC have lessons and exercises in line with grade-wise curriculum.

- Regarding assessment of curriculum linkage in the reading materials, CDC published early grade textbooks have met two indicator fully and other indicator are addressed in majority of the cases. Publishers can be ranked in order of meeting the indicator of curricular linkage from meeting the indicator mostly to decreasing order are Pustak Prakasan, Satyal, Ekta, Megha, Times, Vidyarthi and United.

- For non-Nepali speakers the CDC early grade textbooks were found better in comparison to Nepali speaking experts in all the indicators of evaluating textbooks for curricular linkage. It indicates that for Nepali speaking experts there is greater

room for improvement in early grade Nepali textbooks than non-Nepali speaking experts.

- All the teaching learning materials produced by Room to Read were based on the MoE prescribed curricula therefore they were appropriately linked with objectives and contents of the Nepali language curricula.

Level Appropriateness

Phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness
- In terms of percentage distribution, the indicators of grapho-phonemic awareness thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order in the 46.2 percent of the textbooks whereas the same appeared across most of the texts but remained with a few gaps in 37 percent textbooks. 0.8 percent textbooks either not included this area at all or only lightly touched the area.

- Viewed in terms of individual languages, the textbook for Nepal Bhasa, Limbu, Mugali, Magar Dhoot and Tharu were found to be excellent in the sense they have higher scores in all the indicators. In contrast, Rajbansi, Maithili and Bantawa were found to be lacking most of the features of phonemic and grapho-phonemic awareness. Textbooks for Tharu Madhyachhetra, Sunuwar and Chamling were found to be in the average margins.

- While compared Nepali language textbooks from different publications the textbooks from CDC, Satyal and Ekta were found having included most of the indicators appeared across most of the text whereas the textbooks from Airawati, Asia and Allied were rated lowest in this regard.

- Interestingly, the evaluator speaking Nepali as the second language has rated all the indicators higher than the ratings done by the evaluator speaking Nepali as his/her mother tongue. It indicates that for Nepali speaking experts there is greater room for improvement in early grade Nepali textbooks than non-Nepali speaking experts.

Fluency
- In terms of fluency majority of the reading materials (37.8% fully satisfied, and 32.8% satisfied in the majority of the cases) included the contents giving sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to achieve greater fluency and comprehension. In contrast 10.9 percent materials were evaluated as having only lightly touched this aspect whereas 1.7 percent materials did not include this area at all.

- Mugali, and Awadhi found to have thourghly included and sequenced in a logical order in all indicators of fluency. Tharu Madhyachhetra, Nepali Bhasa and Magar Dhoot appeared the features across most of the texts but remained with a few gaps. Yakkha, Bantawa and Nepali textbooks were lacking the area in that they were low in maintaining the expected level of fluency.

- The textbooks from Bhundi Puran, CDC, Ekta and Satyal appeared to have satisfied with the indicators across most of the texts with a few gaps in the textbooks from. The textbooks from JBD was evaluated as touching the areas only lightly.

Vocabulary

- Most of the reading materials (46.2%) did not introduce new vocabulary with explanation before reading a text. After completing the reading of the text, certain words were discussed in the exercises in most of the reading materials (36.1% and 26.9%) though this task calls for further adequacy. In a very few reading materials (7.6%) words given in the text were ordered in terms of monosyllabic to multisyllabic. Dictation of words was also found missing in several reading materials.

- The textbooks for Tharu Madhyachhetra, Awadhi and Dhimal were found excellent in that the contents expected for the fluency were almost thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order with a few gaps. Textbooks for Rajbansi, Tamang Sambhota and Mugali were evaluated as having the contents for fluency in most of the indicators below the expected level.

- The materials of the Room to Read, Save the Children and WE/RBF were found providing an optimum mix of opportunities to children to develop and practice vocabulary.

Comprehension

- In the textbooks (31.9%) the students were thoroughly asked to read out a lesson and are asked questions about that whereas 35.3 percent textbooks appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps in terms of all the indicators for comprehension. Other language skills (apart from reading) were not integrated into the exercises of comprehension in 8.4 percent of the textbooks whereas 16.8 percent textbooks thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.

- Language wise, Athara magarat, Awadhi, Limbu and Nepal Bhasa textbooks thoroughly included almost all the area and sequenced in a logical order. Dhimal, Bhojpuri, Bajjika and Sunuwar have the contents appeared across many of the texts but not balanced in all the aspects of comprehension.

Contents

- Thirty to thirty five percent of the textbooks were reported to have used punctuation marks, content related pictures, placement of the pictures and shape and size of the pictures thoroughly and logical order in the textbooks published for early graders.

- Regarding overall comparison of the mother tongue textbooks across the given indicator, Mugali, Nepal Bhasa language textbooks have addressed all the indicator except the indicator of multi-colored and well-illustrated pictures in the textbooks of Mugali Language is found absent. Limbu, Awadhi and Bajjika language textbooks also have satisfied majority of the indicator of content evaluation. Remaining language textbooks are reported to be less effective in line with the content evaluation.

- While comparing publication wise textbooks through different indicators of content appropriateness, textbooks published by CDC for early grade children are comparatively better than the others. Among ten indicators, five are fully met and

other five indicators are addressed in majority of the cases regarding content appropriateness as per the level of early grade children. Comparatively better textbooks published by other publishers are Atharai, Asia, United, Vidyarthi, Satyal, Ekta, and Sunrise in decreasing order of following the indicator of level of content.

- Limbu, Magar, Awadhi, Bhojpuri and Urdu language supplementary readers have met most of the indicator of content appropriate to the grade level of the children. Chamling, Maithili, Nepal Bhasa and Thakali language supplementary books were found not to have satisfied majority of the indicator of content appropriateness. These supplementary books need more revision to satisfy most of the indicators of levels of content.

- Contents of the materials were found organized appropriately for different levels. Instruction materials were graded in terms of students' level of reading.

Reading levels of children
- The mother tongue textbook of Awadhi was excellent in all aspects as it scored 4 in all measuring tools of reading levels for the children, whereas Rajbanshi and Bantawa were found to be poor textbook as they scored (0-1) in each category.

- All the materials developed by Room to Read were found graded in terms of students' level of reading. These materials were appropriate for lower grades and beginner readers, and small sized class.
- The materials produced by World Education/Rato Bangala Foundation were appropriate to the objective as well as students' reading level.

Physical Aspects
- The physical quality of textbooks (Nepali as well as mother tongue) in terms of their size, shape, binding, font size used in the text, students' level and durability was found to be relevant.

- Regarding the physical quality of the textbooks of CDC, the evaluators of both Nepali native speaker and Nepali as a second language speaker assessed appropriate in terms of their size, binding, and durability, students' level and font size. However, it was identified that their attraction was lesser as compared to private publishers and Room to read, Save the Children and World Education because these materials were not multicolor.

- The evaluators assessed supplementary materials differently in terms of their size and shape though they were almost similar in nature. However they were found to be agreed that the physical aspect of supplementary materials was very good.

- Room to Read developed wooden dice, big reading book, flip chart, diacritic recognition cards, booklets, and self-reading materials (story books) which were found to be durable and attractive.

- Save the Children developed calendar with children's songs, story cards, big story books, flash cards and cards with story lines for enhancing reading abilities of the children. The physical quality of the materials was found to be appropriate in terms of attractiveness, size of the materials, font size and durability.

- Physical quality of the materials produced by WE/RBF was found appropriate in that they were laminated and also considered in terms of font size, four colour, with color coding to denote reading levels and were cost effective in that they are distributed free of cost to the children. All the materials were found to be attractive, colorful, durable and easy to handle.

8 Conclusion

All the reading materials including textbooks, supplementary readers and instructional materials were found to be appropriate in their size and shape. These materials can also be used as instructional materials while teaching reading ability to the children. However, some of them are not attractive because of the black and white color.

As most of the private publishers produce grammer books, however, theoretically, the early graders should not be taught grammar. It hinders them to learn other reading skills. Functional grammar can be taught from grade four. Such functional grammar can be the part of the lesson incorporated in an integrated way.

Despite the inclusion of cultural contents appropriately in the reading materials, some materials still lack the contents of cultural diversities. The translated materials from English or other languages were inappropriate to Nepali culture and they need to modify according to the culture of the locality concerned.

Textbooks were not balanced in incorporating social inclusion dimensions. Almost all the textbooks failed to ensure representation of people with disability and their issues. Mother tongue based textbooks had been able to localize the contents but failed to include diverse cultures in the textbooks.

Nepali language textbooks of all three grades were worse in respect to the students with limited or no exposure to the language. Supplementary books of Bhojpuri, Limbu and Nepal Bhasa were found to be best in terms of societal representation, however, the materials developed from Gurung and Urdu were found worse.

Supplementary readers were found poor in addressing the inclusive of disability except Chamling (highly satisfied), Bantawa and Dangaura Tharu (partially satisfied). Most textbooks had not been able to incorporate aspects that would help children think differently in terms of gender roles/responsibilities, images, power relation, etc. The reading materials were found to be unable to address the gender stereotypes. However, WE/RBF were found addressing the human and child rights, respecting others rights and their security.

Most of the materials were found better in ensuring children's right to participation. However, the child rights and human rights were not incorporated throughout the book in balanced way. Nepali textbooks were found to have lessons and exercises in line with grade wise objectives in most of the cases. In case of CDC textbooks, lessons and exercises were found to be highly line with the curricular linkage.

Grapho-phonemic awareness was thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order in Nepali textbooks as well as in the MT textbooks. Contents were found giving sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to achieve greater fluency and comprehension. However, some textbooks are found to be insufficient to incorporate these exercises.

Introducing vocabulary was almost missing in all the textbooks and dictation of words was also found missing in several reading materials. Exercises on development of comprehension were found to be insufficient to develop the skills of comprehension of the students.

Regarding the content appropriateness, textbooks published by CDC for early grade children are comparatively better than the others private publications. The mother tongue textbooks, materials developed by Room to Read and World Education/Rato Bangala Foundation were found graded in terms of students' level of reading.

All the reading materials including textbooks, supplementary readers and instructional materials were found to be appropriate in their size and shape. These materials can also be used as instructional materials while teaching reading ability to the children. However, some of them are not attractive because of the black and white color.

As most of the private publishers produce grammer books, however, theoretically, the early graders should not be taught grammar. It hinders them to learn other reading skills. Functional grammar can be taught from grade four. Such functional grammar can be the part of the lesson incorporated in an integrated way.

9   Recommendations

The following recommendations are made for the improvement of early grade reading materials in Nepal:

- Most books were lacking the contents on human and child rights, and those which were included with, even were not well organized to the context for easier reading for the students as per their level. It must be improved through activities and exercises and stories that students should cultivate.
- Uniformity should be maintained in spelling and punctuation marks. The textbooks writers should get intensive training regarding the writing system and the script used for the textbooks through Curriculum Development Centre.
- Sentence length should be considered based on the grade/level of the students. The experts on cognitive sciences and child psychology and international researches on the subjects can be taken as the reference for this.
- Devnagari script is being used for most of the languages irrespective of the phonemic nature of different languages. The point to be taken into consideration is that in cases of many of the Tibeto-Burman languages, Devnagari script needs considerable modifications to represent many of the sounds appropriately. Experts on Phonetics and Phonology of the Nepalese languages may provide the best solutions for the problem if consulted.
- The writing conventions of the borrowings (from Nepali, English etc.) in case of different mother tongues should be taken into considerations for uniformity. The point here is that a word spelt in some way for Nepali (in cases of 'tatsama words') and the same word spelt differently for mother tongue may create confusion as well as unnecessary burden to the students.

- Difficult/technical words used in the lessons need explanation/meaning necessarily. A list of such words with their basic meaning should be presented at the end of the textbook or as the footnote.
- Vocabularies representing the particular culture are necessary to be included. Culture-specific words may provide a unique identity of a particular language.
- In case of the languages with different spoken varieties, a standard variety should be taken as a norm for the preparations of the textbooks. For this, consent from the authorities of the concerned language speaking communities should be sought in advance.
- Difficult/technical words used in the lessons need explanation (meaning) necessarily. More exercises to enhance comprehension is essential. Vocabularies representing the particular culture are necessary to be included. In case of the languages with different spoken varieties, a standard variety (particularly Nepali) should be taken as a norm for the preparations of the textbooks.
- There should be gradual activities for reading from syllable-word-sentence-paragraph for the improvement of reading which was is not considered in most of the textbooks.
- All the materials, especially pictures in the CDC's textbooks, should be multi-colored so that the early grade children can get clear concept of the objects and read with fun. Private publishers of Nepali supplementary books must follow CDC's guideline in terms of letter size, word count in a sentence and number of words in a lesson.
- The instructional materials of Room to Read, Save the Children and World Education/Rato Bangala Foundation were appealing and interesting to the children of early grade. These characteristics lacked in most of the CDC's and Private publishers' Nepali and mother language textbooks. CDC and the private publishers must competitively produce and use such materials that really attract the childen to read.

References

Bhalla, N. (2007). *Curriculum development*. Delhi: Authors press Global Network.

Department of Education (2007). *Teaching reading in the early grades; A teacher's handbook.* South Africa: Author.

Farr, R. & Carey, R.F. (1986). *Reading: what can be measured?* (2nd ed.). Nepal Bhasak, Delaware: International Reading Association, Inc.

Gender Equity Curriculum Policy Directorate (2001). *Equity to support learning outcomes. Cross curriculum perspectives.* Australia: Department of Education, Training and Employment.

Gove, A., & Cvelich, P. (2010). *Early reading: Igniting education for all. A report by the early grade learning community of practice.* NC: Research Triangle Institute (RTI).

Jones, R.M.(1975). Man: A course of study-A critique. In Golby, M., Greenwald, J. and West R. (Eds.). *Curriculum design.* Great Britain: The Open University.

Kelley, A.V. (2009). *The curriculum theory and practice* (6th ed.). New Delhi: SAGE Publications

Opertti, R. (n.d.). *Inclusive education and inclusive curriculum: Moving the EFA agenda forward.* Paris: UNESCO.

Ornstein, A.C., & Hunkins, F.P. (2004). *Curriculum: foundations, principles and issues* (4th ed.). Boston: Pearson Education.

RTI International. (2009). *Early grade assessment toolkit.* www.rti.org/brochures/eddata_ii_egra_lac.pdf

Snow, C.E., Burns, M.S., & Griffin, P. (Eds.). (1998). *Preventing reading difficulties in young children.* Washington, DC: National Academy Press.

UNESCO. (n.d.). *Barriers to inclusive education.* http://www.unescobkk.org/education/inclusive-education/what-is-inclusive-education/barriers-to-inclusive-education/

Annexes

Annex – 1: Framework for Review of Textbooks

<table>
<tr><td colspan="2" align="center">**NEPAL EARLY GRADE READING MATERIALS ASSESSMENT**
Research Management Cell
Kathmandu Shiksha Campus
Ramshah Path, Kathmandu</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2" align="center">**A. METADATA**</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">**1. Name of the Resource Person:** ....
    1.1 Designation ....   1.2 Address ....
    1.2 Mobile no. ....</td></tr>
<tr><td>

2. Types of materials reviewed

2.1 Textbook ⬭

2.2 Curriculum ⬭

2.3 Supplementary reading material/reader ⬭

2.4 Teaching materials ⬭

2.5 Teacher's guide ⬭

2.6 Flashcard ⬭

2.7 Picture/ story card ⬭

2.8 Others learning materials ⬭
</td><td>

3. Author(s):

  a. ……………………..

  b. ……………………..

  c. ……………………..

  d. ……………………..

  e. ....

  f. ....

  g. ....

  h. ....
</td></tr>
<tr><td>

4. Publisher
  a. CDC ⬭
  b. Private publisher ⬭
  c. Donors ⬭
  d. NGO/INGO ⬭
</td><td>

5. Title of the book:
....……

6. Grade: ……………………………

7. Language (medium) ……………………
</td></tr>
<tr><td>**8.** Year of publication:........................</td><td>**9.** Publisher's name: ……………………</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">**10.** Place of publication:........................</td></tr>
<tr><td>**11.** Coordinator………………………….</td><td>**12.** CDC personnel involved:........................</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">**13.** Individual (s) involved in assessment
    a…………………………… b...
    c…………………………… d...</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2">**14. Book profile**</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2"> e.   Total pages:....................................</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2"> f.   Font size</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2"> g.   Size of the book (Length x breadth in cm) ....</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2"> h.   Price of the book: a. listed...............   b. Not listed..............</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2"> i.   Cover page: a. Black and white ....   b. Multicolour....................</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2"> j.   Inside pages: a. Black and white ....   b. Multicolour....................</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2"> k.   Total no of lessons in the book:</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="2"> l.   Paper quality   a. type ....   b. gram ....</td></tr>
</table>

15. Lesson wise characteristics:

a. Lesson No.	b. No. of average words	c. No. of test items / exercise	d. No. of pictures	e. No. of characters	f. No. of events	g. No. of language editing errors	h. Maximum no. of words in a sentence
1							
2							
3							
4							
5							
6							
7							
8							
9							
10							
11							
12							
13							
14							
15							
16							
17							
18							
19							
20							
21							
22							
23							
24							
25							
26							
27							
28							
29							
30							
31							
32							
33							
34							
35							

B. DIMENSIONS OF EARLY GRADE READING MATERIALS ASSESSMENT

For each competency area, the material will be given a rating from 0 to 4.

- 0 = not included this area at all
- 1 = only lightly touched
- 2 = included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations
- 3 = appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.
- 4 = thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.

B.1 Content Appropriateness					
B.1.1 Cultural Appropriateness	**4**	**3**	**2**	**1**	**0**
1. Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises.					
2. Text and examples are found culturally acceptable.					
3. Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable.					
4. Exercises are found culturally acceptable.					
5. Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases.					
6. Succeeds in avoiding cultural/religious stereotypes and biases.					
7. Succeeds in avoiding caste/ethnic stereotypes and biases.					
Suggestions for maintaining cultural appropriateness:					
B.1.2 Social Inclusion	**4**	**3**	**2**	**1**	**0**
8. Lessons indicate localization of students' geographic and regional contexts.					
9. Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of disadvantaged groups.					
10. Text, examples and activities in the contents are inclusive of people with disability.					
11. Lessons and exercises develop skills, behaviors, attitudes and understandings that enable students to construct equal and respectful relationship across different social backgrounds.					
12. Material is appropriate to the learners with complete exposure to the language.					
13. Material is appropriate to the learners with limited exposure to the language.					
14. The material is appropriate to the learners with no/very limited exposure to the language.					

Suggestions for promoting social inclusion:

B.1.3 Gender Balance	4	3	2	1	0
15. Contents and examples treat both male and female equitably.					
16. Activities and exercises treat both male and female equitably.					
17. Lessons maintain balance between male and female.					
18. Contents are not gender blind.					
19. Contents are not gender neutral					
20. Lessons and exercises are gender responsive.					
21. Exercises are designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities.					

Suggestions for improving gender balance:

B.1.4 Human Rights and Child Rights	4	3	2	1	0
22. Lessons and exercises instruct children to respect others' rights.					
23. Lessons and exercises enable children to enjoy right of participation.					
24. Lessons and exercises enable children to promote their creativity.					
25. Lessons and exercises adequately address child protection from health and safety perspectives.					
26. Lessons and exercises promote children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, artistic expressions).					

Suggestions for encouraging human and child rights:

B.1.5 Curricular Linkage	4	3	2	1	0
27. Lessons and exercises are in line with grade-wise curriculum objectives.					
28. Contents are organized in proper sequence (horizontal linkage of contents among the lessons.)					
29. Contents are organized in terms of vertical linkage (grade 1 to 3).					
30. Contents are adequate as per the age level of the children according to the curriculum (scope of the contents)					

	4	3	2	1	0
31. Contents are organized in proper order of ease and difficulty (simple to complex)					
32. Contents presented in the textbook could be taught using locally available materials.					
33. Material provides varieties of exercises and activities focusing on all the components of reading.					
34. Exercises are properly ordered in terms of ease and difficulty (related to language skills).					
35. Exercises are balanced to the objectives of reading skills in the curriculum.					

Suggestions for improving curricular linkage:

B.2 Level Appropriateness

B.2.1 Language

B.2.1.1 Phonemic and Grapho-phonemic Awareness	4	3	2	1	0
36. Script used represents the phonemes of the language.					
37. Contains exercises on recognition of sound by the learner.					
38. Sequencing of sounds in words proceeds from simpler to more difficult sounds (such as simple sounds; conjuncts and words containing diacritics).					
39. Words with similar sounds creating rhyme are given in the exercises/activities.					
40. Reading materials include exercises on children's chanting with special attention to rhyming words or words with the same sound.					
41. Reading materials contain unfamiliar words which students are asked to segment into separate sounds.					
42. Exercises ask students to replace a letter in a word by another letter and identify the new word.					
43. Lessons are graded from letter recognition, single word reading, and sentence reading to text reading.					
B.2.1.2 Fluency	4	3	2	1	0
44. Students are given sufficient opportunities to practice reading connected texts to achieve greater fluency and comprehension.					
45. The texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words					
46. Emphasis is given on forming simple sentences to address fluency of students					
B.2.1.3 Vocabulary	4	3	2	1	0
47. Reading materials introduce new vocabulary with explanation before reading a text.					

	4	3	2	1	0
48. After completing the reading of the text certain words are discussed in the exercises.					
49. Words given in the text are ordered in terms of monosyllabic to multisyllabic.					
50. There are exercises in which the teacher speaks out a word and students are asked to write it.					
51. Students are given opportunity to use the familiar words in sentences.					
52. Words used in the text are sequenced from concrete to abstract.					
53. Number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline					
B.2.1.4 Comprehension	**4**	**3**	**2**	**1**	**0**
54. Students are asked to read out a lesson and are asked questions about that.					
55. Understanding of lesson promoting exercises are included in the material.					
56. Order of sentences is simple to complex.					
57. Passage contains a pre-reading activity such as giving the title or illustration and asking the students to guess its subject matter.					
58. Reading materials contain discussion exercises after singing a song or reciting a poem given in the text.					
59. Guidance given for exercises are appropriate to the level of students.					
60. There is variety in exercises					
61. Other language skills are also integrated into the exercises of comprehension					
Suggestions for improving level of language:					
B.2.2 Content	**4**	**3**	**2**	**1**	**0**
62. Text lengths are appropriate as per grade level.					
63. Reading material is accurate in terms of spelling according to the house style of CDC.					
64. Punctuation marks are used correctly.					
65. Difficulty level of the contents is appropriate to the level.					
66. Activity oriented contents are selected.					
67. Ratio of pictures to the text is adequate.					
68. Pictures are related to the content.					
69. Pictures are placed in appropriate place.					

	4	3	2	1	0
70. Shape and size of the pictures is appropriate to the grade/age level.					
71. Pictures used are multi-colored and well-illustrated.					

Suggestions for improving level of content:

B.2.3 Reading Levels of Children	4	3	2	1	0
72. Reading materials contain instructions for the students for reading a passage aloud.					
73. Material provides sufficient opportunities for reading to the children.					
74. Reading texts are effectively organized in improving reading abilities of the children.					
75. There is a provision of loud reading.					
76. Material can be used by the student unaided (e.g. during his/her illness and consequent absence from classes)					

Suggestions for reading level of children:

B.3 Physical Quality of the Material					

Quality of Size, binding, font size etc.	4	3	2	1	0
77. Size and shape of the book is students' friendly.					
78. Book binding is appropriate to hold and read.					
79. The textbooks is durable.					
80. The size of the book is appropriate to the level.					
81. Font size is appropriate to the level.					

Suggestions for improving physical quality of the material:

Annex – 2: Framework for Review of Supplementary Books

NEPAL EARLY GRADE READING MATERIALS ASSESSMENT **Research Management Cell** # Kathmandu Shiksha Campus **Ramshah Path, Kathmandu**

C. METADATA

1. Name of the Resource Person: ....
     1.1 Designation ....   1.2 Address ....
     1.2 Mobile no. ....

2. Types of materials reviewed	**3. Author**(s):
2.1 Textbook ☐	i. ……………………..
2.2 Curriculum ☐	j. ……………………..
2.3 Supplementary reading material/reader ☐	k. ……………………..
2.4 Teaching materials ☐	l. ……………………..
2.5 Teacher's guide ☐	m. ....
2.6 Flashcard ☐	n. ....
2.7 Picture/ story card ☐	o. ....
2.8 Others learning materials ☐	p. ....

4. Publisher
   m. CDC ☐
   n. Private publisher ☐
   o. Donors ☐
   p. NGO/INGO ☐
	5. Title of the book:
	.................................……………………………
	6. Grade: ………………………………
	
	7. Language (medium) …………………….

8. Year of publication:.........................	**9.** Publisher's name: ……………………
10. Place of publication:........................	
11. Coordinator…………………………	**12.** CDC personnel involved:.........................

13. Individual (s) involved in assessment
   a…………………………………   b...
   c………………………………… d..	

14. Book profile	
q. Total pages:.................................	
r. Font size	
s. Size of the book (Length x breadth in cm)	
t. Price of the book: a. listed...............	b. Not listed..............
u. Cover page: a. Black and white	b. Multicolour....................
v. Inside pages: a. Black and white	b. Multicolour....................
w. Total no of lessons in the book:	
x. Paper quality a. type	b. gram ....

15. Lesson wise characteristics:

a. Lesson No.	b. No. of average words	c. No. of test items / exercise	d. No. of pictures	e. No. of characters	f. No. of events	g. No. of language editing errors	h. Maximum no. of words in a sentence
1							
2							
3							
4							
5							
6							
7							
8							
9							
10							
11							
12							
13							
14							
15							
16							
17							
18							
19							
20							
21							
22							
23							
24							
25							
26							
27							
28							
29							
30							
31							
32							
33							
34							
35							

D. DIMENSIONS OF EARLY GRADE SUPPLEMENTARY READERS ASSESSMENT

For each competency area, the material will be given a rating from 0 to 4.

0 = not included this area at all
1 = only lightly touched
2 = included but not balanced in all of the text, lessons, exercises, activities and illustrations
3 = appeared across most of the text but remained with a few gaps.
4 = thoroughly included and sequenced in a logical order.

B.1 Content Appropriateness					
B.1.1 Cultural Appropriateness	4	3	2	1	0
1. Cultural contents are integrated in the texts, figures and exercises.					
2. Pictures and figures are found culturally acceptable.					
3. Succeeds in avoiding linguistic biases.					
4. Succeeds in avoiding cultural/religious stereotypes and biases.					
5. Succeeds in avoiding caste/ethnic stereotypes and biases.					
Suggestions for maintaining cultural appropriateness:					
B.1.2 Social Inclusion	4	3	2	1	0
6. Material is inclusive of disadvantaged groups.					
7. Material is inclusive of people with disability.					
8. Material helps in developing skills, behaviors, attitudes and understandings that enable students to construct equal and respectful relationship across different social backgrounds.					
Suggestions for promoting social inclusion:					
B.1.3 Gender Balance	4	3	2	1	0
9. Material treats both male and female equitably.					
10. Material maintains balance between male and female.					
11. Contents are not gender blind.					
12. Contents are not gender neutral.					

	4	3	2	1	0
13. Material is designed to deconstruct the biased gender roles, images and responsibilities.					

Suggestions for improving gender balance:

B.1.4 Human Rights and Child Rights	4	3	2	1	0
14. Material instructs children to respect others' rights.					
15. Material promotes children's innate behaviors (communication, construction, inquiry, artistic expressions).					

Suggestions for encouraging human and child rights:

B.1.5 Curricular Linkage	4	3	2	1	0
16. Contents are appropriate as per the age level of the children (grade 1 to 3) according to the curriculum (scope of the contents).					
17. Contents are organized in proper order of ease and difficulty (simple to complex)					
18. Material is appropriate to develop reading habit					

Suggestions for improving curricular linkage:

B.2 Level Appropriateness					

B.2.1 Language					
B.2.1.1 Phonemic and Grapho-phonemic Awareness	4	3	2	1	0
19. Material is presented in simpler sentences					
B.2.1.2 Fluency	4	3	2	1	0
20. Material is appropriate to achieve greater fluency.					
21. The texts include familiar words mostly and a few unfamiliar words					
B.2.1.3 Vocabulary	4	3	2	1	0
22. Words given in the material are ordered in terms of monosyllabic to multisyllabic.					
23. Words used in the material are sequenced from concrete to abstract.					
24. Number of words in a sentence is appropriate to the grade a per CDC guideline					
B.2.1.4 Comprehension	4	3	2	1	0
25. Material is appropriate to increase reading comprehension					

Suggestions for improving level of language:					

B.2.2 Content	**4**	**3**	**2**	**1**	**0**
26. Text lengths are appropriate as per grade level.					
27. Reading material is accurate in terms of spelling according to the house style of CDC.					
28. Punctuation marks are used correctly.					
29. Difficulty level of the contents is appropriate to the level (grades 1 to 3).					
30. Ratio of pictures to the text is adequate.					
31. Pictures are related to the content.					
32. Pictures are placed in appropriate place.					
33. Shape and size of the pictures is appropriate to the grade (1-3) and age level.					
Suggestions for improving level of content:					

B.2.3 Reading Levels of Children	**4**	**3**	**2**	**1**	**0**
34. Reading material is appropriate to promote reading ability as per level (grades 1-3)					
Suggestions for reading level of children:					

B.3 Physical Quality of the Material					
Quality of Size, binding, font size etc.	**4**	**3**	**2**	**1**	**0**
35. Size and shape of the book is students' friendly.					
36. The size of the book is appropriate to the level (grade 1-3).					
Suggestions for improving physical quality of the material:					

Annex – 3: Framework for Review of Instructional Materials

S.N.	Criteria	Assessment/comments
1	**Types of material**	
2	**Content covered**	
3	**Objectives/educational implications**	
4	**No of words in a sentence**	
5	**Spelling**	
7	**Comment on picture**	
8	**Size of the word (single, complex-Sagle, Matra, Adha aksher)**	
9	**Dimensions …**	
9.1	**Level appropriateness**	
	Content Appropriateness	
	Cultural Appropriateness	
	Social Inclusion	
	Gender Balance	
	Human Rights and Child Rights	
	Curricular Linkage	
9.2	**Level Appropriateness**	
	Language	
	Phonemic and Grapho-phonemic Awareness	
	Fluency	
	Comprehension	
	Content	
	Reading Levels of Children	
9.3	**Physical Quality of the Material**	
	Size, binding, font size etc.	
10	**Remarks (Comments/suggestions)**	